



POWER RELATION IN 'IF HE WANTS TO COME HOME, JUST COME HOME': JOKOWI AIDE SAYS ABOUT RIZIEQ BY THE JAKARTA POST

Clara Ivana

claraivana04@gmail.com

Sanata Dharma University

ABSTRACT

This research investigated the power relation which exists in Rizieq's homecoming case in *The Jakarta Post* by doing Foucauldian genealogical discourse analysis proposed by Carabine (2001). The research was supported by evidence gained using linguistics theory, Systemic Functional Grammar, focusing on transitivity. An article entitled *'If he wants to come home, just come home': Jokowi Aide Says about Rizieq* written in the Jakarta Post is the main discourse analyzed supported by other discourses to show an inter-relationship between discourses and counter-discourses. The findings indicate that the absence of Habib Rizieq in Indonesia is the effect of power existing around him. There are some Actors mentioned in the discourse: the government, leader of FPI, presidential chief of staff, deputy secretary-general of NU, spokesman of the 212 Alumni Association, and Prabowo. The use of transitivity evokes the position possessed by them in which they have a connection around Rizieq's case.

Keywords: *Rizieq, discourse, inter-relationship, power, relation, position*

INTRODUCTION

Habib Rizieq Shihab is not an uncommon name for Indonesian people. Mass media used to share news about him because of an event, 212, which reminds us about a former Jakarta governor, Ahok, as the defendant for blasphemy. The 212-grand reunion which was held on 2 December 2019 made people question whether the leader of the Islam Defenders Front (FPI), Rizeq, joined the event or not. Some people demanded the government to help him to go home. However, the government clarified that if he wanted to go home, he could just do it. Moeldoko as the Presidential Chief of Staff in the article analyzed said, "If he wants to come home, just come home." The confusion discussed in this paper is not about whether he would attend the 212-grand reunion but the statement uttered by the government and the fact why he was not in Indonesia for more than two years which seemed contradictory.

Some studies related to articles about Habib Rizieq Shihab in some media has been examined. A study using Fairclough's Three Dimensional Framework and Halliday's Transitivity system



discussed the implicit ideology of The Jakarta Post in portraying Habib Rizieq Shihab that he should be imprisoned (Nurhayati, 2021). Another study deploying CDA (Critical Discourse Analysis) and SFG (Systemic Functional Grammar) also found that The Jakarta Post is against 212 rallies (Fitriani, Ananda, Irawan, Samad, & Weda, 2020). On the other hand, A Van Dijk critical paradigm discourse analysis examined the discussion of Habib Rizieq Shihab written by Seaword.com and Liputan6.com. It is found that Seaword.com seems against people who are at odds with Islamic things. Nevertheless, Liputan6.com shows its neutrality by not bringing down a certain group (Sobari & Hamidah, 2017).

The researcher was triggered to analyze this article because of some reasons. First, the article prompted readers to think whether Jokowi himself permitted Rizieq to go home or not. Second, the title and the content imply that the Indonesian government had no business anymore with Rizieq Habib's return. The police had dropped his two cases so it seemed that Habib Rizieq could actually go back home peacefully without dealing with the court. The fact that he had not gone back to Indonesia might raise questions for people. Furthermore, Prabowo is mentioned in the article because he was demanded by the spokesman of the 212 Alumni Association to be responsible for assisting Rizieq Habib's return. As we know that 212 activity was not related to the Indonesian presidential election, Prabowo vs. Jokowi, yet the overthrow of Ahok as Jakarta governor at that time. Therefore, the main object of this research strongly contained political things which were hidden and they were connected to each other.

Critical discourse analysis helps a researcher to expose a hidden meaning in a text since every text always has an ideology. According to Norman Fairclough (1992a:64) in Locke (2004) defined 'a discourse' from Michel Foucault as "a practice not just of representing the world, but of signifying the world, constituting and constructing the world in meaning" (p.5). Therefore, a text does not always seem as it is. There is a world in meaning which is built in the text. Locke (2004, p.9-10) has categorized this act into three characters: "analytical", "discourse", and "critical". It is analytical because the analysis runs "a detailed systematic examination of a particular object" to reveal the hidden principles. Discourse means that the analysis includes the focus on language in use which is socially constructed and can produce meaning. Then, critical implies a significant result of the analysis is to empower "consideration of the social effects of the meanings".

