



## Using “Fishbone Diagram” to Teach Writing Discussion Text to Senior High School Students

Melza Sufeni<sup>1</sup>, Sitti Fatimah<sup>2</sup>

English Department

Faculty of Language and Arts

State University of Padang

Email: melza.sufe@gmail.com

### Abstract

Discussion text is one of the texts taught in SeniorHighSchool. Students often find it is difficult to understand the text. Fishbone diagram is diagram showing two side of view which is contrasted each other. Due to its structure which contains of two parts, this diagram can also be used in organizing ideas before writing a discussion text.In order to teach discussion text by using fishbone diagram, the writer uses four steps of teaching. First, teacher gives template of fishbone diagram to the students. Second, teacher asks students to start writing the first draft of discussion text. Third, students compare with friends what they have written. Fourth, the teacher guides students to check their friends’ work. In conclusion, fishbone diagram can help teacher in teaching writing a discussion text to the students.

**Key words:** *Writing, Discussion Text, Fishbone Diagram*

### A. INTRODUCTION

Writing ability is a skill one needs in order to pour thoughts and feelings on others to influence the reader to arrive at what the author means. Writing is not easy. According to Mirlohi, Ketabi and Roustaei (2012), writing, as one of the four skill learnt by the students, seems as the most difficult skill as compare to others skill. Writing takes the process and writing repeatedly to look good. Evans and Green in Togatorop (2015) say, “Students may perceive all aspects of academic writing to be difficult.” The ability to write is also an aspect that must be possessed by a student because it is very important when writing on learning English. Based on these statements, it can be seen that writing is one of the subjects that need to be mastered by students because in writing students can convey all the thoughts, feelings and ideas that the student has. According to Harmer in Ariani and Tiarina (2013) writing cannot be instant but it takes process. There are three steps in writing, the first one in pre-writing, the topic is found and the ideas are organized. The second step is writing the first draft by using the idea and elaborates the idea. The last step is revising; revising is developing the first draft by adding, deleting, and editing the ideas.

Writing also includes an indirect mean of delivering messages in everyday life. Writing is needed in communication activities between people to others. The example of this is writing short messages, writing memos, writing diaries and writing essays. Jozsef (2001) stated that the goals of writing are to compare and

contrast the text organizing pattern between L1 and L2. Thus, through writing students can understand the way of organizing text in English and recognize the differences. Writing is a productive activity which requires a lot of experience, knowledge, understanding, and exercises. There are various kinds of student writing activities in school one of which is to write a discussion text.

In Indonesia, English is categorized as foreign language. As EFL learners, there are several types of text that should be mastered by students. Types of text or commonly called the genre. Classification genres in English are influenced by several things, including: the purpose of the author to write the text, the function of the text, the language structure (generic structure) is used, what language features used in the text. In addition, Devitt in Nahotko (2016) stated that the genre of texts helps to identify the construction of a situation. This helps students to see make assumptions not only from the text they read, but also from the aims of the text, subject of the text, and author perspective.

Furthermore, there are several types of writing that should be learnt by senior high school students in Indonesia, such as, procedure, descriptive, narrative, recount, report, news item, analytical exposition, hortatory exposition, spoof, explanation, and discussion. It means that there are so many kinds of text that should be taught in senior high school level. Specifically, from four types of text (narrative, explanation, review and discussion) taught in the third grade, discussion text is one of the types that should be learnt.

## **B. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE**

### **1. Writing for High School Students**

There are many definitions about writing proposed by many researchers. According to Handayani and Al-Hafizh (2012), writing is a tool which can facilitate communication between a writer and readers. This definition shows that while speaking and listening deal with oral communication, writing, is an important skill in which people can communicate through written forms. This written form transfer information from the writer to readers without a need to meet face to face each other.

Brown (2000) states that writing is culturally specific, learned behaviours, so people will learn to write if they belong to members of a literate society, and there is someone who teaches them how to write. From this definition, it can be seen that writing is a skill which can be mastered by people if they are taught how to write. In other words, if people want to write without having experiences in learning writing, this skill will not be mastered as easy as the ones who master other skills, speaking and listening. Jannah and Rosa (2013) also stated that writing skill can only be mastered by having practices and experiences.

Because of the existence of writing, people can express and exchange ideas, opinions, thoughts and experiences to other people. Besides these things, writing also enables people to send knowledge and information to other people around the world. In other words, even though people express and exchange information in the forms of written words, writing is also a mean of communication besides other two oral skills: speaking and listening. In addition, it enables people to

communicate without a need to consider the distance where the reader and writer live separately.

