



**SAN EVALUATION ON THE INSTRUCTIONS IN THE ENGLISH TEXTBOOK FOR 10<sup>TH</sup> GRADE STUDENTS ENTITLED BAHASA INGGRIS PUBLISHED BY MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND CULTURE OF INDONESIA**

**Selvi Maharani<sup>1</sup>, An Fauzia Rozani Syafei<sup>2</sup>, and Sitti Fatimah<sup>3</sup>**

English Department

Faculty of Languages and Arts

State University of Padang

email: [selvimaharani0@yahoo.com](mailto:selvimaharani0@yahoo.com),

[sitti.fatimahbing@gmail.com](mailto:sitti.fatimahbing@gmail.com), [susisyafei@gmail.com](mailto:susisyafei@gmail.com)

**Abstract**

This research is an evaluative research conducted to find out the quality of *The English Textbook for 10<sup>th</sup> Grade Students entitled "Bahasa Inggris"* by the Ministry of Education and Culture in term of instruction used. The instrument of this research was an evaluation format used by the researcher as the guidelines to evaluate the textbook. The evaluation format contained of instruction categories that consists of three indicators as the criteria of good instructions. After the evaluation, it was found out the quality of *The English Textbook for 10<sup>th</sup> Grade Students entitled "Bahasa Inggris"* by the Ministry of Education and Culture in term of instruction used is not qualified as the good textbook because only one criterion that fulfills the good quality of instructions used; instruction that permit silent period were 93.3%. However, the other criteria could not be categorized into good instruction since they were only found 50% instructions of building critical thinking, and instructions that are followed by example were 45.7%. It means that only instructions that permit silent period that fulfills the criteria of good textbook, while for building critical thinking and followed by example are only average.

**Key words:** Teaching Materials, Materials Evaluation, Instruction, HOT (Higher Order Thinking), Bloom's Taxonomy, the Silent Period

**A. INTRODUCTION**

English Language Teaching (ELT) materials are anything that can be used to help students learning a subject. The materials are needed in the teaching-learning process for teachers and students. For teachers, the materials guide them in teaching the subject. However, for students, the materials help them in learning the subject. They can be workbooks, course books, handouts of power points,

<sup>1</sup> English ELTSP of English Department of FBS Universitas Negeri Padang graduated on September 2018

<sup>2</sup> Advisor 1, Lecturer of English Department of FBS Universitas Negeri Padang

<sup>3</sup> Advisor 2, Lecturer of English Department of FBS Universitas Negeri Padang

newspapers, videos, etc. (Richards, 2001, p. 251) So, the materials will support the successful of teaching-learning process in achieving the learning goals.

To make materials effectively use in studying process, the materials should be evaluated. *First*, an evaluation of ELT materials measures the value or potential value of a set of learning materials, so it helps the teacher to make it using of them in classroom effectively. *Second*, evaluation of ELT materials involves making judgments about the effect of the materials on the people using them as a useful process in its own right.

According to Tomlinson (2003) and Richards (2001) there are six categories they are design, instruction, variety of learning resources, language, content, and activities. Every category has different criteria itself in determining whether the book is good or not. It means that every category can be evaluated separately.

In many schools in Indonesia, there are two types of materials which are commonly used by teachers and students: a textbook and workbook. One of textbooks which used in learning English is *The English Textbook for 10<sup>th</sup> Grade Students entitled “Bahasa Inggris”*, published by Ministry of Education and Culture. This textbook is based on curriculum 2013. The textbook consists of four skills; they are listening, speaking, reading, and writing. Every skill has different exercise to make students understood more about the topics. In addition, this textbook also has the grammar review to explain all about grammar, vocabulary builder to enrich the vocabulary of students, and the warmer to attract students' attention in starting the lesson.