The purpose of using Foucauldian theory here is to uncover power which is not possessed but taking part in the network of power. As Lankshear (1994, p.10) in Locke (2004) revealed, "Reading a text critically means developing an awareness of how texts mediate and sustain particular discourses and power relations" (p.39). There are some ways to read a text critically so that discourses and power relations are revealed. One of them is using Foucauldian genealogical discourse analysis. Locke (2004, p. 27) stated that Foucault put the "critical" in the systematic, analytical effort to expose "the nature of systems of rules, principles, and values as historically situated bases for critique." Foucault mentioned this as analysis of archaeology and the product as a genealogy.

Besides Foucauldian genealogical discourse analysis used in this article, System Functional Grammar as linguistics theory is also applied to aid the social theory exposing the meaning in *If he wants to come home, just come home': Jokowi aide says about Rizieq*. The analysis involves a



transitivity process. There are some processes which happen in transitivity: material, verbal, relational, mental, behavioral, and existential processes. Halliday (2014) explains each of the processes in his book, material clauses define figures of “doing-&-happening”. It shows the idea that some entity does something – which may be ‘to’ some other entity (p.227). Next, “mental” clauses focus on people’s experience of their own consciousness (p.245). Relational clauses concern with “characterize” and “identify” (p.259). Moreover, there are three subsidiary process types, “behavioral at the boundary between material and mental, verbal at the boundary between mental and relational, and existential at the boundary between relational and material” (p.300). Behavior shows “processes of (typically human) physiological and psychological behavior, like breathing, coughing, smiling, dreaming and staring” (Halliday, 2014, p.301). On the other hand, existential indicates “something exists or happens” (Halliday, 2014, p.307).

METHOD

The object of this study is an article entitled *If he wants to come home, just come home’: Jokowi aide says about Rizieq* published on November 1, 2019, by *the Jakarta Post*. Since there are steps which require evidence and counter-discourses from other discourses, seven other discourses are involved in this research. To support findings exposed by the social theory, the first step conducted in this article was studying sentences in the main discourse using transitivity analysis. Second, this paper applied Foucauldian genealogical discourse analysis which was done by Carabine (2001) in Juez (2010, p.216-219). Here were the steps how to conduct the analysis: 1) *Select your topic* 2) *Know your data* 3) *Identify themes* 4) Look for evidence of an *inter-relationship* between discourses 5) Identify the discursive strategies and techniques that are employed 6) Look for *absences* and *silences* 7) Look for *resistances* and *counter-discourses* 8) Identify the *effects* of the discourse 9) *Context 1* – outline the background to the issue 10) *Context 2* – contextualize the material in the power/knowledge networks of the period.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Transitivity analysis

Table 1. Transitivity Process Distribution

No	Transitivity Process	Frequency	Percentage
1	Material	8	29.62
2	Mental	4	14.81
3	Relational	11	40.74
4	Verbal	3	11.11
5	Behavioral	0	0
6	Existential process	1	3.70
	Total	27	100%



The table indicates the linguistics process, transitivity analysis, done to expose more meaning from the text. The three biggest percentages are from material, mental, and relational. As Halliday (2004) said, "Material, mental and relational are the main types of process in the English transitivity system" (p.171). However, from 27 clauses, the relational process has the highest percentage (40.74%) to alter the meaning in *If he wants to come home, just come home': Jokowi aide says about Rizieq by the Jakarta Post*. Halliday (2004, p.171) claimed that a relational process clause is the third component which causes a theory of experience coherent. It is used to connect one fragment of experience to another.

- (1). adding that he was free to 'go home' if he wanted to.
- (2) It's as simple as that," he said.
- (3). Rizieq, who is also the leader of the Islam Defenders Front (FPI), a hard-line group with a controversial track record,
- (4) Prior to his leaving Indonesia, Rizieq, who is also a staunch critic of President Joko "Jokowi" Widodo,
- (5) Losing presidential candidate Prabowo Subianto, who is now the country's defense minister,

Clause (1) represents *free* as an attribute of *he*. Clause (2) shows *also the leader of the Islam Defenders Front (FPI)* as the entity of *Rizieq*. In the next clause, the writer of the article wrote the same information as clause (1):

- (6) Moeldoko said that Rizieq was free to come back to the country now.

Relational clauses in the text are used to describe some information to be more specific such in clauses (3), (4), and (5), the news writer tries to emphasize the Actors' positions as *the leader of FPI* (Rizieq), *a staunch critic of Jokowi* (Rizieq), *defense minister* (Prabowo). Those positions start to indicate that there is power between them. Furthermore, the relative clauses used by Moeldoko in (1), (2), and (6) describe that it is actually easy for Rizieq to go back to Indonesia.

