

Journalism and Islam (Reflection on the Role of Journalists in the issue of Religious Moderation)

Astinana Yuliarti Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Prodi Ilmu Komunikasi Email: <u>astinana.yuliarti@ulm.ac.id</u>

Abstract

Islam is the majority religion in the country of Indonesia, with the existence of multicultural culture then Islam metamorphosed into a religion that was infiltrated by the views of several groups. The purpose of this study is to analyze how the role of journalists in reporting the issue of religious moderation. The approach used in this research is Robert Entman's framing analysis model with qualitative analysis research type. The data in this study are news stories related to religious moderation in Republika Online Media. The results of the research show that Republika Online media as information media has reported informative and balanced, but it has not been maximized in carrying out the function of media as a Watchdog in the community, as well as the lack of carefulness of Republika journalists in conducting in-depth tracing of informant statements to prevent the habit of information being loaded in the media.

Keywords: Framing; Religion Moderation; Online Media.

INTRODUCTION

Islam is the majority religion in Indonesia, with the existence of multicultural culture in this country. Then, Islam is metamorphosed into a religion that was infiltrated by the views of several groups. In Islam itself, religious references are indeed one, namely the Qur'an and the Hadith, but the phenomenon shows that the face of Islam is many. (Abdurahman:). The essence of the revelation of the Qur'an is to be a universal moral reference for people in solving social problems that arise in the midst of society. therefore, a thematic interpretation of the Qur'an is now emerging, which is suspected to be present to answer the actual problems faced by society according to context and dynamics history. (Shihab:2005).

In the view of Muslims, Islam is a religion that has Ideology and thought that are developing in the world. Islam is the only religion and at the same time an ideology that is able to survive facing the challenges of an increasingly age. This comes from an understanding that Islam is a religion that not only has a concept or idea (*fikrah*) that can apply universally and comprehensively in every life, but also it has a way (method) to be

applied in a life that has many features that exist in Islam and but not possessed by other religions. (Amin:2014).

The Era of Globalization has greatly contributed to the activity of information exchange. This directly causes the loss of physical boundaries in the information space. In fact, this condition is very influential on the development of Islam in the face of the world. In modern society, information media is the pulse for life or an essential part in the development of his life. Said, N. M. (2011). Globalization is a historical fact that has significant influence on society's life system. This condition has to facewith wise reaction. Islam as religion that have universal and global order, certainly have role on solving globalization problem. Its clear from its universality, Islam can have significant role to shape global community. (Khotimah, 2009).

Globalization has an indirect effect on the development of Islam in the world and even in Indonesia in particular. then, Islam was transformed into an understanding derived from historical textual facts that the message of Islam was aimed at all people, all races and nations, and for all societies. (Khotimah, 2009). Meanwhile, in Indonesia itself Islam continues to exist because it is a very rich religion (Asshiddiqie: 2005)

Islam in Indonesia was born into a large religion in a multicultural society. (Subhan, 2017). This then developed into a new entity in Indonesia known as Moderate Islam. Moderate Islam or moderate Muslims is a contextual term that develops in the context of certain regions which have denotation meaning. (Islam, 2015). In Indonesia, the majority of people consider the presence of Moderate Islam as a solution to the differences in heterogeneity that exist in Indonesia.

The phenomenon of moderate Islam then became a new trend in the Islamic world, especially in Indonesia. As a country with the largest Muslim population in the world. The world then had high hopes for Islam in Indonesia. The discourse on religious moderation or moderation of Islam in Indonesia actually began to be discussed by Muslim groups in Indonesia after the reformation in 1998 (Bakti, 2005). The openness of the media during the collapse of the Soeharto regime also affected the development of opinions related to Islam.

In the last few years, the media in Indonesia has been reporting on Islam and its followers (Muslims). Framing an event or reality by the mass media to the public often appears in various news with various forms of tendency. indeed, the reality of a single event was then informed to the audience in several versions which then often caused controversy. Some versions of information on an event's reality appear not solely as a

result of journalistic techniques but as a result of the perspective of the different information providers. (Muttaqin, A. 2012).

Every media has a way and tendency in presenting a news. This is because media policy is also strengthened by the background of journalists who can influence in deciding what news will be made and which part will be the focus of the news and other parts that are not reported. (Nurgoho, et al: 1999). Thus, the news delivered to the reader is the result of the formation of the relevant media. Referring to the constructionist approach, this can be said that news is the result of construction and reality that are subjective. Therefore, the news that is displayed cannot be separated from bias and its side (Eriyanto: 2011).

