

REWARD AND PUNISHMENT IN ENGLISH FOREIGN LANGUAGE CLASSROOM

Wan Muthia Lubis

Department of English Education, Samudra University
Langsa, Aceh, Indonesia

Abstract

This research aimed to find out of reward and punishment used by teacher in English Foreign Language classroom and reward and punishment implementation by teacher in English Foreign Language classroom. The method used in this research is descriptive qualitative. This research was analyzed kinds of reward and punishment in efl classroom and the implementation of reward and punishment. The sample of this research is one of the English Teacher at SMPN 2 Kejuruan Muda. Result of this research is kinds of reward that used by teacher in English Foreign Language classroom is verbal reward, non-verbal reward, reward with come close to students, reward with touch, gift, and reward with fun activities. Punishment that used by teacher in English Foreign Language classroom is preventive punishment and repressive punishment. Implementation of reward and punishment in English Foreign Language classroom that used by teacher is only first steps, two steps, three steps, and four steps. But teacher does not implememt five and six steps.

Keyword: reward, punishment, implementation, English foreign language classroom.

1. INTRODUCTION

Reward and punishment are two learning techniques that are always used in many environments including education, work, and life (Kelishadroky 2016:783). Most learning activities in our lives are impacted by these techniques. They have many variations which need to be applied by considering time, place, personality, facilities, and several other variables to yield the best results. Intrinsic reward is by giving something intangible, such as time with the teacher to build a positive relationship, while extrinsic reward is by giving gifts, giving good grades, sticker, candy, or giving applause that influence the students behavior. According to Evertson (2003:639), to prevent negative behavior, some teachers use reward intrinsically and extrinsically. Reward can help a positive classroom because it can increase student interest in learning classroom. According to Kohn (1996:110), punishment is done to change student behaviour in the future by preventing student from doing something they want to do and encouraging student to do something that are better done by student. Punishment is done by giving advice, and giving reprimand is not using

violence. According Mila (2018:65) punishment is suffering that is given or intentionally caused by someone (parents, teachers, and the parallel) after a violation, crime, or mistake occurred. The purpose of the punishment is to prevent the emergence of behavior which is not good and reminds students not to do what is not allowed. Punishment is suffering that is given or intentionally caused by educators after students commit violations or mistakes.

Researcher can conclude that the importance of reward and punishment in English foreign language classroom is because reward and punishment are educational tools that can increase student motivation in learning, get a pleasant classroom atmosphere and increase student enthusiasm in learning English. Based on the experience of researchers while still attending at school SMPN2 Kejuruan Muda researcher was found that teacher provide rewards and punishments in English classroom but each teacher gives different rewards and punishments to their students.

Researcher will make research at the school and focused on one of the English teacher in English foreign language classroom. The aim of researcher will be to make research in English foreign language classroom because researchers want to see what kinds of reward and punishment are used by teachers in English Foreign Language classroom and how the implementation of reward and punishment by teacher in English foreign language classroom.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Definiton of Reward in Education

Reward and punishment are two learning techniques that are always used in many environments including education, work, and life Kelishadroky (2016:783). Reward and punishment has many variations that need to be implemented by considering time, place, personality, facilities, and several other variables to produce the best results. According to Evertson (2003:639) to prevent negative behavior, some teachers use reward intrinsically and extrinsically. Reward can help a positive classroom because it can increase student interest in learning classroom. According to Purwanto (2014:186) in his book said that reward is a tool to educate children that makes children feels happy because their deeds or work are valued. According to some other researchers, reward is an educational tool that is refresive in nature that pleases or encourages children to do something better, or success in achieving certain targets, especially children who are lazy. According to Mila (2018:64) reward is one of the educational tools that can increase student motivation in learning something. Rewards can also be categorized into intrinsic and extrinsic rewards or can also be said as a sign of affections, appreciation for one's abilities and achievements, forms of encouragement.

Reward and punishment is a sign of positive theory that source by Behavioral theory. Reward is a form of educational tool that aims to motivate students to learn in order to improve and maintain their achievement in learning. Rewards in the learning process are important especially as external factors in influencing and

directing student behavior. Because, according to some opinions reward can lead to student learning motivation and rewards also have a positive influence on student life.

2.2 Kinds of Reward in English Foreign Language Classroom

The rewards given to students form various kinds. According to Marno & Idris (2014:151) in “strategy, method, and teaching technique” book, reward consists of several types, including:

2.2.1 Verbal Reward

Teacher comments such as words of praise, support, and recognition can be used to reinforce student behavior. Verbal reward can be expressed in two forms, namely words and sentences.

