

MOSLEM WOMEN’S RESISTANCE AGAINST SECULARIST’S DOMINATION IN ORHAN PAMUK’S SNOW NOVEL

Siti Kholisah¹, Miftahul Huda², Lusi Setyorini³
Universitas Islam darul ‘Ulum lamongan

Abstract. Headscarves controversy still overshadows the life of modern Turkey. In Orhan Pamuk’s Snow, to modernize the state, the secularist elites implement secularism by unveiling women. Implementation is through banning the headscarves wearing in public buildings, including school, that its executions dominate Moslem women. In reverse, Moslem women, who are represented by the characters named Kadife, Hande, and Teslime, resist the domination to defend their rights upon wearing the headscarves for the sake of practicing their religion, Islam. Grounded upon the findings, this study questions upon (1) how is secularist’s domination upon Moslem women depicted in Orhan Pamuk’s Snow? and (2) how do Moslem women show their resistance against secularist’s domination in Orhan Pamuk’s Snow? The researcher used qualitative research, especially mimetic approach with descriptive analysis method is applied in this study. Data collecting used mimetic approach research, researcher used four step to analyze (1) Classifying the data dealt with the object of the study, (2) Interpreting and making correlation between the data and the statement of problems, (3) Answering the questions stated in the statement of problems by considering the result of the data analysis, (4) Drawing the conclusion based on the result of the data analysis. The result of this study shows that the secularist’s domination manifests itself into five forms: domination through policy-making, threat, onstage play, derogation, and hegemony. Meanwhile, Moslem women’s resistance manifests itself into two major forms: outward resistance (public transcript), which is practiced through demonstration and insult, and inward resistance (hidden transcript), which is practiced through suicide and vis-à-vis dialogue. The researcher suggested to the reader to make knowledge and lesson from this study especially about secularist domination in modern turkey.

Keywords: domination, secularism, headscarves controversy.

INTRODUCTION

Literature is a kind of art, usually in written form (Kennedy, 1983: 5). Furthermore, Meyer (1990: 3) states, literature is fiction consisting of carefully arranged word designed to stir the imagination. It can be concluded that literature is human’s expression and imagination that is described through language and it provides the readers with a symbolic written form of word which is designed to manipulate their imagination.

Reading literary work gives many advantages to its readers. According to Mayer (1990: 4), reading literary work offers pleasure, entertainment, and usually conveys a perspective, mood feeling, or experience to its reader. Besides, it allow us to move beyond the boundaries of our own customary lives and culture because it introduces us to new things, people different from ourselves, places which remotes from our neighborhoods, and times other than ours. In short, reading literary work not only merely gives the readers such a pleasure, but also experience, feeling, culture and gives a new perspective about live. Sumardjo (1998: 29) says that “novel is a story with the prose form in long shape, this long shape means the story including the complex plot, many character and various setting”.

A novel is a totality, a comprehensiveness that is artistic. As a totality, the novel has passages elements, most related to one another in close and mutually dependent. The elements of a novel-builder who then collectively form a totality that-in addition to the formal elements of language, there are many more kinds. The division of the element in question is the intrinsic and extrinsic elements. Moral derives from the latin ‘mos’ which means attitude and habits. This attitude based on the determination of right and wrong. Values means standard that used to define something and regarded as conventional. In other word, moral values is standard of attitude that based on the determination of right and wrong which regarded by those who make the standart of moral. Novel is prose story telling with a great amount of detail on every page, and usually reveals human values (John Peck and Martin

Coyle 1986 : 102). It means in every novel has different meaning and message from the author. And the novel that the researcher want to analyze is *Moslem Women's Resistance Againsts Secularist's Domination in Orhanpamuk's Snow*.

This novel is a story of Headscarves controversy still overshadows the life of modern Turkey. In Orhan Pamuk's *Snow*, to modernize the state, the secularist elites implement secularism by unveiling women. It is exercised through banning the headscarves wearing in public buildings, including school, that its executions dominate Moslem women. In reverse, Moslem women, who are represented by the characters named Kadife, Hande, and Teslime, resist the domination to defend their rights upon wearing the headscarves for the sake of practicing their religion, Islam.