In Submitting a news, it is very possible that there is an element of author subjectivity. Ordinary people sometimes assume that the message delivered to a news will be received as is. But it is different among certain people who understand the news and the press. They assess a news, that every news must have a background, values and experience from the author. And it really affects the writing or news they write. So that the facts on the ground will be affixed with ideas from journalists themselves. (Robby, S.R: 2018).

Journalists are important figures behind the birth of a piece of writing. The position and role of Islamic journalism deserves serious attention. Global media competition with various packaging information and news that has an ideological content offered to the public (Shah, 2017) can greatly influence the formation of opinion in the community. Media construction of reality in society is very important in influencing public opinion and contributing indirectly in interpreting information into reality. (Yuliarti, 2017).

Based on the explanation above, it is important to do research on how the mass media, especially Republika Online journalists, pack news related to the issue of religious moderation and its relation to the face of Islam in Indonesia. This is important, because some media illustrate that religious moderation arises from a concern about the emergence of radicalism in Indonesia and the position of the media with a wide reach in the community has the ability to construct information in society. The mass media has a function including as a channel of information, education, entertainment, and a means of influencing society as well as a means of spreading ideology and or controlling public discourse. (Sheaver and Gvirsman: 2010, Sobur: 2004).

RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses a qualitative approach with descriptive research conducted at the level of text studies with data collection techniques through the study of documentation by collecting selected news texts purposively. The text criteria used as the unit of analysis are reporting on religious moderation in Republika.co.id (Republika Online Media) during 2019. Media selection is due to Republika online media being one of the media in Indonesia which has a concern about reporting issues related to Islam and people Muslim. The assumption in establishing criteria is because in 2019 reporting related to moderate Islam and moderation of Islam and also religious moderation is most often the issue and discussion in society and the media.

The text analysis technique used in this study is the framing analysis of Robert M. Entman's thoughts. This concept is used to describe the selection process and highlight certain aspects of reality built by the mass media. Framing shows the placement of information in a specific context, so that certain issues get greater allocation than other issues, as well as giving more emphasis to the text that is displayed and accentuate certain parts or are considered important by the text creator (Eriyanto, 2011).

In the Entman framing model, there are four stages, namely:

- a. Defining the problem (define problem) regarding an issue / event and how to see the problem from the issue / event.
- b. Estimate the problem or source of the problem (diagnose cause) about how the event was seen, as what, and who is considered to be the cause of a problem,
- c. Moral decisions (make moral judgments) regarding moral values that are presented to explain the problem and moral values that are used to declare an action,
- d. Emphasizing the solution (treatment recommendation) about how the solution is offered to resolve the problem / issue, the solution offered, and must be taken to overcome the problem.

Define Problems	First element as master framing. Here, we can			
	see how an event is understood. Whether the			
	news is positive or negative.			
Diagnose Causes	Find and estimate the source of the problem.			
0	This dimension seeks or seeks to know how the			
	event is understood, occurs and what or who is			
	considered to be the source of the cause.			
Make moral judgement	An assessment of the moral values used to			
	legitimize or argue for an action or idea being			
	made			
Treatment recommendation	What efforts or solutions are offered and done			
	to resolve the problem. This settlement			
4				

Table 1. Framing Analysis

depends on the issue and who caused the
problem (the first element)

Sumber: Eriyanto, 2011

RESULT DISCUSS

This study examines the way the mass media frame news about Religious Moderation. The mass media studied are online media. The research was conducted from January to December 2019. This is because in 2019, issues related to religious moderation became one of the programs of the Ministry of Religious affairs of Indonesia to become a concern in its work program. It was illustrated in several news items that were used as discussions by the Minister of Religion on various occasions. The role of the media is in the news frame on Religious Moderation (see Table 2).

News on Religious Moderation in Republika Online media

Based on the results of news framing in Republika Online media in table 2. The results show that the Republika Online media have a big concentration on issues related to Islam, especially news about government policies relating to the Religious Moderation Program in Indonesia. Based on Entman's framing approach, it illustrates that the direction of Republika Online media reporting on the issue of moderation is in a position to support government policy and only preach what information is obtained from sources.