1. Words, like: good, yes right, that is right, right, very good and so on.
2. Sentence, like: your job is great, i am happy with the results you are doing, the way you give explanations is very good and others.

2.2.2 Non Verbal Reward

Non verbal reward is a form of face expression or body gesture. For example like giving a smile, nodding your head, thumbs up, applause and so on. Non verbal reward is often used together with verbal reward. For example when the teacher gives verbal rewards to students such as said "your job is very good", and at that time the teacher gives applause to students or gives a smile and so on.

2.2.3 Reward by come close to students

Students who are coming close by the teacher can warm the atmosphere of learning, students feel familiar with the teacher, and increased student motivation. Reward by approaching these students such as standing next to students, walking next to students, or sitting with students

2.2.4 Reward by touch

In providing this touch, we are needed to consider child's background, age, and gender. Giving this reward, some of the behaviors that can be performed by the teacher are: tapping the shoulder, stroking the student's head, and shaking the student's hand.

2.2.5 Gift

Reward by gift such as school stationery, book, written comments on student books or giving another gifts. Need to be considered in giving rewards in the form of this gift. Student learning goals should not lead to the object. Therefore the frequency of use is limited.

2.2.6 Reward with fun activities

Student motivation is influenced by activities that can be fun or not. The teacher must provide learning activities that students like. Rewards in the form of fun activities such as students who excel in learning outcomes are appointed as the leader of the learning group in class.

2.3 Purpose of Reward in English Foreign Language Classroom

According to Mila (2018:64) the goal that must be achieved in giving reward is to motivate students and with the reward, it is also expected to build a positive relationship between the teacher and students, because reward is part of a teacher's love for students. So, the purpose of the reward is not the results achieved by students but with the process achieved by students getting good results, the teacher aims to form motivation and intention to be better.

There are several purposes for giving Among the rewards are as follows:

1. Increase student attention in the teaching and learning process.
2. Generate, maintain and improve student learning motivation.
3. Direct the development of students thinking towards divergent thinking
4. Controlling and modifying the behavior of students who are less positive and encourage the emergence of productive behavior.

2.4 Definition of Punishment in English Foreign Language classroom

Punishment must be deliberately chosen to be unpleasant, such as by forcing students to do something he or she does not like to do or preventing him from doing something he or she wants to do (Khon 1996:110) and it must be intended to change the future behavior of students. Elizabeth (2016:188), punishment is an educational tool, and also be a motivation to encourage student learning. Punishment is the suffering intentionally given by the teacher after the student make mistake. Punishment can have an era effect on students so students feel that what they did was wrong and he won't repeat the mistake again. According Mila (2018:65) punishment is suffering that is given or intentionally caused by someone (parents, teachers, and the parallel) after a violation, crime, or mistake occurred. The purpose of the punishment is to prevent the emergence of behavior which is not good and reminds students not to do what is not allowed. Punishment is suffering that is given or intentionally caused by educators after students commit violations or mistakes.

Punishment is a less pleasant act, which is in the form of suffering given to students consciously and intentionally, so that his heart is aware and do not to repeat mistake again. Punishment is can be educational tool that is giving by teacher for students. Students who make mistakes or violations must get a punishment so that students feel deterrent and do not repeat the bad action again.

2.5 Kind of punishment in English Foreign Language classroom

2.5.1 Preventive punishment

Preventive punishment is punishment which done so there is no violations occur. This Punishment is intended to prevent it from reaching violation occurred, so that it was done before the violation happened. From the opinion above Preventive punishment such as giving advice to students or giving reprimand is not using violence. The purpose is to make students understand that making mistake or making violation is wrong.

2.5.2 Repressive punishment

Repressive punishment is punished someone because of a violation or mistake. Because of that, this punishment is done after someone makes a mistake. Such as ask the students to stand in front the class because student does not make homework. Take a rubbish in the classroom because student late or so on.

According Mila (2018) Punishment consists of several components, including:

1. Verbal Punishment, if forced to educate children with punishment, it is best to give verbal Punishment, parents or teachers give warnings and threats first not to act against children with violence but with a refined heart, then given motivation, persuasion to good deeds, with a sour face, or sometimes praised, encouraged by his courage to do good. Such actions are behaviors that precede specific actions.
2. Non-Verbal Punishment, but if forced to give (non-verbal punishment), it is enough to have a single blow that causes pain, because the blow is quite a lot of children feel light, and view the punishment as trivial. Punishment is carried out after harsh warnings and is used as a helper to have a positive influence on a child's psyche.