The concepts of domination and resistance are based on the thought of James C. Scott and Daniel Miller. Those concepts are applied together with Antonio Gramsci's hegemony and veiled feminism, CihanAktas' white women's movement. To analyze the data, mimetic approach with descriptive analysis method is applied in this study. Lastly, the result of this study shows that the secularist's domination manifests itself into five forms: domination through policy-making, threat, onstage play, derogation, and hegemony. Meanwhile, Moslem women's resistance manifests itself into two major forms: outward resistance (public transcript), which is practiced through demonstration and insult, and inward resistance (hidden transcript), which is practiced through suicide and vis-à-vis dialogue. This study aims to describe 1) secularist's domination upon Moslem women depicted in Orhan Pamuk's *Snow* and 2) Moslem's women resistance against secularist's domination in Orhan Pamuk's *Snow*. To facilitate and specify the detail of this study, hence the researcher gives a scope and limitation. The scope of this research is the theory of literature, especially in novel. The limitation of the research is focused in moslem womens' resistance and secularist's domination.

LITERATURE REVIEW

In selection from prision notebook (1971), Antonio Gramsci, a neo Marxism then, explains the case of supremacy in a social group or class. He develop a concept relates, to it know as hegemony. However, Gramsci's Hegemony contains two important concept, domination and hegemony. "...the supremacy of a social group manifest itself in two ways, as "domination" and as "intellectual and moral leadership." A social group dominates antagonistic groups, which it tends to "liquidate", or to subjugate perhaps even by armed force; it leads kindred and allied groups. A social group can, and indeed must, already exercise "leadership" before winning governmental power (this indeed is one of the principal conditions for the winning of such power); it subsequently becomes dominant when it exercise power, but even if it holds it firmly in its graps, it must continue to "lead" as well (Gramsci, 1971: 57 -58).

DOMINATION

In all societies, as Mosca explains, hom societies that are less developed up to the societies that are the most advance and powerfull one, there olien appeartwo classes of people, "a class that rules and a class that ruled." Furthermore, Mosca explains that the first class, a class that rules, always has less numerous than the second Toy a class that is ruled. However, the first class greatly "performs all of political functions, monopolizes power. The above quotation shows that the supremacy can be achieved through two different ways, "domination" or "coercion" and "direction" or "intellectual and moral leadership" in which such leadership is know later as hegemony. Eventhough domination and hegemony are different, they, indeed, relate each other. Furthermore, the relationship can be identified in three important points. First, domination is exercise towards the antagonist group while leadership or hegemony is

exercise towards the allied group. Second, hegemony is precondition before gaining the governmental or state power so, therefore, it must be done beforehand. Third, when the power is held, domination is absolutely be exercise thoroughly. Additionally, hegemony must be included as well. In short, domination and hegemony are practiced under the exercise of power.

The implementation of domination somehow is possible by means of “sufficient coercive force” or “the coercive machinery of the state” so that the acquiescence of “domination population” or “civil society” can absolutely be achieved (Miller, 2005: 63; Femia, 1981: 24). Therefore, to fully control and master, the system of domination always produces kinds of “insults and injury to human dignity,” such as “the appropriation of labor, public humiliations, whippings, rapes, slaps, leers, contempt, ritual denigration, and so on” (Scott, 1990: 37)

HEGEMONY

Hegemony is a well-known concept introduced and developed by an Italian Communist politician, Antonio Gramsci. Such as a concept is explained, though implicitly, in his writing *The Prison Notebook*. This book is written when he was in the prison between 1929 and 1935, due to his political affair against Mussolini regime. As previously mentioned, Gramsci does not even define the term he introduces, hegemony, explicitly. Therefore, there are many interpretation of his term (Brown, 2009: 1)

Hegemony derives from the Greek, which mean guide, ruler, or leader and *hegemonia*, which mean rule or leadership. In ancient Greece, there are two meanings related to the term “hegemon”. First, hegemon means “leader or military alliance of the various city-states freely and voluntarily entered into.” Second, it means a polis, the leader of alliance, which join together with other poleis freely to military threat Hence, hegemony nearly is seen as a system of interstate where the power and leadership are exercised by a certain state through an alliance of consenting states. Generally, hegemony means “the preeminence of imperialism that a state, social group, or even an individual may exercise over\ ucrs. In recent fundamental definition, hegemony refers to condition in which the power owned by the ruling class is exercised to convince, ‘ther classes towards the claim that the ruling class’ interests reflect the interests.