The news framing conducted by Republika Online media also emphasizes the point of *Make Moral Judgment* where in an article entitled " Adian Husaini Jelaskan Beda Moderat Versi Islam dan Barat " that government policies related to Religious Moderation implemented in Indonesia are considered adopted from America, so if not want to be opposed to America then be a moderate Muslim. While the description of Religious Moderation in Indonesia is very much different from the Western version of Religious Moderation represented by America.

In the article entitled "Menag Tekankan Moderasi Beragama di Rakornas Infokom MUI", the author gets a news quote written by journalists:

Menag menegaskan bahwa moderasi beragama yang sedang dirancang tidak hanya berlaku untuk Islam, tetapi juga pemeluk agama lain. Moderasi beragama membahas bagaimana cara beragama agar tetap berada pada jalurnya dan tidak berlebih-lebihan.

The choice of "berlebih-lebihan" diction should be what journalists questioned the source, what is meant by the word exaggeration. The choice of words can be interpreted differently by the reader and can be a *boomerang* for journalists to account for the purpose of the sentence. The same thing can also be seen from another article published in republika online media on November 15, 2019, where in the news entitled "Kemenag: Pusat Moderasi Agama di PTKIN Wajib ada", the writer found reporters quoting in his news that the Ministry of Religion asked all PTKIN to build study centers Religious moderation as an effort to prevent the spread of religious radicalism, and in the context of counter-narratives of terrorism and radicalism in the campus.

The narrative developed by Republika Online media in the article, even though it was a statement quoted from the resource person, according to the author seemed "brave". The statement "narrative of terrorism and radicalism on campus" could be a long debate. When we draw a straight line, looking at history, there is no evidence that the Narrative of Terrorism thrives on campus. Similarly, the understanding of "radicalism" is feared by the Minister of Religious Affairs. In fact, it needs to be defined more deeply, what is the purpose behind the statement.

No.	Headline	Date	Time	Rubri	News Frame
1.	Duta besar Mesir RI sampaikan pesan khusus Syeik Azhar	2 Januari 2019	7.43 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	The Egyptian ambassador to Indonesia, Ahmed Anr Ahmed Manned, conveyed the special message of Sheikh Al-Azhar, that Muslims spread the concept of Islamic Moderation because countries that have many problems because they did not apply the concept.
2.	Duta Saudi untuk Lebanon dukung Kampanye Moderasi Islam	28 Januari 2019	11.01 p.m.	Internasion al	The media has a very important role in public life and has an impact on the formation of public opinion especially in its role related to the promotion and campaign of Islamic moderation through the media.
3.	Buta Aksara Keagamaan, Tantangan besar Moderasi Islam	28 Februari 2019	10.21 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	At present, the biggest challenge of religious moderation comes from the majority of people who are still illiterate, their enthusiasm in religion should be followed by humility to continue to explore Islamic knowledge, from an Islamic perspective, so that it will not cause excessive fanaticism and blame other groups.

Table 2 Framing Analysis on Republika

4.	Menag Minta Kampus terus Proaktif Gelorakan Moderasi Beragama	5 Maret 2019	07.20 a.m.	News- Dunia Kampus	PTKIN is the leading position in guarding the life of moderate Islam, namely Islam that nurtures, Islam that elevates human dignity and dignity can be neither rigid nor formalistic in religion.
5.	Buku Putih Moderasi Beragama Panduan Semua Lini Pendidikan	27 Maret 2019	4.09 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	The Ministry of Religious Affairs has compiled a main book that will strengthen moderation in Islamic education circles which is a step in the effort to spread moderate religious understanding with various strategies.
6.	Uji Shahih Buku putih Moderasi beragama, Kemenag undang pakar	16 Mei 2019	5.38 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	The Minister of Religious Affairs said that the mainstreaming of religious moderation as one of the strategies to promote the culture of Indonesian human resources in the context of counteracting an exclusive, explosive and intolerant attitude in the name of religion
7.	Moderasi Agama Materi Penting Seleksi 138 Profesi Guru	16 Mei 2019	6.10 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	Secretary General of the Ministry of Religion, M Nur Kholis Setiawan said that PPG should not only be an effort to legitimize the teaching profession, PPG should be used as a tool for mainstreaming religious moderation to produce moderate, not extreme right or left students
8.	Ustaz Tanjung: UIII akan kibarkan Bendera Moderasi Islam	18 Juni 2019	9.21. p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	Ustadz Tanjung praised the establishment of UIII as a campus which is an important forum, in the midst of increasingly widespread ideas of extreme left and right in society, which is a <i>tafkiri</i> understanding echoed by a handful of people who use the Islamic flag.
9.	UIN Bandung terus Gelorakan Moderasi Islam	4 Juli 2019	3.45 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	According to the Chancellor of UIN Bandung, the Islamic moderation movement is part of the dictionary's commitment to be an agent of disseminating moderate Islamic movements, not only in West Java, but also in Indonesia.
10.	Menag Tekankan Moderasi Beragama di	18 Juli 2019	05.00 a.m.	Dunia- Islam: Indonesia	The Minister of Religious Affairs stressed that religious moderation that is being drafted, not only applies to Islam, but