2.6 The Purpose of Punishment in English Foreign Language Classroom

The punishment given by the teacher to students who commit violations is intended to arouse feelings of humility and the child is willing to admit mistakes and the child wants to make mistakes. According to Mila (2018:64), the purpose of giving Punishment is to motivate children to do good behaviour and improve their learning achievement. Then, the goal to be achieved occasionally is not to hurt or to maintain the honor of the teacher or vice versa. So that the teacher is obeyed by students, but the real purpose of punishment is so that students who violate feel deterred and will not repeat again.

2.7 The Implementation Reward and Punishment in English Foreign Language classroom

Muliawan (2016:116) on his book entitled is 45 spectacular learning models argue that, the steps Reward and Punishment learning method it is:

1. The teacher prepares the lesson material to give for students.
2. The teacher gives an explanation of the lesson material to students
3. In the middle of the explanation of the material, the teacher give the practice questions in accordance with the subject matter being given
4. For students who are active in class, and answer correctly get certain reward according to those given by the teacher.
5. For students who make noise in class, or lazy to study at class students given the opportunity to answer questions. If students can answer then he gets a reward by the teacher. On the contrary, if student is wrong in answering the question and student is proven to make noise in class and

lazy to study, students will get the punishment according to the mistakes the student made.

6. If a lot of questions are given to students, even more presents must be given. If there are many students who make mistakes, make noise and are lazy to study, the punishment given is also increasing.

The reward given is in accordance with the wishes of the teacher who wants to give a reward. Can by giving applause, giving praise to students, giving smiles, giving gifts, or giving good value to students. This aims to make students more diligent in learning and maintaining their willingness to learn. And giving rewards to students who can answer questions from the teacher can also encourage other students to answer questions correctly. But as a teacher it is obligatory to give excessive rewards and not to make other students feel jealous.

The other hand, for giving punishment is done when students are not orderly in class, for example students are lazy to learn and make noise in class so that it disturbs the other friends. Therefore the student deserves punishment according to the mistakes students make. Punishment can also be like giving a warning to students, advising, and giving other penalties that are not in the form of violence. Punishment is done so that students feel embarrassed, or deterred and do not want to repeat the mistake again. And this punishment also makes other students do not want to make mistakes because they do not want to be punished.

The strengths and weaknesses of reward and punishment,

Strengths:

- a. Encouraging students to compete
- b. Motivating student learning can and develop optimally.
- c. Students' learning abilities can be spread and evenly distributed to all students. this might occur due to psychological elements and competition plus an element of understanding of knowledge in students. Communication built by peers is usually more easily absorbed by other peers in one class.
- d. Emotional ties between students and teachers can grow and develop optimally. In other words, the knowledge gap that teachers and students have can be reduced because of the active communication interaction between students and teachers is easy and fun, both for teachers and students.
- e. For students who are lazy to learn become motivated to participate in competition. At least, lazy students' learning motivation can be reduced because of the threat of punishment if they do not want to learn.

Weakness:

- a. Requires additional fees to prepare prizes for students who are active and study hard.
- b. Sometimes it can be a psychological burden for lazy students and have a weak mentality. More specifically, for students who do not have enough

self-confidence to show their abilities. To overcome this condition, the teacher must be more observant and wise to choose the right gift or punishment. Sometimes sarcasm or derision for students with sensitive types can be worse or cleaning windows. Therefore, the ability to choose sensitive traits is the main key to the success of the teaching and learning process in the classroom if you want to apply reward and punishment.

- c. In general are focused on students who are active, intelligent, and communicative than ordinary students. Even some students who study hard but are less communicative are often ignored. Thus, the concept of learning the ideal distribution of knowledge is not achieved.

3. METHODOLOGY

The researcher used qualitative a method. According to Given (2008:115) “Qualitative method is distinguished from quantitative research by its concern with interpreting meaning in textual data and the spoken word, rather than in numerical data through use of statistical methods”. The source of this study divided into three kinds, can be seen as follows:

1. Observation the research place and make approach with the teacher.
2. Observe one English Foreign Language classroom at SMPN 2 Kejuruan Muda
3. Observe the reward and punishment that used by teachers with six meeting in one month.
4. Make the list of question to the interview the teacher, and the list of the questions based on Marno and Idris theory, Purwanto theory, and Muliawan theory.
5. Interview the teachers and some students to get the information about reward and punishment in English Foreign Language classroom
6. Selecting and sift all the data which needed to separate the primary data, secondary data and third data so that it can help to described the data in the results
7. Finally, conducting and analyzing the collected data and drawing a conclusion from the analysis.