In short, based on the explanation above the researcher will research *The English Textbook for 10<sup>th</sup> Grade Students entitled “Bahasa Inggris”* published by Ministry of Education and Culture. The category will be evaluated is the second category, instruction category. Based on the result of instruction evaluation, we will be known the aspect critical thinking in line with cognitive development in the curriculum 2013. It also explains that students should be able to have high order thinking that is explained in the Blooms Taxonomy. They should master 6 levels of critical thinking ability known as, those are remembering (C1), understanding (C2), applying (C3), analyzing (C4), evaluating (C5), and creating (C6).

## **B. RESEARCH METHOD**

This research was an evaluative research in which the aim was that to what *The English Textbook for 10<sup>th</sup> Grade Students entitled “Bahasa Inggris”*, published by Ministry of Education and Culture. Base on Gay (2009), “an evaluation research is the systematic process of collecting and analyzing data about the quality, effectiveness, merit, or value of programs, products or practices” (p. 17).

This research did not look for new knowledge or other applicable science, but it focused merely on making decisions, for instance whether a material was good or not, whether a textbook used in schools was appropriate enough for teaching and learning process or needed to be improved or changed.

The object of the research was a teaching material, English Textbook for 10<sup>th</sup> Grade Students Entitled Bahasa Inggris published by ministry of education and culture of Indonesia which was used in senior high schools in Indonesia.

This instrument of this research was an evaluation format used by the researcher as the guidelines to evaluate the textbook. The evaluation format was made by the researcher by following the principles of good instruction were taken from Tomlinson (2003) and Richard (2001), and Bloom Taxonomy was taken to decide as some indicators, and had been verified by the advisor, Dra. Anfauzia Rozani Syafe'I, M.A.

No.	Category	Criteria	Indicators	Total
1.	Instruction	The textbook instructions encourage learners to build critical thinking.	Remembering (C1)	
			keywords : choose, find, how, define, label, show, spell, list, match, name, relate, tell, recall, select	
			Understanding (C2)	
			keywords : compare, contrast, demonstrate, interpret, explain, extend, illustrate, infer, outline, relate, rephrase, translate, summarize, show, classify	
			Applying (C3)	
			keywords: apply, build, choose, construct, develop, interview, make use of, organize, experiment with, plan, select, solve, utilize, model, identify	
			Analyzing (C4)	
			Keywords: analyze, categorize, classify, compare, contrast, discover, dissect, divide, examine, inspect, simplify, survey, test for, distinguish, list, distinction, theme, relationships, function, motive, inference, assumption, conclusion, take part in	
			Evaluating (C5)	
			Keywords: award, choose, conclude, criticize, decide, defend, determine, dispute, evaluate, judge, justify, measure, compare, mark, rate, recommend, rule on, select, agree, appraise, prioritize, opinion, interpret, explain, support importance, criteria, prove, disprove, assess, influence, perceive, value, estimate, deduct	
Creating (C6)				
	Keywords: build, choose, combine, compile, compose, construct, create, design, develop, estimate, formulate, imagine, invent, make up, originate, plan, predict, propose, solve, solution, suppose, discuss, modify, change, original, improve, adapt, minimize, maximize, theorize, elaborate, test, happen, delete			
	Total			
2.	The textbook instructions followed by examples.	by	Table	
			Dialogue	
			Paragraph	
			Picture	
	Total			
3.	The textbook	Total Physical Response (TPR: oral instructions)		

		instructions permit a silent period at the beginning of the lesson.	listening comprehension approach (listening: audio, and video)	
			drawings and gestures (pictures, and gestures)	
		Total		

For judging the quality of good instruction of textbook, it will be used this rubric.

**Table2. The Rubric used to judge students' passive sentence (Adapted from Brown, 2010: 214)**

Score	Category	Indicator
5	Excellent	>81%
4	Good	61-80%
3	Average	41-60%
2	Poor	21-40%
1	Very Poor	<20%

There are some stages of data collection in this research:

1. The researcher marked the pages containing instruction of the textbook that would be evaluated. The researcher also prepared the evaluation format to be filled in.
2. The researcher evaluated the textbook based on the criteria in the evaluation format. This would be done carefully in order to assure the researcher did not put the checklist in the wrong scale.
3. After the data is entered in the evaluation format table, the data will be interpreted by recheck from each page of the textbook. Then, the data will be described based on the theory and judging the quality of the instruction of the textbook.