RESISTANCE

Every single effect, whether good or bad, happens due to the case that there is a cause. As said in the proverb, “there is no smoke without fire,” in indicates that those two premises-smoke and fire-are in close relationship. Hence, one cannot be separated from another. This general phenomenon is well applied in the case of resistance and domination. Resistance can be seen as the smoke, the effect, caused by fire. Meanwhile, domination is seen as the fire, the cause, which results smoke. Therefore, resistance happens because of domination. In other words, the problem of resistance always attaches to the problem of domination. (Scott, 1990: 45)

Touching upon a form of domination, Miller describes two common strategies taken to resist the legitimacy, outwards and inwards resistance. Resistance, which facing outwards, involves mass participation. It is based on an appeal to the original text. The mass strive to clean themselves from the manipulation of domination, which force them to support the dominant regime. On other hand, the inwards facing of resistance involves personal salvation. (Miller, 2005: 72)

Scott, similarly, states that there are two forms of subordinate discourse of resistance, openly and closely. He then, calls he open resistance as public transcript while the close, “offstage”, resistance as hidden transcript. A public transcript is practiced by the subordinate

in the presence of the dominant-the sense type Power holders-the open exercise of power. It includes speeches, gestures, and expression. Meanwhile, a hidden transcript is practiced beyond the direct presence of the dominant. The hidden transcript appears due to the case that public expression will somehow be counted dangerous and risky; hence, it is exercise safely offstage. However, hidden transcript includes speeches, gestures, and practices. (Scott, 1990: 2-27)

DISCUSSION

Secularist's Domination Upon Moslem Women

The justification upon the existence of domination practice emerges because the data reveal and support the very concept, which has been described in the previous chapter. The exercise of domination upon moslem women can be identified through the characters. Especially the secularist elites, who hold or possess power in the society. Hence, it can be the secular state itself itself and even its apparatus. What an how they treat the society, especially moslem women can lead the identification of the domination done by them.

Furthermore , the practice of secularist's domination upon moslem women is also due to some reasons. Which are claimed to be the ground of their work. Mainly, it refers to the secular state's project to modernize itself. Accordingly, grounded upon some reasons, the secularist elites exercise the power they possess to meet the state's project. Therefore, this part is divided into two, reason and characters practicing the domination and manifestations of secularist's domination itself.

Reason and Characters Practicing the Domination.

The practice of domination upon moslem women by secularist elites in Kars, where the story takes place, is firstly due to "*the Republic's westernizing project*" (Pamuk,2005: 20). This "westernizing project" is the primary project of the republic in which it aims to modernize and bring the state of Turkey into the same level with those of European countries. Therefore, each life aspect of Turks must be based upon the West. According to the Republic, one of the most important things to westernize the in practicing the ideology of secularism as what the West has done.

The implementation of the republic's project, to lift the statye and surely to get the West's recognition, involves many secularist government and elites. They then see that the idea is important to be practiced by the whole society in the state. In other woerd, it refers to the term of homogeonus society, which is part of the Republic's westerization project. Consequently, the secularist elites regulate every single, even small, part of Turks' lives, including their dressing, which is mainly adressed towards headscarves Moslem women. The main reason upon regulating women's dressing in public sphare is based on a thought that

"A convered women would have been someone who had come in from the suburbs_from the Kartal vineyard, say_to sell grapes. Or she might be the milkman's wife or someone else the lower classes" (Pamuk,2005:22).

In the case, "a convered women" refers to Moslem women who wears headscraf. These secularist elites, even the West, often call the headscarves Moslem women as the "covered". It is due to fact that the headscarves women cover their bodies entirely, including hair. In consequent, the secularist elites see that women wearing headscarves are a blockage for them to modernize the country. Thereof, they solve the problem by controlling the wearing of headscarves in which it violates Moslem women's right to practice the religion. Besides, this action of controlling is somehow accompanied by coercive intimidating and repressing. This action, done by the secularist elites to modernize the state, refers to such kind of domination.