4. RESULT

4.1 Data Analysis

This research was conducted by observing reward and punishment in the English Foreign Language Classroom, interviewing English teachers and some students, and doing documentation. Analysis of reward and punishment in English Foreign Language classroom is based on teacher and student interviews, and observations in the English Foreign Language Classroom.

4.2 Implementation of Reward and Punishment in English Foreign Language Classroom

From the results of research conducted by researchers in class VIII-1, English teachers provided rewards and punishments when English lessons take place in class. The implementation of reward and punishment in English Foreign Language classroom based on Muliawan (2016:116) “the steps reward and punishment learning implementation.

1. The teacher prepared the lesson material to give for students.

Before entering the classroom, the teacher was always prepares subject material in order to make it easier for the teacher to provide an explanation of the material to be explained to students. At that time the teacher prepares subject about the form of sentences which will become material in the English class. The teachers also brought the English textbooks for grade VIII others.

2. The teacher gave an explanation of the lesson material to students

Before the teacher was gave reward and punishment to students, the teacher explains the subject material to be learned on that day. The subject material explained by the teacher is in the form of sentences in English. Teachers do the explanation by standing in front of the class and write the title of the lesson in writing. The teacher also made an advice that was still related to the learning material to students in the middle of an explanation of the material.

3. In the middle of the explanation of the material, the teacher was gave the practice questions in accordance with the subject matter was giving.

In the middle of explanation of the material, the teacher was gave some questions to students and asked students to answer. The questions was gave by the teacher are still related to the learning material at that time. This was done by the teacher to see student enthusiasm in learning English. The teacher made a question about how the correct sentences form in sentences was wrote by the teacher. For students who can answer the question, they must raise their hands and moved forward was to writing the correct answer on the board.

4. For students who are active in class, and answer correctly get certain reward according to those given by the teacher.

Student who was can answer the questions correctly, then must move forward and wrote the correct answers in whiteboard. At that time students were advance and answer questions correctly got a reward from the teacher in the form of praise to students, the teacher smiles, and the teacher also gives a round of applause to students. For students who are active in class, the teacher announces the highest grade results of students

while studying English after daily exams. Students who are active in class were given rewards in the form of prizes such as school stationery, books, and candies. Students who got this reward are five students from thirty seven students. Students who get rewards from teachers are students who are active in the English class.

5. For students who are made noise in class, or lazy to study at class students given the opportunity to answer questions. If students can answer then he gets a reward by the teacher. On the contrary, if student is wrong in answering the question and student is proven to make noise in class and lazy to study, students will get the punishment according to the mistakes the student made.

For this, students who are noisy in class or lazy to learn was given the opportunity by the teacher to answer the questions but no one of the students want to answer the questions. Students just sit quietly in each of their seats and only see other students answer the questions. Students who are noisy or lazy to learn are mostly male students. They did not have enthusiasm in learning English. During the learning process students as made a fuss in the classroom or lazy to learn have been given a punishment by the teacher before. The punishment was repeated the statement explained by the teacher in front of the class. But it does not affect enthusiasm or increase their motivation in learning English. The students till are not active in learning in class but those students who are lazy to learn and make a noise in class.

6. If a lot of questions are given to students, even more presents must be given. If there are many students who make mistakes, make noise and are lazy to study, the punishment given is also increasing.

The teacher does not giving rewards as much as the questions was giving to students, the teacher only gave a few rewards to students because of the lack of rewards that gave by teacher to students. Likewise punishment, the teacher does not punish students who are always made mistakes teachers only gave warnings to students not to made mistakes again.

Tabel: 4.2 Steps of implementation reward and punishment in classroom.

NO	Steps of implementation reward and punishment in classroom	Used	Not used
1.	The teacher prepares the lesson material to give for students	✓	–
2.	The teacher gives an explanation of the lesson material to students	✓	–
3.	In the middle of the explanation of the material, the teacher	✓	–

	giving the practice questions in accordance with the subject matter given		
4.	For students who are active in class, and answer correctly get certain reward according to those given by the teacher	✓	–
5.	For students who make noise in class, or lazy to study at class students given the opportunity to answer questions. If students can answer then he gets a reward by the teacher. On the contrary, if student is wrong in answering the question and student is proven to make noise in class and lazy to study, students will get the punishment according to the mistakes the student made	–	✓
6.	If a lot of questions are given o students, even more presents must be given. If there are many students who make mistakes, make noise and are lazy to study, the punishment given is also increasing.	–	✓

4.3 Kinds of Reward in English Foreign Language Classroom

1. Verbal Reward

In class VIII-1, the verbal reward used by the English teacher in the class is such as words or sentences spoken by the teacher. The words that are often spoken by the English teacher in the class are “good, good job, all right, exactly, okay and thanks”. Dialogue from tecaher and students:

Teacher: Pm, please come in and answer question on whiteborad!