According to Ariani and Tiarina (2013), “Through writing a writer and a reader who are separated by place and time are still able to communicate. Writing also enables the writer to convey information, thoughts as well as feelings with great details and provide chance for writer to review or evaluate them.” From this statement, it can be said that the idea, thoughts, and feelings expressed through writing can be revised and evaluated before they are read by the readers. This is what makes writing becomes more unique than speaking. It is due to the fact that speakers cannot revise or evaluated the words they say because the words are directly heard by the listeners.

## **2. Discussion Text**

One type of text which should be learned by students is discussion text. There are some definitions proposed by writers about what discussion text is. According to Sufyan (2015), discussion text can be defined as a text which provides pros and cons about an issue. In other words, discussion text provides two contrastive sides about an issue which to be told to the students. The contrastive issues can show about the strengths and weaknesses, or it can show the positive and negative side about an issue. After these two sides presented, then the writer can draw a conclusion whether she or he stands in one side or making balance position between the two contrastive ideas about an issue.

Related to the definition above, it can be seen that the purpose of discussion text is to gives two points of view about an issue and these points are used to draw a conclusion stating where the writer stands. As what stated by Anderson and Anderson in Sufyan (2015), the main purpose of discussion text is to show the readers about two different points of view. The two contrastive points of view provided in a discussion text can be used for the readers as the basics to develop understanding about an issue discussed and to take decision about in what arguments, negative arguments or positives ones, the reader will agree with.

A further purpose of discussion text relates to how the students can deal with taking decision in their everyday lives. Rather than simply responding emotively, it is important that they develop the skills to look at both sides of an argument, weighing the positives and negatives objectively before they make a rational decision. In other words, the students can draw a conclusion about an issue after looking at the positive and negatives sides of the issue and making consideration from the two contrastive sides. When students can apply this skill, it will help them to be wise in taking decision about every issue they face in life. Thus, the students can avoid being careless in taking decision.

As well as other genres of text in English, a discussion text also has generic structure which differentiates this kind of text with other genres. According to Warner (in Sufyan 2015), there are three main parts of a discussion text: statement, arguments, and conclusion. In the first part, statement, the students are required to state the background information about an issue to be discussed. This first part is also called the introductory statement of position which aims to

give boundaries subject to the readers about what will be discussed in the next part of the text. The second generic structure is arguments. The arguments meant are categorized into two parts: the pro argument and the cons one.

Pro arguments mean that the arguments which show the positive points of an issue, and it can show the strength of something being discussed. On the other hand, cons arguments show the weakness side of an issue. After these two contrastive things are discussed in the text, then the writer can draw a conclusion. This conclusion tries to provide information about where the author stands after considering the two different points. Sometimes, if the arguments provide in the text are considered fair, then the writer can also stand between. In other words, there is no side which outperforms another side. From this organization, the reader can also take decision about the issue discussed in the discussion text.

Besides having generic structure, a discussion text also has language features as well as other types of text. As what is noted by Niandari and Jufri (2012), there are some language features which a discussion text has. They are as following.

1. Focus on generic human and non-human participant, e.g.: hand phone, television, smoking
2. The use of simple present tense, e.g.: watching television gives both good effects and bad effects.
3. The use of mental processes, e.g.: feel, seem
4. The use of transition words, e.g.: moreover, however, beside
5. The use of modal auxiliary, e.g: should, could, would
6. The use of comparatives, e.g: better, higher

### **3. Fishbone Diagram**

Fishbone is one method or tool in improving quality. This diagram also called the cause effect diagram. The inventor was a Japanese scientist in the 60s, named Dr. Kaoru Ishikawa, he was born in 1915, scientist at Tokyo Japan who is also a chemistry alumnus at the University of Tokyo. Thus, the diagram also called Ishikawa diagram.

Fishbone diagram is a kind of diagram which helps writer to organize ideas in writing. Setiawan (2014) gave explanation that fishbone diagram is used as a diagram-based approach for thinking through all of the possible arguments of an issue, and analysing the situation based on the arguments. It is a tool in which the students can structure the ideas in a unique form before starting developing the ideas into a text. Purwaningsih (2013) also noted that a fishbone diagram is really helpful in order to see the factors or arguments related each other dealing with an issue.

As its name suggests, fishbone diagram is look like the bone or skeleton of fish. The original fishbone diagram which is used in writing cause and effect text contains of three main parts: the head of the fish to discuss effect or problem which represents, primary causes related to how the main topic happens, and secondary causes gives detail explanation about a cause to a problem (Nasir: 2014). This structure can be used in writing a text which contains cause and effect

of a problem. However, fishbone diagram cannot only be used to organize ideas in writing cause and effect text. Due to its structure which contains of two parts, this diagram can also be used in organizing ideas before writing a discussion text.