	Rakornas Infokom MUI				also followers of other religions. Religious moderation discusses how to keep religion on track and not to overdo it.
11.	Buku Moderasi Agama dipublikasikan September	23 juli 2019	5.16 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	The religious moderation book that will be launched is a thought that supports all religions in Indonesia, the use of the term "Garis Keras" is replaced by "Exclusive" or "Conservative"
12.	Adian Husaini Jelaskan Beda Moderat Versi Islam dan Barat	9 Okt 2019	2.04 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	The term moderate use of this defender is considered to be adopted from America, so if you don't want to be hostile to America then be a moderate Muslim.
13.	Buku Moderasi Agama bantu Deteksi dini Radikal	9 Okt 2019	11.24 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	The book on religious moderation is expected to be a reference in understanding the phenomenon of radicalism, because radicalism is not a representation of the majority of religious people in Indonesia who are friendly, polite and tolerant. According to MUI ,In this book also contains the meaning of Jihad.
14.	Kemenag: Pusat Moderasi Agama di PTKIN Wajib ada	12 November 2019	1.40 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	The Ministry of Religious Affairs asked all PTKIN to establish a Center for the Study of Religious Moderation as an effort to prevent the spread of religious radicalism, and in the context of counter-narrative efforts on terrorism and radicalism in the campus.
15.	Masuk rencana Pembangunan nasional, ini 3 takaran Moderasi	15 November 2019	9.40 p.m.	Dunia- Islam: Khazanah	The measure of religious moderation according to the Minister of Religion: how strong the return of adherents to the core core of the teachings are human values, benchmarks of mutual agreement between diverse humans and public order in triggering a moderate atmosphere of religion.

Journalism, the Role of Journalists and Religious Moderation News

The easiest approach to understanding the study and practice of journalism is to view journalism as a profession, a job that is related to reporting in the mass media. In Indonesia, the journalist profession is more detailed in the law No. 40 about the Press, article 1 states:

"Journalistic activities include searching, obtaining, possessing, storing, processing, and conveying information in the form of text, sound, images, sound and images as well as data and graphics and in other forms using print media, electronic media, and all types of channels available. (Sukmono, F. G., & Junaedi, F.; 2018)

Related to the role of journalists, implicitly can be seen from the function and role of the national press contained in articles 3 and 6 (verse a-e). Among other things it was mentioned that the national press functions as a medium of information, education, entertainment and social control. In this case, researchers agree with Ecip (2007) that among other media functions, the education function is more prominent. Educating in the broadest sense actually includes the functions of providing information, entertaining, controlling, bequeathing culture, sticking together society and others. According to Ecip, its carrying out the educational function in the broadest sense includes explaining what happens with the news rather than feeling important because it receives the earliest information.

Deuze and Witschge (2018) more specifically relate journalism to work related to specific ideologies and work cultures. Journalism requires work standards and ideal values, including preparing public services, trying to be objective, fair, trustworthy, commitment to actuality and speed in presenting information, as well as having social and ethical responsibilities.

The concept of the role of journalists in society was first put forward by Cohen in 1963 (McQuail, 2000). There are two concepts of the role of journalists, first the concept of neutral journalists (neutral reporters) which refers to the idea of the press as a news giver, interpreter and government tool. In this case, the press positions itself as a channel or mirror. Second, the concept of the role of participant (participant) or known as the traditional fourth estate in the sense of the press as a public representative, government critic, policy supporter, and policy maker.

