

THE POLICIES AND PRACTICES OF GOOD GOVERNANCE IN INDONESIAN TOURISM: A CASE STUDY IN MALANG, EAST JAVA

Ika Nurhayani¹, Sri Endah Tabiati³, Aris Siswanti³, Hamamah⁴

^{1,2,3,4}University of Brawijaya

Email: ¹inurhayani@ub.ac.id, ²tabiati@ub.ac.id, ³arissiswanti@ub.ac.id, ⁴hamamah@ub.ac.id

Abstract

Good governance is a method to organize resources by involving the local community to participate and to supervise the development of the country. Good governance in tourism ensures that the industry can involve and benefit the local community. This paper aims to investigate the policies and practice of good governance in Indonesian tourism using the city of Malang in East Java as a case study. This is done by: (1) a study on the Regulation of the Major of Malang on the Master Plan of the Development of Regional Tourism no. 34 year 2014 and (2) field observations in the city of Malang. The research shows that the regulation has fulfilled six characteristics of good governance: participation, consensus oriented, equity and inclusiveness, effectiveness and efficiency, and accountability but fails to fulfill the three criteria of good governance: the rule of law, the transparency and the responsiveness. On the other hand, on the practices of the good governance, the city government lacks communication with the stakeholders and it is advisable that the city government set this forum in the near future to discuss the solutions to better tourism in Malang.

Keywords: Good governance, tourism, Indonesia, Malang

1. INTRODUCTION

Good governance is defined as a method to organize economic and social resources by involving both government and the local community through private sectors (Stoker as cited in Suwondo, 2000). The method was introduced by the World Bank in the early 90s to tackle extreme poverty in some African countries caused by the lack of good governance and corrupt bureaucracies (Pohan, 2000). Poor governance disrupts access to public services for the poor and disadvantaged members of the society (Shah, 2006). With good governance, people can participate in their country's development and supervise whether the development has met the characteristics of good governance. The characteristics are described in Table 1.

Table 1. The characteristics of good governance

	Characteristics of good governance	Description
1.	Participation	direct participation of the community or through legitimate intermediate institutions or representatives

2.	Rule of law	the impartial enforcement of legal frameworks and full protection of human rights
3.	Transparency	rules and regulations should base decisions and their enforcement, freely and accessible information for stakeholders.
4.	Responsiveness	punctuality of service to stakeholders
5.	Consensus oriented	mediation of the different interests in society to reach a broad consensus in society on what is in the best interest of the whole community and how this can be achieved
6.	Equity and inclusiveness	ensuring that all its members feel that they have a stake in it and do not feel excluded from the mainstream of society

7.	Effectiveness and efficiency	processes and institutions produce results that meet the needs of society, the sustainable use of natural resources and the protection of the environment.
8.	Accountability	Governmental institutions, private sector and civil society organizations must be accountable to the public and to their institutional stakeholders.

Adapted from:

(<http://www.unescap.org/sites/default/files/good-governance.pdf>)

In Indonesia, the concept of good governance was first introduced after the monetary crisis in 1997. The crisis forced Indonesians to survive by applying good governance through innovative policies (Mardiasmo, 2008). One of them was the decentralization policy which introduced regional autonomy in 1999 (Mardiasmo, 2008, Utomo, 2011). The autonomy distributed political authorities and financial resources among the country's three levels of government (Shah, 2006).

With the rise of the tourism industry in Indonesia, attempts have been made to apply good governance in the industry. This is not surprising since tourism has become one of the fastest growing industries in Indonesia. In 2014, the contribution of tourism to Indonesian economy had reached 17% of the total revenue of the country. The industry employed 10, 18 million workers or 8, 9% of the total employment in the country (Press Release of the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy, 2014).

To apply good governance in tourism, the government has issued the Decree No. 10 of 2009 which states that Indonesian tourism should be based on sustainability (Official Speech of the Minister of Tourism of Republic Indonesia for the World Tourism Day and the National Tourism Day, 2015). This indicates that the tourism industry should benefit not only the industry and the traveler but also the local communities, in line with the UNESCO's

definition of sustainable tourism "tourism that respects both local people and the traveler, cultural heritage and the environment" (The UNESCO, 2016).