### **C. DISCUSSION**

#### **1. Teaching Preparation**

In this stage, the teacher needs to prepare everything needed in order to specify what the teacher and students do in the whilst-teaching. The things to prepare include preparing the materials to media needed.

##### **a. Preparing the Materials**

Dealing with materials, the teacher needs to have a good example of a discussion text together with its fishbone diagram. The purpose of these materials is to help students learn writing from the example given by the teacher.

In addition to selecting the example of a discussion text, the teacher should also prepare a fishbone diagram of the text. If the teacher writes the example of the discussion text by her or himself, it means that she or he must have the fishbone diagram first. However, if the teacher looks for the example from the internet, it means that teacher should create a fishbone diagram based on the text found.

After the examples of the fishbone diagram and the texts are finished, teacher should list some topics which will be used by the students as a topic of their own discussion text later. The topics can be about: the pros and cons of smoking, home schooling, full day school, English full day, etc.

##### **b. Preparing the media**

In teaching, the teacher will need a laptop and a projector to show the fishbone and the diagram text to the students. In addition, the teacher needs to prepare diagram cards to be distributed to the students. The cards should be as interesting as possible. If the students are given the cards which contain the diagram like the ones above, it may not be interesting for the students. Teacher may make them colourful and fish-like. This is the example of diagram card which can be taken or adapt by the teacher.

### **D. TEACHING ACTIVITY**

#### **1. Observing and Questioning**

In this stage, the teacher provides one example of a fishbone diagram. The diagram is shown by using the projector. First, the students are asked to observe the head of the diagram. It will be much better if the teacher also provides a picture describing or related to the title. When the students already observe the head (title) and the picture, the teacher should stimulate them to ask questions and give opinions related to the title. For example, if the title is about “Pros and Cons of Home-schooling”, the teacher can ask students these questions:

- a) Do you know home schooling?
- b) What are the advantages of home schooling?
- c) What are the disadvantages of home schooling?
- d) Do you agree with home schooling?

While asking the question, the teacher does not test the students with the questions, however, the questions are made to gain students understanding about what they are going to study—a discussion text. The students are also encouraged to ask questions related to home schooling and their arguments about advantages and disadvantages of home schooling.

Next, the teacher asks students to pay attention to the whole diagram. The teacher should focus students on the positive and negatives arguments about home schooling. In this step, the students can relate their opinions before with the arguments showed in the diagram. The teacher needs to emphasize that the upper bones contains of positive statements while the lower ones are for negative statements. After discussing about the both sides, the teacher leads the students to the tail of the fish. Here, the students can see how to take a conclusion about home schooling. The teacher explains that in taking conclusion, the writer can stand in one side or make balance between the two sides.

## 2. Collecting data and Experimenting

As its name suggests, the students are collecting data to gain their understanding about discussion text. In this stage, the students are given a discussion text which is in line with the fishbone diagram showed in the previous stage. If the diagram is about home schooling, thus the discussion text must also be home schooling. This is due to the fact that students can relate the diagram with the text. In doing this, the students are put in group discussion. In this group, the students also discuss the language features and generic structure of a discussion text. If students find difficulty in doing this, the teacher must be available to help them. After that, the students start experimenting writing a fishbone diagram based on the topics specified by teacher. Each student is given diagram card.

After students finish their fishbone diagram, they are now about starting writing the first draft of discussion. Due the fact that the students are in the level of senior high school, the language features required for writing a discussion texts are already learned in the previous lesson. This can be seen in the English Curriculum set in 2013 Curriculum. In writing the first draft, the students are allowed to explore as many sources they have. One of them is the internet. This is allowed because the in 2013 Curriculum, technology is required to be integrated in the classroom.

## 3. Associating

This step is done after students completed their fish bone diagrams and final draft of the discussion texts. In this stage, students compare with friends what they have written. Teachers can ask them to work in pairs or in groups depending on the number of students in the class. If there number of students is below twenty, it is more efficient for them to work in pair. However, if the number of students is higher than twenty, working in group is much better. This is due to the fact that having many students in a group is considered inefficient.

After students sit with their own pairs or groups, they are asked to compare diagrams. The thing that students need to pay attention is about putting the correct arguments in the correct bones. They need to check whether the upper bones contain positive arguments only, and the lower bones contain the negative

arguments only. In other words, the blocking line between the two contrastive sides is clear without mixing each other.