Furthermore, Wilhout and Weaver (1986) in McQuail (2014) also conducted the same research but differentiated the role of journalists into three role categories. First, the role of the interpreter (investigative / investigative role), namely analyzing and interpreting complex problems, examining demands issued by the government and discussing applicable national policies. Second, the informative disseminator role, including the task of delivering information to the public as soon as possible and focusing on the largest audience and the role of opponents (adversary role).

Further research developments related to the role of journalists no longer look at the tendency of what role categories are dominant, further analyzing certain variables that influence those roles. Deuze (2002) also developed the concept of different cultural preaching in a number of world countries related to the role of journalists. That, watchdog roles as well as informational and investigation roles differently, are more attached to journalists in the United Kingdom, Australia and the United States. As for journalists in Germany and the Netherlands, although these roles are not so strongly attached, they pay particular attention to the role of favoring the disadvantaged or the simple, pro-people 'term rather than anti-government attitude.

Reflections on the Role of Journalists in the News relating to Religious Moderation

In various events, journalists have a very important role related to professional responsibilities and individual morality as human beings. As a journalist reporting on religious moderation in Indonesia, the author observes the tendency of the role of Republika journalists to be more dominant in showing the role of informative or information disseminators. Based on the writer's search for the headlines in a number of reports in Republika, it shows that the efforts of journalists in describing the subject matter are quoted from news sources. Apart from speculative reporting, journalists also belong to the first professional group (first responder) who seeks as soon as possible in a location where news sources are obtained without adding and subtracting information in the field.

The informative role of journalists can be seen in the online republika news published in the rubric of *Dunia Islam-Khazanah* on January 2nd 2019, where journalists cite the statement of the Egyptian Ambassador to Indonesia:

"Mereka tidak melaksanakan prinsip-prinsip wasatiyatul Islam, (malah) menjadikan Islam sebagai alat politik," kata Ahmed dalam seminar internasional tentang Kewarganegaraan, Keharmonisan Sosial, Antara Moderasi Islam dan Tantangan Masa Kini di Perguruan Tinggi Ilmu Alquran (PTIQ).

According to the author, there is a very unfortunate thing done by Republika Online journalists, who are less careful or careless in confirming to the informants; what does he mean by Islam as a political tool, what is meant is the phenomenon of elections in Indonesia which is associated with identity politics or what it looks like. Journalists in the news did not carry out their functions as Watchdog, such as the function of criticism that should be played out more by journalists so that the information extracted was more indepth and accompanied by arguments that could be accepted by readers. Some of the news in table 2, shows that most Republika journalists only carry out their function as information media whose duty is to convey information to readers. Some news articles do not indicate the role of a journalist in the media as a watchdog. Where journalists should be "eyes and ears" which are more analytical and critical of the government's role policy, but in the news published in Republika Online Media, journalists merely convey information but do not take on their role as guardians.

Through this watchdog role, journalists are expected to help supervise and oversee all government policies related to religious moderation. Because if we see from most of the news that the religious moderation policy in Indonesia is a program of the Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia, as quoted from the news entitled "Menag Minta Kampus terus Proaktif Gelorakan Moderasi Beragama" yang diposting 5 Maret 2019":

"PTKIN (Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Negeri) merupakan posisi terdepan dalam mengawal kehidupan Islam yang moderat, yakni Islam yang mengayomi, Islam yang meninggikan harkat dan martabat manusia," kata Lukman di Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga (UIN Suka) Yogyakarta.

The same thing was published in another news on July 18, 2019 with the title

"Menag Tekankan Moderasi Beragama di Rakornas Infokom MUI": Menteri Agama, Lukman Hakim Saifuddin, menegaskan moderasi beragama yang tengah dirancang Kementerian Agama tidak hanya berlaku untuk Islam, tetapi juga bagi pemeluk agama lain.

From the two pieces of news above cited by the Republika Online news portal, the author can make the conclusion that Republika Online journalists have not carried out their press function as watchdog.

CONCLUSION

- a. Online media which are the object of research have provided balanced information about news and issues related to Religious Moderation
- b. The emphasis of framing on each news shows that Republika Online Media has tried to carry out its function as a medium for delivering information
- c. Republika Online media portal still uses its function as a watchdog which has to do an analysis of government policies which are discussed in news articles.
- d. Republika Online Media Journalists are still lacking in accuracy and carelessness in checking and deepening statements from sources who could be biased among readers.