Student: allright mam. (Write the best answer on whiteboard).

Teacher: okey, good job!

The teacher gave verbal rewards by words when students can move forward and also students can answer question correctly. Students who are get verbal rewards in the form of initials Pm, Im, Rd, Mt and Yl. These students feel happy after teacher was gave verbal rewards in the form of words as a form of praise to students.

2. Non Verbal Reward

Non-verbal reward was giving by the teacher simultaneously with the provision of verbal reward to students. At the time of the English language lesson the teacher gave a non-verbal reward such as giving a smile to students when students answer questions gave by the teacher to students with the initials Mk and Al. The teacher nods head when students answer questions to appreciate the correct answer from students who have the initials Im, the teacher gave thumbs up to students when students with the initials Pm can go ahead of the class, the teacher and other students gave applause to students

who initials Rd to move forward by gave correct answers. And when the teacher gave non verbal rewards such as smiling, nodding his head, gave thumbs up, gave applause to students the teacher also gave verbal rewards to students in the form of words of praise for students for answering questions with the right answers. Students who get non verbal reward by the teacher also feel happy and excited when the teacher compliments them by using praise in the form of verbal reward and non verbal reward.

3. Reward with Come Near to Students

During the process of learning English in class, the teacher explains about the material to be learned by students. After the teacher has finished explaining, the teacher gives assignments or questions to students in the form of several questions about the material that have been explained previously by the teacher and students are told to do the task in the exercise book. The teacher gives the reward by coming near to students when the student is writing in each student seats and the teacher come near the student by walking beside the student, and sometimes the teacher also stands beside the student to see the assignment that is being done by the student. Students who are near by the teacher at the time had the initials Ad, Rd, and Ml. This was done by the teacher so that the creation of closeness or intimacy between the teacher and students so that students were also more motivated in learning English. And with this students feel cared by an English teacher in class.

4. Reward by Touch

When the English lesson is taking place the teacher gives a reward in the form of touch to the student. The touch given by the teacher to the student is not in the form of a touch that causes oddities. The teacher gives a touch like patting a student's shoulder when the teacher gives a reward come near to students with the teacher walks beside the student's seat with the initials Ad, and Rd. The teacher also stands up and sees the students assignment is working and at the same time the teacher gives a touch in the form of stroking the student's head with the initials MI so that students feel cared for by the teacher and arises a sense of motivation in learning English.

5. Gifts

During the English class, the teacher has also given rewards in the form of a gift to students. The gift given by the teacher like school supplies such as pens, pencils, erasers, books, and also candy. The teacher gives a reward the type is gift to students at the time of announcing the final score of the daily exam. For students who are active in class, study hard, and have high grades in learning English, the teacher announces the name of the student to come forward and get a gift as an award for learning well. Students who get rewards in the form of gift are five people with the initials Mk, Pm, Im, Al, and Yl. The five students are students chosen by the teacher because these students are always active in class, study hard, and have high grades in learning English.

Gift given to the five students are also ranked according to the highest grade they get on the daily exam announcement. The first student who got the highest score with the initials Mk got gift such as of one pen, two books, one eraser and five candies. The second student who had the initials Pm got one book, one pen and five candies. The third student whose initials Im gets one pen and one eraser and three candies. The fourth student with the initial Al got a book and a pen. The last one student who had the initial Yl got ten candies. The reward in the form of gift was witnessed by other students. The goal is could be an increase their motivation in learning English.

6. Reward with Fun Activities

In the process of learning English in class, the teacher has activities that make students enthusiastic and motivated in learning English. Activities carried out by the teacher are based on observations made by researchers with the way of asking students to stand in each of their seats. And the teacher makes a question about writing the correct words in English. Teachers say the correct pronunciation to students and students who can write the word must raise their hands and move forward. For students who can write the correct vocabulary, students are allowed to sit. This activity is carried out when the time is almost finished and only to learn while playing to adding vocabulary obtained by students. With this activity students are enthusiastic to answer questions correctly so they can sit back. Students who can answer only three students with the initials Ad, Im, and Ld because at that time the lesson bell was ringing.