Inspired by the decrees, regional governments set their own regulations to uphold good governance in the tourism industry in the region.

Not much has been done to investigate the policies of good governance in Indonesian tourism. Previous researches focus on the practice of good governance in Indonesia in general. Mardiasmo (2008) compares the practice of good governance in several regions in Indonesia. Utomo (2011) discusses factors which contribute to the failure of building good governance through decentralization.

The research aims to describe the policies of good governance in Indonesian tourism by using the city of Malang in East Java as a case study. Malang is chosen because the city is rapidly developing to be one of the top tourism destinations in Indonesia. The region of Malang has been included as one of the national tourism destinations by the government (Annexe II The Regulations of the Republic of Indonesia Year 2011 No.50 on the Master Plan for the Development of National Tourism of 2010-2025). Malang has 78 tourist attractions which include shopping, Dutch architecture, museums, ancient temples, recreational parks and monuments (Mirajanatin et al, 2013).

2. METHODS

The research used a qualitative descriptive approach. The approach was used because it can describe existing phenomena inductively (Patton, 2005) and can identify phenomena invisible to the researchers (Woods, 2006). The data was collected through document review and observation. The document review was done on the regulation of the Mayor of Malang no. 34 year 2014 on the Master Plan of the Development of Regional Tourism. The articles in the regulations were reviewed and classified based on the characteristics of good governance that they possessed. The observation was done on the practices of good governance on tourism performed by the city government of Malang during February to August 2016 in the city of Malang.

Consecutively, the analysis involved interpreting and classifying the patterns found in

the regulation of the Major of Malang no. 34 year 2014 on the Master Plan of Regional Tourism and the observation on the practices of good governance on tourism done by the city government of Malang. Based on the classification of the patterns found in the data, the researchers then made a generalization on the result of study.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The policies of good governance in Malang can be observed in the regulation of the major of Malang on the Master Plan of the Development of Regional Tourism no. 34 year 2014. The regulation consists of 10 chapters and 40 articles. The articles that contain the policies of good governance are described in Table 2.

Table 2. Policies and the characteristic of good governance

	Characteristics of good governance	Policies
1.	Participation	<p>Article 1 clause 7 Tourism is supported by travelers, local communities, the central government, the local government and the entrepreneurs.</p> <p>Article 1 Clause 19 Tourism activities can empower the community by providing access to improve their well-being independently.</p> <p>Article 1 Clause 27 The tourism industry is potential to develop creative economy which can improve the prosperity of the Indonesians.</p>
2.	Rule of law	----
3.	Transparency	----
4.	Responsiveness	----

5.	Consensus oriented	<p>Article 3 clause 4 f. To develop a competitive and credible tourism industry which can motivate partnership between elements of the society. g. To develop the institutional organization which consists of the government, private sector and the public.</p> <p>Article 29 The tourism industry applies a synergistic and sustainable marketing partnership between stakeholders.</p> <p>Article 34 The partnership in tourism industry between the local government, the private sectors and the local community should be optimized through: a. The joint effort of the ABG (academician, businessman and government) in tourism industry, with the concepts of the academician applied by the government and the private sectors to create economic benefits for the local community.</p>
6.	Equity and inclusiveness	<p>Article 1 Clause 10 Tourism regions or tourism destinations are sites which host tourism attractions, public facilities, and accessibility for tourists and the local communities.</p> <p>Article 5, no. 1 The local government, the private sectors and the local communities</p>

		<p>work hand in hand to develop responsible tourism activities.</p> <p>Article 24 The tourism industry is developed to empower the community through:</p> <p>a. Improvement of the community's ability to participate in the development of tourism.</p> <p>b. The raising number of creative economic activities related to tourism.</p> <p>c. The increasing awareness of the community to participate in developing tourism.</p>
7.	Effectiveness and efficiency	<p>Article 3, clause 7 h To develop effective and efficient human resources and operational procedures which can create sustainable tourism.</p>
8.	Accountability	<p>Article 38 Department of Culture and Tourism monitors the implementation of the master plan of the development of Malang tourism through:</p> <p>a. coordination across sectors and stakeholders</p> <p>b. data collection and inventory of potential and problems related to tourism destinations, marketing, industry, institutional and human resources.</p>