### C. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

#### 1. Data Description and Analysis

After analyzed, the data found were in the tables below

Table. Data Evaluation Format

No.	Categories	Indicators	Total
1.	The textbook instructions encourage learners to build critical thinking.	Remembering (C1)	53
		Understanding (C2)	6
		Applying (C3)	18
		Analyzing (C4)	6
		Evaluating (C5)	34
		Creating (C6)	52
Total			167
2.	The textbook instructions followed by examples.	Table	20
		Dialogue	32
		Paragraph	28
		Role play	15
		Picture	12
Total			107
3.	The textbook instructions permit a silent period at the beginning of the lesson.	Total Physical Response (TPR: oral instructions)	8
		listening comprehension approach (listening: audio, and video)	1
		drawings and gestures (pictures, and gestures)	5
Total			14

The total instructions found in the textbook are 234 instructions. 167 instructions

are categorized into the instructions that can *build critical thinking*. Then, 107 instructions that *followed by examples*, and 14 instructions are *permit silent period (in the beginning of the lesson)* as shown in the table above.

a. Instructions that encourage learners to build critical thinking

From 167 instructions that categorize into building critical thinking, 53 instructions are classified into level C1 (remembering); 6 instructions are classified into level C2 (understanding); 18 instructions are classified into level C3 (Applying); 6 instructions are classified into level C4 (Analyzing); 34 instructions are classified into Evaluating instructions (C5), and 52 instructions are classified into level C6 (Creating).

Some samples of Instructions that encourage learners to build critical thinking:

1) C1 (remembering)

“Try to **find** at least 10 (ten) noun phrase from the reading text about Tanjung Putting National Park and Taj Mahal and discuss the meaning of the phrases.”(Page 64)  
 “Individually, complete the following chart to **find** out the structure of the announcement on page 83 and 84, depending on which announcement you have read.” (Page 89) “**Match** the words with their Indonesian equivalents.”(Page 82)

2) C2 (Understanding):

“**Compare** your work with other pairs. Share the result with the class.”(Page 176)  
 “Observe the following sentences.**Compare** the sentence in coloumn A to those in column B.” (Page 151).

3) C3 (Applying)

“After reading text 2 (Taj Mahal), **identify** the main idea of the paragraphs. Pay attention to how the ideas in the text are organized.” (Page 60) “Read the previous dialogs again. **Identify** the bold-typed expression and fill in the table below with the question and statement forms of the expressions”.(Page 44).

4) C4 (Analyzing)

“Now, read text 1 carefully. **What do you think about** the place described below?” (Page 53). “Read the story about Issumboshi again. Talk with a partner about **what you would do** this the magic hammer if you were the princess. Why would you do so?” (Page 166)

5) C5 (Evaluating)

“Your teacher will tell you how to play this game. You have to guess what words that your teacher has described. For example: ‘A person who is forced to leave his/her place’. He/she is an ‘exile’. After you know how to play the game, your teacher will divide the class into two groups to play the game. The group who can guess more words will be the winner.”(Page 144) “Have you ever visited a waterfall, natural park, or other natural tourism objects, or interesting buildings, monuments, museum, temples, etc.? Describe what make the place interesting. Pretend as if you were a guide describing the special peculiarities of the tourism object. You can also pretend to be a tourist guide for Tanjung Putting National Park or Taj Mahal. In that case, make word web about Tanjung Putting National Park, or Taj Mahal, or your own favorite place. Based on the word web, take turns with your classmate describing the place.” (Page 67)

6) C6 (creating)

“First, **imagine** that you are running for the president of the student organization. (Page 47)  
 “**Make up** short dialogs for the following situations. Read the answer of number 1 as an example.” (Page 44)

b. Instructions that followed by examples

From 107 instructions that categorize into followed by examples, 30 instructions categorized into table exercise; 32 into dialog exercise; 33 into paragraph exercise; 12 into picture exercise.