4.4 Kinds of Punishment in English Foreign Language Classroom

4.4.1 Preventive Punishment

Preventive punishment was giving by the teacher to students at the time before students make a mistake or violation. Preventive punishment that the teacher gave to students in the form of preventing, and advising students do not mistakes or violations when English lessons take place. When the English lesson was taking place and the teacher was explaining the material in front of the class there were some students who were making a noise and the teacher was giving preventive punishment in the form of preventing and advising Ed, Da and Sz students do not to make a noise in the classroom when English lessons were taking place because it would interrupt other students in learning. The teacher also prevents other students from doing the same thing because it really interferes with the learning process in the classroom.

4.4.2 Repressive Punishment

When English lessons take place the teacher also gave repressive punishment to students. The punishment that teachers gave to students in the form of scolding, shouting and giving punishment to students who made mistakes. When the teacher

explained the material in front there were some students who made mistakes and the teacher gave repressive punishment to students in the form of scolding and yelling at students Ga and Sz who made a fuss in class. The students have been reprimanded and prevented by the teacher before not making a noise in the class but they did not listen to the teacher's advice and make mistakes. And as punishment, the students were told to repeat the statement made by the teacher before. The teacher also gave punishment to students Za, Zm, Ra, Wb, and Mr who did not brought a dictionary when English lessons take place in class in accordance with a predetermined agreement. The punishment was gave by the teacher is to ask students to stand in front of the class and memorize five nouns and five adjectives. And other punishment was gave by the teacher is when one of the students whose initials Sz is late entering the classroom and enters without saying hello or salam then the teacher gives the punishment to the student for repeating entering the class and saying hello or salam. The punishment was gave by the teacher to the student is in accordance with the mistakes of the students do before.

5. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

The way the teacher implements reward and punishment is by: First, teacher prepares the lesson material to give for students. Second, teacher gives an explanation of the lesson material to students. Third, in the middle of the explanation of the material the teacher giving the practice questions in accordance with the subject matter given. Fourth, for students who are active in class, and answer correctly get certain reward according to those given by the teacher. The teacher only gives four ways in implementing reward and punishment in efl classroom, but the teacher does not implement the method five and six. Fifth, for students who make noise in class, or lazy to study at class students given the opportunity to answer questions. If students can answer then he gets a reward by the teacher. On the contrary, if student is wrong in answering the question and student is proven to make noise in class and lazy to study, students will get the punishment according to the mistakes the student made. The last, if a lot of questions are given o students, even more presents must be given. If there are many students who make mistakes, make noise and are lazy to study, the punishment given is also increasing.

The kinds of rewards given by teachers to students in English foreign language classroom are verbal rewards, non verbal rewards, reward by coming close to students, rewards with touch, gifts, reward with fun activities. The kinds of punishment given by teachers to students in English foreign language classroom are preventive punishment and repressive punishment.

REFERENCES

- Evertson. (2003) in Stevens, Allison, Positive Discipline as a Part of Effective Classroom Management (2018). *Honors Theses*. 2973
- Kelishadroky, A.F., Shamsi, A., Bagheri, & M., BehrozShahmirzayi. (2016). The Role of Reward and Punishment in Learning. 2(7), 780-788
- Khon. (1996). in Stevens, Allison, Positive Discipline as a Part of Effective Classroom Management (2018). *Honors Theses*. 2973
- Marno, Idris M. (2014). *Strategi, Metode, dan Teknik mengajar: menciptakan keterampilan mengajar yang efektif & edukatif*. Jogjakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media Group.
- Muliawan, J.U. (2016). *45 Model Pembelajaran Spektakuler*. Jogjakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media
- Prima, Elizabeth. (2016) Metode Reward Dan Punishment Dalam Mendisiplinkan Siswa Kelas Iv Di Sekolah Lentera Harapan Gunung Sitoli Nia. *JEPUN | Jurnal Pendidikan Universitas Dhyana Pura*. 1(2) 185-198.
- Purwanto, M.N. (2014). *Ilmu Pendidikan Teoritis Dan Praktis*. Bandung: Pt Remaja Rosdakarya
- Sabartiningsih, Mila. 2018 Implementasi Pemberian Reward Dan Punishment Dalam Membentuk Karakter Disiplin Anak Usia. *AWLADY: Jurnal Pendidikan Anak*. Vol:4, No:1, Pp:60-77