It can be observed from the analysis that the Regulation of the Mayor of Malang on the Master Plan of the Development of Regional Tourism

no. 34 year 2014 has fulfilled six characteristics of good governance: participation, consensus oriented, equity and inclusiveness, effectiveness and efficiency, and accountability. However, the regulation fails to fulfill the three criteria of good governance: the rule of law, the transparency and the responsiveness.

The city government of Malang under the division of tourism and culture has attempted to apply the principles of good governance on the practices and the characteristics of good governance. The results are in Table 3.

Table 3. Practices and the Characteristics of Good Governance

	Characteristics of good governance	Practices
1.	Participation	<p>The local community mostly participates in the events organized by the city government such as the Flower Festival, the election of the ambassadors of tourism, the food festival and the shadow puppet show.</p> <p>Some of the members of the community have taken initiatives to directly participate in the development of tourism in Malang. However, they often do them without any coordination with the city government. As an example, a prominent entrepreneur in the city funded a program to clean the historical buildings in the city.</p> <p>Moreover, many entrepreneurs working in the tourism industry in Malang promote their businesses themselves without any coordination with the city government. They set up their own websites or their own information center. The city tourism</p>

		department website only displays culinary businesses in the city and it does not cover other types of businesses such as crafts or travel agents.
2.	Rule of law	The website of the division of culture and tourism of the city government displays the regulation of the major of Malang on the Master Plan of the Development of Regional Tourism no. 34 year 2014 on which the tourism programs should be based. It also displays the regulations on the taxes on tourism industry.
3.	Transparency	The website of the division of culture and tourism of the city government displays their programs and the events they coordinated. However, the website does not inform the success or the failure of previous programs held by the government. Therefore, the public could not monitor the success of the programs.
4.	Responsiveness	The division of culture and tourism of the city government has a twitter account which is mostly used to announce tourism or cultural events in the city. The public rarely responds or posts their suggestions or complaints. The division's website has a feature with which visitors can leave an instant message but the feature is often offline and the

		public cannot chat with the officer in charge to submit suggestions or complaints.
5.	Consensus oriented	As for now, there is no forum discussion group in which the government and the stakeholders (the tourism industry, the tourists, the community, the academics/ educators) can meet and discuss on the programs and the activities of tourism in the city of Malang.
6.	Equity and inclusiveness	The city government includes the community in the programs and activities such as festivals and other cultural events. The universities can also participate by sending students to do an internship in the department of culture and tourism.
7.	Effectiveness and efficiency	The city lacks facilities for tourists, such as sidewalks and crossing gates for tourists to walk safely. It also lacks tourism centers in strategic places and officers who can speak good English and other major foreign languages. Clean public toilets are not easy to find either. The website of the division of culture and tourism does not contain complete information on how to get to the tourism sites. It also does not provide an English version website which contains information, directions or tourism packages tailored for their need.

		Tourists are often forced to join tours which are not suited to their interests. Many historical buildings are not kept properly and adorned with graffiti. Some have been renovated into modern buildings and lost their historic architecture.
8.	Accountability	The city government through the culture and tourism division has a website which informs the tourism programs and activities done by the government. However, there is no system for the public to monitor the results of the programs.

It can be observed from the analysis that the city government needs to improve their practices of good governance on tourism in the city of Malang. First, the government needs to better communicate with the stakeholders of Malang tourism which include the tourism industry, the tourists, the community, and the academics/educators. This can be done through forum group discussion. This forum can meet regularly to discuss sustainable tourism programs which can benefit the stakeholders of Malang tourism. The forum group discussion can also discuss how to solve the lack of facilities for tourists. The government can also encourage more participation from the member of the public through this forum group discussion.