On the other hand, in the beginning of the story, Ka, secularist elite, does not show an intention to practice such power over Moslem women. Unfortunately, since he is a secularist, what he thinks and dreams of indeed support the idea of secularism, due to modernize the nation. Furthermore, for the sake of love toward Ipek, Ka is trapped into SunayZaim and other secularist elites' play upon exercising power, which is persuading Kadife to take a role in SunayZaim's performance as a heroin who takes off her headscarf. It refers to his tatement, "*That is just a play, Kadife. And because it's just a play, it shouldn't be a problem to take off your scraf*", (Pamuk,2005: 312). Nonetheless, those secularist elites reciprocally have tight relationship, even with the state, upon exercising power to uphold the idea of secularism to modernize the state. Through the concept of domination upon Moslem women in OrhanPamuk's Snow is identified manifesting itself into four form, domination through policy- making, coercion, derogation and hegemony.

Manifesting of Secularist's Domination

Domination over Policy-Making

The preceding explanation has presented the reason and characters practicing the domination towards Moslem women. As the further analysis upon secularist's domination, it will depict the manifestations of the domination itself. Henceforth, the practice of secularist's domination is identified into three form: domination through policy-making, threat, onstage play and, derogation.

Policy-making is a substantial matter in living within social group. It is due to the matter that a policy result great effects towards the sustainability living of the society. Additionally, policy-making can only be maintained by the party who holds the power, which is not possessed by all people. Therefore, there is big possibility for the party, who owns the power, to able to freely exercise it in order to reach its goal.

A policy refers to role, order, and command. It is officially applied to organize and control the orderliness in society, especially in a country. In consequence, the primary party, which is affected by the exercise of such power, is society. Unfortunately, a policy sometimes goes oppositely with what certain group wants. Moreover, it generally happens to the small or subordinate group within society in a country. For instance, a policy which harms privileges, such as restriction and even restrained upon one's rights as citizen, especially the rights over belief or ideology of either an individual or a group. Such as case happens in Turkey as described in quotation:

"When the authorities had outlawed the wearing of head scarves in educational institutions across the country, many women refused to comply; the noncompliant young women at the institute of Education in Kars had been barred first from the classroom and then, following an edict from Ankara from the entire campus (Pamuk,2005 :16)

The quotation shows that "the authorities" have issued a policy on outlawing upon "the wearing of headscarves in educational institutions". Besides, the consequence which must be paid over wearing the headscarf is the banning for entering the classroom and even the campus. At this point, there is a use of power by "the authorities". The authorities refer to party which officially holds a power. In other words, in this case, the authorities refer to the government or the state. It is due to the fact that there is only the state which has a role to do such thing. Furthermore, it is evidenced by the word Ankara. Ankara is the state capital of Turkey where the governmental activities, power practice, is centered and is exercised by the power holder, the state. In this case, the state is the policy maker—depicts the concept of domination over policy.

Domination through Threat

As mentioned in the previous chapters that since Moslem men are the fellow and brother of Moslem women, thereof, the practice of domination through threat covers them, too. It is grounded upon the fact that Moslem men are against the practice of secularism, including the idea of banning the wearing of headscarves. Hence, there is a threat given by Z Dermikol as a proof of this kind of situation. The target at this time is the whole audience—many people from different background, but mainly it is addressed to the religious high school students who always speak up for the rights of Moslem women—in the National Theater. He exercises power he owned through his act as explained in the narration. (Pamuk, 2005: 162)

The idea of shouting represents that Z Dermikol requires big attention from whomever audience in the National Theater. Farther, shouting with waving pistols and rifles towards another people is regarded as intimidating action. It is due to the dreadful effects caused by using such pistols and rifles. Accordingly, it threatens the audience as other people, especially those whom he considers as enemies—religious high school students—who thwart the practice of secularism through uncovering Moslem women. On the other hand, the secularist elites of the states somehow not only exercise power through giving the threat, but they also execute it definitely. In other words, the threat is also practiced physically. It is given the fact through the explanation. (Pamuk, 2005: 169-170)

Domination through Onstage Play

Secularist's domination can also be identified through onstage play entitled *The Tragedy in Kars*. In this play, Kadife is firstly persuaded to take a role as a headscarf woman who will take off the scarf though, under the pressure, she realizes it at the end of the play. However, through the narration, act, and dialogue during the play, the practice of domination upon Moslem women, which is represented by Kadife, can be identified explicitly. First of all, it is due to the excessive advertisement or publicity. The advertisement says that a headscarf leader, Kadife, will bare her head on the play. Directly, it evokes a wild opinion from the society as described in the excerpt below.