After the diagrams are reviewed and checked in pairs or in groups, the students move to check their friend's first draft. There are two things which should be taken as consideration. The first one is about the generic structure of the text. The students need to make sure whether the generic structure of the text they write is already in the form of discussion text genre or not. The students can put checklist mark if their friends write the generic structure properly, or they can put some note if the generic structure is not accomplished yet. The second thing that students need to check is about the language features that students use. Since the writings are in the form of the first draft, the students are required to check the use of simple present tense only. The rest language features, as what stated in the previous chapter, will be reviewed by the students before the last product is submitted.

#### 4. Communicating

After reviewing the first draft in pairs or in groups, one member of the group is asked to present or speak about what she or he understand from the mistakes made by the friends whose writing being reviewed. The teacher can invite more than one student so that the mistakes made by the students can be seen and can be anticipated. After the students finish presenting, the teacher gives comment and makes clear explanation about the things being presented by the students.

## E. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

### a. Conclusions

Based on the previous discussion, it can be seen that teaching writing a discussion text is not easy to do. The teacher should find well prepare before come to the class. One of the effective strategies is fishbone diagram. Fishbone diagram can help teacher in teaching writing a discussion text to the students. In teaching writing discussion text by using fishbone diagrams, the teacher needs to prepare the materials as suitable as possible. The materials are sample texts and fishbone diagrams of the text. Teaching and learning activity in this paper are in line with the 2013 curriculum in Indonesia. It follows the steps: observing, questioning, collecting data/ experimenting, associating, and communicating.

### b. Suggestions

It is suggested that the teacher runs through the steps of teaching and learning offered above as a sequence. In addition, it is better for the teacher to do some preparation before implementing the fishbone diagram. The teachers need to prepare the materials, what to do in whilst teaching, and what should be done at the end of the teaching. Thus, the students can be really involved in the activity - writing discussion texts by using fishbone diagrams.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ariani, S., & Tiarina, Y. (2013). Using The Think Pair Square Technique In Teaching Writing A Discussion Text. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 1(2), 409-415.

- Brown, H. Douglas. (2000). *Teaching by Principles: An Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy*. United States of America: Pearson
- Gusdiana, M., & Rosa, R. N. (2013). Writing A Discussion Text To Senior High School Students. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 2(1), 203-211.
- Handayani, N., & Al-Hafizh, M. (2012). Using the Take Turn Writing Strategy in Teaching Writing a Discussion Text To Senior High School Students. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 1(1), 48-56.
- Hidayati, I. N. (2015). *Improving English Writing Skills Through Board Games For Grade X Students In Semester 1 Of SmaNegeri 1 Pengasih In The Academic Year Of 2014/2015* (Doctoral Dissertation, Yogyakarta State University).
- Istikomah, I., Basori, B., & Budiyanto, C. (2017). The Influences of Problem-Based Learning Model with Fishbone Diagram to Students's Critical Thinking Ability. *Indonesian Journal of Informatics Education*, 1(2), 83-91.
- Jannah, K., & Rosa, R. N. (2013). Using Collaborative Writing Technique Through Mixed Media As Media In Teaching Writing A Discussion Text At Senior High School. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 2(1), 144-151.
- József, H. (2001). *Advanced writing in English as a foreign language*. Lingua Franca Csoport.
- Langan, J. (1992). *College writing skills*. McGraw-Hill.
- Mirlohi, M., Ketabi, S., & Roustaei, M. (2012). The effect of instruction on writing performance of intermediate EFL Persian students. *International Journal of Linguistics*, 4(4), 325.
- Nahotko, M. (2016). Text genres in information organization. *Information Research: An International Electronic Journal*, 21(4), n4.
- Nasir. (2014). Fishbone Strategy In Teaching English In Indonesia: A Tool Organizer For Learning EFL Reading. *The second international conference on education and language*, 160-165
- Niandari, A., & Syahrudin, J. (2012). Teaching Writing A Discussion Text By Applying Peer-Assisted Learning Strategy (Pals) At Senior High School. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 1(1), 236-245.
- Sabarun. (2015). The effectiveness of using brainstorming technique in writing paragraph across the different level of achievement at the second semester english department students of palangka raya state islamic institute. *Proceedings of the 1st National Conference on English Language Teaching (NACELT)*.
- Setiawan, R. A., Arasuli, A., & Afriazi, R. (2014). *Improving Students' ability In Writing Hortatory Exposition Text By Using Fishbone Method At The Eleventh Grade Of Class Ipa 3 Of Sman 4 Kota Bengkulu* (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Bengkulu).
- Sufyan, A. (2015). *Improving students' discussion text writing skills through teacher indirect feedback technique: a classroom action research at the twelfth grade students of SMAN 8 Kota Tangerang Selatan*.
- Togatorop, E. (2015). Teaching Writing with a Web Based Collaborative Learning. *International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues*, 5(1S).