Second, the city government should provide more reports on the success and the failure of the previous programs and activities on their websites. They should also provide an operator who can actively respond or chat with the members of the public. Moreover, it is imperative for the city government to set up an English website to cater to the needs of foreign tourists traveling to Malang.

4. CONCLUSION

In sum, the city government has enacted a regulation on tourism with the Regulation of the Mayor of Malang on the Master Plan of the

Development of Regional Tourism no. 34 year 2014. The regulation has fulfilled six characteristics of good governance, namely participation, consensus oriented, equity and inclusiveness, effectiveness and efficiency, and accountability but fails to fulfill the three criteria of good governance: the rule of law, the transparency and the responsiveness.

On the other hand, the city government has strived to apply the principles of good governance on their activities and programs. However, they lack of communication with the stakeholders in the form of forum group discussion. It is advisable that the city government set this forum in the near future to discuss the solutions to better tourism in Malang.

5. REFERENCES

- Fien, J, Margaret, C, Clayton, W. n.d. *Sustainable Tourism*. The Unesco. Retrieved from http://www.unesco.org/education/tlsf/mods/theme_c/mod16.html. [May 20, 2016].
- Mardiasmo, D., P. Barnes, & Y.Sakurai. 2008. "Implementation of Good Governance by Regional Governments in Indonesia" in K. Brown, M. Mandell, S. Beach (eds). Proceedings Contemporary Issues in Public Management: the Twelfth Annual Conference on International Research Society for Public Management (IRSPM XII). pp. 1-3. Brisbane, Australia.
- Mirajanatin, H. Fauzul S., Nindya S. 2013. *Kajian Potensi Pariwisata Perkotaan Di Kota Malang Berdasarkan Stakeholder*. In *Jurnal Tata Kota dan Daerah*. Vol 5 (1), pp 47-54. Retrieved from: <http://tatakota.ub.ac.id/index.php/tatakota/article/view/157> [May 20, 2016].
- Pohan, M.H. *Mewujudkan Tata Pemerintahan Lokal yang Baik (Local Good Governance) dalam Era Otonomi Daerah 1*, 1.11. 2000.
- Shah, A. 2006. *Local Governance in Developing Countries*. Washington, DC: The World Bank. Retrieved from: (<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/PSGLP/Resources/LocalGovernanceinDeveloping.pdf>). [May 20, 2016].
- Suwondo, K. 2002. "Decentralization in Indonesia", *INFID Annual Lobby 2002*.

(Press Release of the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy, March 18, 2014).

The Minister of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia. “*Official Speech of the Minister of Tourism of Republic Indonesia for the World Tourism Day and the National Tourism Day*”, 28 September 2015/ Retrieved from <http://www.kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?c=125&id=2975>. [May 20, 2016].

The City Government of Malang. 2014. “*The Regulation of the Major of Malang no. 34 year 2014 on the Master Plan of the Development of Regional Tourism*”. Malang. Retrieved from <http://budpar.malangkota.go.id/regulasi/>. [March 10, 2016].

The Minister of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia. “*Annexe II: The Regulations of the Republic of Indonesia Year 2011 No.50 on the Master Plan of the Development of National Tourism of 2010-2025*”. Jakarta.

Utomo, T.W. 2011. *Building Good Governance through Decentralization in Indonesia (Recognizing Some Inhibiting Factors in the Implementation Stage)*. In Kimura et al (eds). *Limits of Good Governance in Developing Countries*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University. 245-273. Retrieved from http://www2.gsid.nagoya-u.ac.jp/blog/anda/files/2012/01/7_tri-widodo-wahyu1.pdf [March 10, 2016].

Patton, M. 2005. *Qualitative research & evaluation methods*. Thousand Oaks, Calif : Sage Publications.

The Unescap. (n.d.). *What is good governance?* Retrieved from <http://www.unescap.org/sites/default/files/good-governance.pdf>. [May 10, 2016].

Woods, P. 2006. *Successful Writing for Qualitative Researchers*. New York: Routledge.