Besides relational process, material process is also dominantly used in the text. There are 29.62 % of clauses which contain material process.

- (7) that the government is not hampering firebrand cleric Rizieq Shihab from returning home to Indonesia from his self-exile in Saudi Arabia,



- (8) left for Saudi Arabia in 2017 to go on *umrah* (minor haj)
- (9) and has remained there ever since.
- (10) despite his visa having expired in July 2018.
- (11) just come home.
- (12) if he won
- (13) in a video that made the rounds on social media

According to Halliday (2004, p.190), there are two participant roles in material clauses. They are “the Actor” and “the Goal”. The Actor always exists in both intransitive and transitive material clauses. However, the Goal is always around transitive clauses. Clauses which have both Goal and Actor are only in (7) and (13). Material clauses show experience which is done by the Actor. Most material clauses (8), (9), (11) in this text have Rizieq as the Actor. Those clauses tell the readers about his staying in Saudi Arabia. Besides Rizieq, Actors who experience something are important people such as the government (7) and Prabowo (12).

The next majority is the existence of mental clauses. 14.81% of clauses written in the article are mental clauses. The clauses show cognitive and emotional processes.

- (14) Based on *ukhuwah islamiyah*, namely Islamic| brotherhood, we thought
- (15) that our brother [Rizieq] deserves the right to come back, to return to Indonesia,” Isfah said in the video.
- (16) if he wished to do so.
- (17) If he wants to come home,

Those clauses were not spoken by Rizieq but by two people who have power to comment on his homecoming. The deputy secretary-general of Nahdlatul Ulama (NU), which is the biggest Islam community in Indonesia, delivers his idea and other members of NU (because he said *we*) about Rizieq who is acceptable to come back to Indonesia (clause 14 and 15). The other clauses (16 and 17) are uttered by Moeldoko as the President chief of staff in Indonesia.

Foucauldian Genealogical discourse analysis

A political issue is obviously seen in this article as the **topic**. What the writer exposed in the article has shown the existence of power in the case reported. It is strengthened by Foucault (1980a, p.189) in May (1993), "Every relation of force implies at each moment a relation of power (which is in a sense its momentary expression) and every power relation makes a reference, as its effect but also as its condition of possibility, to a political field of which it forms a part. (p.3)" In this case, there are some influential figures mentioned such as the Presidential Chief, Indonesian President, leader of the Islam Defenders Front (FPI), spokesman of the 212 Alumni Association, defense minister, and



deputy secretary-general of Nahdlatul Ulama (NU). Those are mentioned related to the same case, the return of Habib Rizieq.

After selecting the political issue as the topic, **knowing data** more closely is important. As in Juez (2010), in this step, the researcher read and re-read the main object and secondary sources in order to be familiar with the data. Therefore, the following explanation is about the summary of the main discourse. An article from the *Jakarta Post* delivered information about Moeldoko, President Chief of Staff, that said actually the Indonesian government did not prohibit Rizieq Habib to go back to Indonesia. As the title of the news displayed, Moeldoko said, "If he wants to come home, just come home." The writer also reminded the readers when Rizieq Habib started to stay abroad. He has stayed in Saudi Arabia since 2017 to do umrah (Minaj haj). He has not come back afterward. Also, the writer made readers recall his case before his departure to Saudi Arabia. He was assaulted to commit a crime related to a pornography case and for insulting Pancasila. In fact, the police dropped the charges in 2018 yet he preferred to stay in Mecca in spite of his visa's expiration in July 2018. Furthermore, he got support from Isfah Abidal Azis, a deputy secretary-general of the executive board of Indonesia's largest Islamic organization, Nahdlatul Ulama (NU). He claimed, "Based on *ukhuwah islamiyah*, namely Islamic brotherhood, we thought that our brother [Rizieq] deserves the right to come back, to return to Indonesia". At the end, the writer mentioned Prabowo Subianto as the one who promised Rizieq Habib to be able to return to Indonesia as long as Prabowo won the election. Novel Bamukmin as a spokesman of 212 Alumni Association clarified on 28 October 2019 that he had given Prabowo 100 days to help Rizieq come back to Indonesia.