This is the samples of instructions that contained examples that categorized into table exercise:

*Look at the picture.*

- *What do you think they are doing?*
- *Where does it take place?*
- *Why do you think so?*

*The following is an example of a conversation between Edo and Slamet who meet for the first time in party like in picture 1.5. they introduce themselves to each other to know their acquaintance better. Read the dialog silently first. Pay attention to how to introduce self. Discuss the expressions used with your classmate sitting next to you. Then act out pretending to be Edo and Slamet who introduce themselves to each other.*

**Edo** : *Hello, I am Edo. May I know your name please?*

**Slamet** : *Sure, I am slamet. I am from Jepara.*

**Edo** : *I am from Raja Ampat. I work in a tourism resort.*

**Slamet** : *I work for a furniture company. Have you heard about ukir jepara?*

**Edo** : *Yes, and I want to know more about that.*

**Slamet** : *It's a specific carving pattern created in Jepara.*

(Page 17)

c. Instructions that permit a silent period at the beginning of the lesson

From 14 instructions that categorize into building critical thinking, 8 instructions are classified into TPR; 1 instruction is classified into listening comprehension approach; and 5 instructions are classified into drawing and gestures.

Followings are the samples of the instruction that permits a silent period at the beginning of the lesson for TPR (oral instruction), listening comprehension approach (audio, and video), and drawing and gesture :

*“Your teacher will ask you to make groups of 4 students and show you how to play Chinese Whisper. Listen to your teacher’s explanation and do the activity as quickly as possible. Try to be the winner”. (Page 2) “Close your book. Listen to your teacher reading an announcement. Refer to these questions while listening.” (Page 82) “Look at the pictures below! Do you know the people in the picture? Compare the two airplanes? What are the similarities? What are the differences? Discuss with your classmates!”*





(page 95)

## 2. Research Findings

From 234 instructions, it is that found 167 instructions or 50% are categorized into instructions that building critical thinking, and 107 instructions or 45.7% are followed by examples. Another criterion for good instructions is permit a silent period. This instruction usually present in the beginning of each chapter. In this textbook, from 15 chapters it is found there are 14 instructions or 93.3% that fulfill the criteria as permit a silent period. From the explanation above, it can be conclude that instruction categorized into building critical thinking are 50%, instructions that are followed by example are 45.7%, and instruction that permit silent period are 93.3%. It means that only instructions that permit silent period that fulfills the criteria of good textbook, while for building critical thinking and followed by example are only average.

Based on the data description above, from 234 instructions it concludes that *building critical thinking* has 167 instructions. For level C1 are 53 instructions; level C2 are 5 instructions; level C3 are 18 instructions; level C4 are 6 instructions; level C5 are 34 instructions; and level C6 are 52 instructions. It means that the number of spread of instructions is uneven. The number of instructions is only pounded on level C1 and level C6.

For instructions that *followed by examples*, Based on the data description before, from 234 instruction it conclude that instructions that *followed by examples* has 107 instructions. For table exercise are 30 instructions, dialogue exercise have 32 instructions, table exercise have 33 instructions, into picture exercise have 12 instructions. It means almost a half of instructions that *followed by example*. Examples are used to make the instruction clearer to the students. However, not all instructions should followed by example because the instruction to fill the blank and answer the question based on text should not followed by example. The students already understand what they instructions mean. So, the quality of this textbook good based on *followed by example*.

For instructions that *permit a silent period* (at the beginning of the lesson).” have 14 instructions of 15 instructions. There are 8 instructions for TPR; 1 for listening comprehension; and 5 instructions for drawings (pictures) and gestures. It means almost all of instructions that *permit a*

*silent period (at the beginning)*. So, the quality of the textbook is good based on *permit a silent period*.