“Still, everyone had heard the announcements that had been running on TV since lunchtime, and they were now very curious to see whether she would bare her head. There'd been the usual spate of conflicting rumors—some holding that Kadife was merely following army orders to remove her scarf, while others had it that she was planning not to go onstage after all—but after half a day of saturation publicity, even those only vaguely acquainted with the headscarf affair now knew all about Kadife.” (Pamuk, 2005: 393)

The excessive publicity can be proven through the explanation "the announcement that had been running on TV since lunchtime." Lunchtime is generally done at noon while the play is scheduled in evening time. It means the publicity is at about half of the day. Additionally, since it is announced on TV in which the public—the whole society of Kars—can easily know the information, thus, it is more than enough. Henceforth, it leads to a case of saturation in the society as stated "half a day of saturation publicity." Importantly, the effect of such saturation publicity is even worse. Besides the whole society, "even those only vaguely acquainted with the headscarf affair," knows about Kadife and the issue on the headscarf in sudden, it results crucial public speculations between them. Some people believe that Kadife is merely following army orders to remove her scarf, while others believe that she is planning not to go onstage after all. Thus, public curiosity "to see whether she would bare her head" then leads into judgments over Moslem women and headscarves. In this case, Kadife, headscarves Moslem women in general, becomes public talks, which pushes her to be a public prisoner.

MOSLEM WOMEN'S RESISTANCE AGAINST SECULARIST'S DOMINATION

Resistance always arises due to the exercise of power. The idea of resistance comes from Disagreement state upon the policy which basically the idea, of the power holder. Generally, it is because the idea of the power holder possibly either harms or violates them. Furthermore, as in the case of domination found through the object of the study, Orhan Pamuk's Snow, in which domination is practiced by secular state and secularist elites likewise to implement secularism as a pinpoint of state's project upon modernizing the country, the case of resistance hence emerges as a state against the practice of such secularist's domination.

Notwithstanding, in advance of the emergence and even the practice of resistance by Moslem women in order to resist secularist's domination, there is a state where they see and therefore position themselves under that domination. The case of Moslem women positioning themselves can give the grounding knowledge upon the case of resistance practiced by them. Indeed, it will reveal the current stance of Moslem women in the current situation either in which it can lead the identification of their resistance. Therefore, before analyzing the case of Moslem women's resistance, it will previously depict the way they position themselves under secularist's domination.

Outward Resistance through Demonstration

The Moslem women's resistance is due to the policy upon banning the headscarves students Hom entering the school. In this case, those headscarves students stage a demonstration to vocalize their voices. It can be seen through the explanation in the novel (Pamuk, 2005: 43, 114). due to the fact that since they resist against the policy of banning the headscari the secularist elites, including the police, take action to stop them. In this case, the practice of power relation between secularist elites and Moslem women is clearly depicted. In short, the explanation shows the case of resistance through demonstration done by Moslem women.

Hidden Transcript

Hidden transcript is the practice of Moslem women's resistance against secularist's domination without the presence to the power holder, the secularist elites. The case of hidden transcript is practiced inwardly or closely behind the public. In other words, the practice of resistance through hidden transcript is done ofstage without being known by the secularist elites. Hence, the practice of Moslem women's inward resistance in Orhan Pamuk's Snow can be identified through two fonns. Those forms are inward resistance through suicide and vis-a- vis dialogue

Inward Resistance through Suicide

Moslem women's resistance through suicide belongs to inward resistance. It is done behind the resence of the secularist elites who hold the power. At this point, suicide is included into hidden transcript. Factually, committing suicide is always exercised when someone is alone. The state of alone here refers to a situation where there is no other person at that place. It is commonly due to the matter that no one will ever disturb and even stop the exercise of suicide. Thus, it is with the result that the practice of committing suicide is done successfully.

The reasons behind committing suicides are vary. Many people claim that it is due to economic problem, poverty, love, despair, and many more. Still, it is the claims of other people who only predict the possible reasons. It can be different when it is revealed directly from the people who commit suicide themselves. Yet, the fact shows that it is impossible knowing the real reason why people commit suicide.