There are some **themes** identified in the news article. The first is the authorization of Rizieq Habib to go back to Indonesia. It is seen from the first sentence in the article which is analyzed in transitivity as a verbal process,

*Presidential Chief of Staff Moeldoko has **asserted** that the government is not hampering firebrand cleric Rizieq Shihab from returning home to Indonesia from his self-exile in Saudi Arabia, **adding** that he was free to 'go home' if he wanted to.*

The second theme is the involvement of government in Rizieq Habib's self-exile and activities in the past. The government who is involved is mentioned in the final paragraphs as it is analyzed using transitivity in which the writer would like to emphasize the present position owned by the Actor as the government in a relational process is Prabowo.

(5) Losing presidential candidate Prabowo Subianto, **who is now the country's defense minister,**

.....

The writer explicitly mentioned that Prabowo had an agreement with Rizieq Habib during his election campaign, "Losing presidential candidate Prabowo Subianto, who is now the country's defense minister, promised during his election campaign that if he won he would help Rizieq return to Indonesia." Moreover, a member of the 212 Alumni Association as if threatened Prabowo Subianto to make Rizieq come back to Indonesia. Even he gave Prabowo Subianto a deadline, "The spokesman of the 212 Alumni Association, Novel Bamukmin, said on Monday that he had given



Prabowo — whom the 212 activists supported during the election — 100 days to bring Rizieq back to Indonesia, *tribunnews.com* reported.

The next step of doing Foucauldian genealogical discourse analysis is **looking for evidence of an inter-relationship between discourses**. The newest article related to Habib Rizieq on *thejakartapost.com* revealed that Indonesian immigration denied Rizieq's accusation that he was not able to go back to Indonesia because of the order from Indonesian immigration. On the other hand, Rizieq said there were two people from Indonesian government prevented him to go home. The other article published in July 2019 stated that FPI would crowdfund if Indonesian government does not help Rizieq to pay his fine because of his overstaying in Saudi Arabia. Moreover, the article also mentioned the number of the fines:

According to the Indonesian Embassy in Saudi Arabia, Rizieq had remained in the country with four other people. Each person is estimated to have incurred Rp 110 million (US\$7,099) in fines for overstaying. Sugito said the money would not be difficult to raise if the people loyal to Rizieq work together.

There is no correlation or similar reason why he has not been in Indonesia. The evidence seems different but at the end of the second article, Sugito, head of FPI legal aid, told readers that when he would like to go home on time but Indonesian institutions made him do so. The next discourse published two years ago from *tribunnews.com* is telling about Sugito who said that Rizieq would not come back to Indonesia as long as the Indonesian President was still Jokowi. He did not want to be humiliated without evidence. Sugito stated that Habib Rizieq had strength to bring a mob as he did in 212 and 411.

Then, **the discursive strategies and techniques that are employed** are discussed in this paragraph. Firstly, the writer began the writing by exposing Moeldoko's statement about the government who did not impede Rizieq's homecoming. Next, the writer reminded the readers about the reason why he departed from Indonesia to Saudi Arabia. The writer also mentioned his case in Indonesia before he went. The fact which is his two cases were dropped by the police was mentioned afterward. Next, the writer brought some names which supported Habib Rizieq's return. They are a deputy secretary-general of the executive board of Indonesia and the spokesman of the 212 Alumni Association. Lastly, the writer dragged a person from the government, Prabowo Subianto. It was stated that he must bring Habib Rizieq to Indonesia as he promised during the campaign election.

Absences and silences exist in *If he wants to come home, just come home': Jokowi aide says about Rizieq*. First, there is no reason or example why Habib Rizieq is a staunch critic of President Joko "Jokowi". Second, it is not clear which video that showed the deputy secretary-general of the executive board of Nahdlatul Ulama delivered his opinion towards Rizieq's homecoming. Also, it is not clear why the writer suddenly mentioned him who is a member of NU in the article. Right after that, the writer repeated a direct speech uttered by Moeldoko with addition:

Moeldoko said that Rizieq was free to come back to the country now if he wished to do so. "If he wants to come home, just come home. It's as simple as that," he said.

The statement *It's as simple as that* shows as if he does not know anything Rizieq's problem regarding his inability to return to Indonesia. There is no more information on whether he actually knows his real reason or not. Eventually, Prabowo seems involved in this case but there is no



information on how he responded to Novel Bamukmin about the 100-day in bringing Habieb Rizieq home.