REFERENCES

- Abdurrohman, A. A. (2018). Eksistensi Islam Moderat dalam Perspektif Islam. *Rausyan Fikr*, *14*(1).
- Amin, R. (2014). PRINSIP DAN FENOMENA MODERASI ISLAM DALAM TRADISIHUKUM ISLAM. *Al-Qalam*, 20(3), 23-32.
- Asshiddiqie, J. (2005). Indonesia di tengah Dinamika Dunia Islam Memasuki abad 21 dalam Kongres Umat Islam Indonesia, Jakarta. Penerbit MUI
- Bakti, A. F. (2005). Islam and Modernity: Nurcholish Madjid's Interpretation of Civil Society, Pluralism, Secularization, and Democracy. *Asian Journal of Social Science*, 33(3), 486-505.
- Deuze, M. (2002). National news cultures: A comparison of Dutch, German, British, Australian, and US journalists. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, 79(1), 134-149.
- Deuze, M., & Witschge, T. (2018). Beyond journalism: Theorizing the Transformation of Journalism. *Journalism*, 19(2), 165-181.
- Ecip, S. S. (2007). Jurnalistik Mutakhir, Panduan dari Atas Meja, Jakarta. *Penerbit Republika*.
- Eriyanto (2011). Analisis Framing : Konstruksi, Ideologi dan Politik Media. LKiS
- Sukmono, F. G., & Junaedi, F. (2018). JURNALISME SENSITIF BENCANA DALAM MANAJEMEN PENCARIAN, PENGELOLAAN INFORMASI DAN PEMBERITAAN BENCANA DI RUANG REDAKSI. *Jurnal ASPIKOM*, 3(4), 712-721.
- Islam, T., & Khatun, A. (2015). "Islamic Moderation" in Perspectives: A Comparison Between Oriental And Occidental Scholarships. *International Journal of Nusantara Islam*, 3(2), 69-78.
- Khotimah, K. (2009). Islam dan Globalisasi: Sebuah Pandangan tentang Universalitas Islam. *KOMUNIKA: Jurnal Dakwah dan Komunikasi*, *3*(1), 114-132.
- McQuail, D. (2000). *Mass communication theory*. Sage publications.
- McQuail D. (2014). Mass Communication Theory Sixth Edition. Sage Publications
- Muttaqin, A. (2012). Agama dalam Representasi Ideologi Media Massa. *KOMUNIKA: Jurnal Dakwah dan Komunikasi*, 6(2).
- Said, N. M. (2011). Dakwah dan Efek Globalisasi Informasi.
- Robbiy, S. R. (2018). Konstruksi Realitas Republika Online Dan Kompas. Com Terhadap Pemberitaan Aksi 212 (Analisis framing pada Pemberitaan Aksi 212 Terhadap Kasus Dugaan Penistaan Agama oleh Basuki Tjahaja Purnama..
- Sheafer, T., & Dvir-Gvirsman, S. (2010). The spoiler effect: Framing attitudes and expectations toward peace. *Journal of peace research*, 47(2), 205-215.
- Shihah, U. (2005). Kontekstual Al-Qur'an, cet III. Jakarta: Permadani
- Sobur, A. (2004). Analisis Teks Media, Suatu Pengantar untuk Analisis Wacana, Analisis Semiotik dan Analisis Framing. Remaja Rosdakarya
- Subhan, A. (2017). MULTICULTURALISM IN CONTEXT: ISLAM, INDONESIAN, ANDGLOBAL CHALLENGE. *TASÂMUH*, *14*(2), 159-176.
- Syah, H. (2014). Peran Jurnalisme Islam di Tengah Hegemoni Pers Barat dalam Globalisasi Informasi. Jurnal Komunikasi Islam, 4(1).
- Yuliarti, A., Kasnawi, M. T., & Cangara, H. (2017). ISIS DAN STIGMA ISLAMOFOBIA FRAMING TENTANG KONSTRUKSI PEMBERITAAN ISIS DALAM MEDIA ONLINE. KAREBA: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi, 6(2), 285-293.
- Zakiah, Z. (2015). Religion In The Construction Of Mass Media; A Study On The Kompas And Republika Framing Of The Terrorism News. Analisa: Journal of Social Science and Religion, 22(1), 83-96.