Henceforth, the case of suicide found in Orhan Pamuk's *Snow* reveals a different matter. The suicide is mostly-practice by women. One of them involves a headscarf woman with the claim due to save her pride. It is the case of Teslime, a pious Moslem woman and headscarf student, who is nearly expelled from school because of her wearing headscarf. Therefore, because she cannot deny her belief on religion to mire her head, she kills herself silently. It can be identified through the following quotation.

"It seems that the girl, Teslime, had spent her last evening silently watching the television show called Marianna. After making tea and serving it to her parents; she went to her room and readied herself for her prayers, washing her face, when her feet, and her hands. When she had finished her ablutions, she knelt down on her prayer rug and lost herself for some time in thought, and then in prayer, before tying her head scarf to the lamp hook from which she hanged herself." (Pamuk, 2005: 16-17).

Based on the above quotation, it can be seen how Teslime commits suicide. First of all, the beginning of the narration reveals that she has "spent her last evening silently watching the television show called Marianna." Here, it seems that everything works just as usual. Additionally, as she is "making tea and serving it to her parents," it indicates that there is not any symptom which shows upon a strange thing. At this point, the calm situation indeed covers her time. Furthermore, as stated that "When she had finished her ablutions, she knelt down on her prayer rug and lost herself for some time in thought, and then in prayer," it explains further that Teslime does the prayer. Her prayer indeed is her obligation as Moslem to pray to God. In this case, it is assumed that she is fully aware of what she has done. Yet, the last phrase of the quotation above "tying her head scarf to the lamp hook from which she hanged herself" It informs that Teslime has committed suicide by hanging herself with her own headscarf.

CONCLUSION

Having analyzed *Snow* novel by Orhan Pamuk, it can be concluded that secularist domination Moslem women are: *reason and character practicing the domination, manifesting of secularist domination, domination over Policy-making*, and Moslem women resistance against's secularist domination are: *public transcript and Hidden transcript*. The novel shows the idea of domination done by the secularist elites upon Moslem women. Hence, it implicitly also comprises the idea of hegemony. It is due to the findings that there is a practice of persuasion and consent, exercised by the secular state and society, upon modernity. Lastly, the story of Orhan Pamuk's *Snow* is set in Islamic rooted country, which contains the idea of women's movement. However, since the women who involve in the movement are headscarves Moslem, thus veiled feminism is applied to underlie the analysis of the study. Henceforth, veiled feminism is recommended to be applied in analyzing women's movement in other Islamic rooted novels.

REFERENCES

- Abrams, Meyer H. 1976. *The Mirror and the Lamp: Romantic Theory and the Critical Tradition*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Ashcroft, Bill. et. al., 2007. *Post-Colonial Studies: The Key Concepts, Second Edition*. Taylor & Francis e-Library.
- Badran, Margot. 2008. *Engaging Islamic Feminism.*, Anitta Kynsilehto (ed.). *Islamic Feminism: Current Perspectives*. (pdf Occasional Paper No. 96). Tampere: Juvenes Print University of Tampere. pp.25 — 36.
- Brown, Trent. 2009. "Gramsci and Hegemony." *International Journal of Socialist*. <http://links.org.au/node/1260>. (Retrieved: June 3, 2013).

- Cassels, Alan. 2003. *Ideology and International Relations in the Modern World* . The Taylor & Francis e-Library. Cinar.
- Alev. 2005. *Modernity, Islam, and Secularism in Turkey* . Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. Eagleton,
- Terry. 1991. *Ideology: An Introduction* .London: erso.Femia, Joseph V. 1981. *Gramsci's Political Thought, Hegemony, Consciousness, and the Revolutionary Process*. New York: Oxford University Press. Fontana, Benedetto. 2008. "Hegemony and Power in Gramsci." Richard Howson and Kylie Smith (eds.).
- Kennedy. 1983. *Literature: Introduction to fiction, Poetry \$ Drama*. Canada, printed in USA: Little, Brown and Company.
- Macmilan. 1984. *Appreciating literature*, California. New york: Macmillan Publishing Company, a division of Macmillan Inc.
- Macmilan. 1987. English and western literature. California. New York: Macmilan publishing Company, a division of Macmillan Inc.
- Macmilan. 1987. *Understanding literature*. California. New York: Macmilan publishing Company, a division of Macmilan Inc.
- .