Resistances and counter-discourses are found in other texts which become evidence. Regarding Habieb Rizieq's cases about pornography and Indonesia ideology blasphemy might not have problems anymore in Indonesia, as the Presidential Chief of Staff said. However, based on what other texts have exposed that Rizieq's return is not as simple as Moeldoko said. It is found that he needs to pay a fine which is not a small amount of money. He is staying with four other people in which each person needs to pay US\$7,099. The demand of the spokesman of the 212 Alumni Association for Prabowo Subianto to fulfill his promise in helping Rizieq Habib to return to Indonesia could be by giving him money or urging the other government to pay the fines. Furthermore, Rizieq's statement which condemned the government as if it was the mere reason which made him overstay in Saudi Arabia sounds ridiculous. He went there for his personal purpose and now he wants his return aided by the government. Moreover, he declared his dislike towards Jokowi government two years ago. Moeldoko's as Presidential Chief of Staff is clear that Indonesian government is not hampering his return and the immigration office also does not have an order of prohibition for his homecoming.

This discourse brings some **effects** to the readers. The title is quite appealing because the name of Indonesian President is mentioned as if he directly stated that Habieb Rizieq was allowed to go back to Indonesia. In fact, it was Jokowi aide, Moeldoko. Readers who read quickly but not carefully would think that the statement 'If he wants to come home, just come home' was from Jokowi. The next effect is this news article seems poor of information about the newest information of Habieb Rizieq's return. The main information only laid in the beginning, Moeldoko's statement, and at the end of the text, Prabowo's promise. Readers need to seek out more information so that they understand what has happened actually. This lack of information might be because the article is not a paid or premium content.

The issue which has become the **background to this issue** cannot be separated from a political and religious issue which happened on 4 November 2016 and 2 December 2016. Habib Rizieq is a controversial religious leader in Indonesia. Before he stayed in Saudi Arabia, he was involved in 411 and 212. Rizieq was able to have a rally which consisted of various Islamic groups attending the events. They demanded the government to arrest Ahok for alleged blasphemy. The public demand and hard thrust from Rizieq successfully made Ahok a prisoner and Anies Baswedan became the governor after Djarot finished continuing Ahok's governance. This evidence can be found in another discourse published by the *Jakarta Post* on 2 December 2016.

*As many as 200,000 demonstrators are **expected** to **gather** at the National Monument (Monas) complex in Central Jakarta to **hold** sermons, Friday prayers, and dzikir (mass chants to praise God) to **demand** the arrest of incumbent Jakarta Governor Basuki "Ahok" Tjahaja Purnama over alleged blasphemy.*

The verb *expected* shows a mental process in which somebody or a group of people wanted the masses to join the event. The mental process is manifested in experience which can be seen from the words *gather*, *hold*, *demand*. Those processes illustrate the power which resulted in a significant thing happened in Indonesia.



On the other hand, at the beginning of 2017, Rizieq was reported under pornography case with Firza and making an insult to Pancasila. However, he never attended the interrogation conducted by the police officer until finally he left Indonesia for Saudi Arabia. A news article by the *Jakarta Post* published on 12 July 2019 exposed the information as follows:

*Prior to his leaving Indonesia, the firebrand cleric was **charged** in connection with a pornography case and for insulting Pancasila.*

The text marks an ironic thing experienced by Rizieq as a leader of a religious group who demanded Ahok to be imprisoned for blasphemy. In that clause, the word *charged* indicates a verbal process which was uttered by somebody or institution who has power. However, the accusation did not have sufficient evidence so that the case has been dropped. From this case, as it is stated by Oliver (2010) that, "In any case, there was not, according to Foucault, a fixed person who could own the power. (p.167)" Power exists because of the interaction, it means that even though a person has a position in an institution does not guarantee he would always have power.

In that period, power networks happened among Rizieq, Prabowo, and Anies. The leader of FPI allied himself with Prabowo Subianto as the only competitor of Jokowi as a presidential candidate. Rizieq has power to collect many Moslems (people from 212) to support Prabowo Subianto. Therefore, during the election campaign, Prabowo promised Rizieq that he would pick him up if he was chosen to be the Indonesian President. In reality, Prabowo Subianto did not win the election yet Rizieq's team still wants him to help Habib Rizieq. What about the former education minister, Anies Baswedan? It seems that the leader of FPI and the present Jakarta governor are quite closed since Anies often attend FPI's events. During the 21st FPI anniversary celebration, he said that the attendance of FPI in Jakarta clearly gives benefits. A wish was also uttered by him when he came to the 19th FPI anniversary that FPI must support Indonesian diversity and survived social injustice. The recent one is Anies Baswedan has an invitation to participate in 212 reunion on 2 December 2019.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the phenomenon of Habib Rizieq's absence in Indonesia is influenced by the power possessed by the people around him. This is revealed by the process of Foucauldian genealogical discourse analysis which covers ten steps in identifying the topic, data, evidence, discursive strategies and techniques, absences and silences, resistances and counter-discourses, effects of the discourse and contexts. The linguistic theory also supports the existence of power around Habib Rizieq. Some Actors mentioned in the object of the analysis are the government, leader of FPI, chief of Presidential chief of staff, deputy secretary-general of NU, spokesman of the 212 Alumni Association and Prabowo. From other texts used to help the analysis, 212 event was held to make Ahok resign from his position because of blasphemy. After that, the existence of FPI is more sustained by the closeness of the next Jakarta Governor, Anies Baswedan, and FPI. Moreover, Habib Rizieq has helped Prabowo in his competition with Jokowi during the election by influencing people from 212 to support Prabowo. Therefore, Prabowo lured Habib Rizieq help to facilitate his return to Indonesia if he was chosen to be the Indonesian President. In fact, Prabowo is not an Indonesian President now but a defense minister. However, 212 association still asks Prabowo to fulfill his promise in which



another text published in July 2019 said that Habib Rizieq and other his four friends had fines that need to be paid off because of their overstaying in Saudi Arabia.

REFERENCES

- Anies Baswedan: Di Jakarta sangat terasa kehadiran FPI yang memberi manfaat-
Tribunnews.com. (2019). Retrieved 1 December 2019, from
<https://www.tribunnews.com/metropolitan/2019/08/24/anies-baswedan-di-jakarta-sangat-terasa-kehadiran-fpi-yang-memberi-manfaat>
- Anies wants FPI to improve its image. (2019). Retrieved 1 December 2019, from
<https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/08/20/anies-wants-fpi-to-improve-its-image.html>
- Anya, A., Yosephine, L., and Budiari, I. (2019). City braces for another major rally. Retrieved 29 November 2019, from <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/12/02/city-braces-for-another-major-rally.html>
- Fitriani1, S. S., Ananda, R., Irawan, A. M., Samad, A. I., & Weda, S. (2021). Representation of 212 rallies in the Jakarta Post articles: A hybridity of CDA and SFL Analysis. *Studies in English Language and Education*, 328-345.
- FPI to crowdfund to cover Rizieq's Saudi visa fine. (2019). Retrieved 29 November 2019, from <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2019/07/12/fpi-to-crowdfund-to-cover-rizieqs-saudi-visa-fine.html>
- Halliday, M.A.K. and Matthiessen, C.M.I.M. (2014). *Halliday's introduction to functional grammar*. Oxon: Routledge.
- Halliday, M.A.K. and Matthiessen, C.M.I.M. (2004). *An introduction to functional grammar*. New York: Oxford University Press
- 'If he wants to come home, just come home': Jokowi aide says about Rizieq. (2019). Retrieved 27 November 2019, from <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2019/10/31/if-he-wants-to-come-home-just-come-home-jokowi-aide-says-about-rizieq.html>
- Juez, L. (2010). *Perspectives on discourse analysis*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars.
- Locke, T. (2004). *Critical Discourse Analysis*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group
- May, T. (1993). *Between genealogy and epistemology: Psychology, politics, and knowledge in the thought of Michael Foucault*. Pennsylvania: The Pennsylvania State University Press
- Nurhayati, Siti. (2021). *The Ideological Standpoints of The Jakarta Post towards Habib Rizieq Shihab and His Return (A Critical Discourse Analysis)*. Bandung: English Literature Department, State Islamic University of Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung.
- Oliver, P. (2010). *Foucault: The keys ideas*. New York: McGraw Hill Companies, Inc.
- Pengacara: Habib Rizieq Shihab tak akan pulang ke Indonesia selama Jokowi masih presiden. (2019). Retrieved 29 November 2019, from



<https://www.tribunnews.com/metropolitan/2017/05/18/pengacara-habib-rizieq-shihab-tak-akan-pulang-ke-indonesia-selama-jokowi-masih-presiden>
Setiawan, R. (2019). Anies Baswedan & Fadli Zon Diundang reuni 212, Prabowo tidak-Tirto.ID. Retrieved 1 December 2019, from <https://tirto.id/anies-baswedan-fadli-zondiundang-reuni-212-prabowo-tidak-emyf>