### 3. Discussion

To build critical thinking, for Remembering level (C1), it is found 167 instructions or 50%. It means building critical thinking and followed by example are only average. This can be seen from how the material compiles the material that has the level of students' thinking ability (High Order Thinking Skills) in learning. In the curriculum 2013 also explained that in learning English students should be able to master 6 levels of critical thinking ability from the basic level to the high level according to Anderson, known as the theory Blooms Taxonomy. From the data analysis above, it is found that the number of critical thinking instruction is not balance. It's more focused on level C1 and C6. However, the numbers of level C2, C3, C4, and C5 are too low. So, the students will be harder to understand what the textbook wants, especially what the instructions want to do. The textbook should give the number of critical thinking of instruction from slightly to excessively for level C1-C6. Because to move on to other levels the student should master one level below. In this textbook, the number of instruction level C1 and C6 are too much, rather than level C2, C3, C4, and C5. The student will be confused to master level C6 because the number of instruction level C2, C3, C4, and C5 are too little. However, the textbook has too many instructions of level C6. It will better if the number of critical thinking of instruction from slightly too excessively for level C1-C6. , the textbook is not qualified as good textbook because just 50% instructions of this textbook can help the students to build their critical thinking.

For “the textbook instructions encourage followed by examples”, it is found that 107 instructions or 45.7% are followed by examples. They helped the student to know what would be done for those activities. However, 127 instructions had no example because there were some instructions do not need the example to do the activity based on the instructions, but there are some instructions had no example following them; it means the students would be confused. It means 45.7% instructions of this textbook can help the students to explain how they need to do when doing the exercises or tasks. It can't be categorized into a good quality of textbook.

For “the textbook instructions permit a silent period at the beginning of the lesson” it is found that 14 instructions of 15 instructions. According to Tomlinson 1990, 1994b cited in Barnard (2007) said that Materials should permit a silent period at the beginning of instruction because the students aren't doing much talking yet. Almost all of chapters have the silent period instructions in the beginning of the lesson. From 15 instructions, the researcher found 14 instructions that permit a silent period at the beginning of the lesson. It means 93.3% (almost all) instructions of this textbook can help the student to observe their thinking before they do the exercises or tasks. It can be categorize into a good quality of textbook.



## D. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

### 1. Conclusion

Based on the findings discussed previously, it can be concluded that the quality of The 10th Grade of English Textbook published by Ministry of Education and Culture in term of instruction cannot be categorized into a good textbook. This result was gotten from the quality of indicators of the instructions category of being evaluated, such as “the textbook instructions encourage learners to build critical thinking”, ”the textbook instructions encourage followed by examples”, and, “The textbook instructions permit a silent period at the beginning of the lesson”.

The indicators with weak quality of instructions category for building critical thinking because that not more a half of all of instructions of C4 to C6 levels which are the slightly higher beyond their current proficiency level are ready that mentioned by Tomlinson (2003) theory.

The indicators with weak quality of instructions category for the textbook instructions followed by examples because the instructions without followed by examples are much than with followed by examples. Meanwhile, the quality of the instruction for permitting a silent period was good because almost all of chapters began with permitting silent period instructions.

This result shows that this textbook cannot be used as a teaching material used for teaching and learning process, unless there is a massive and overall revision done in order to boost the quality of this textbook especially for building critical thinking.

### 2. Suggestions

Textbook are the sources for the students learn and practice their language. Therefore, they must reflect the principles of good teaching materials. Based on the detailed and careful evaluation that had been conducted, it was revealed that the quality of The 10th Grade of English Textbook published by Ministry of Education and Culture was weak. Related to this result, the researcher of this research proposes several suggestions as follows:

1. A detailed and overall revision must be done in order to improve the quality of this textbook especially for the instructions category.
2. If there is no such a detailed and overall revision toward this textbook, then it is highly suggested not to use this textbook, but to use other textbook that fit the principles of good instructions category.
3. It needs the next research about the instructions from this book which are not grouped into the six levels of build critical thinking and silent period criterias.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Aiken, L. R. (1995). *Rating Scales and Checklist*. Canada: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

- Andreson, L. W. and Krathwohl, D. R. (2001). *A Taxonomy for Learning, Teaching and Assessing: a Revision of Bloom's Taxonomy*. New York: Longman Publishing.
- Aytug, E. (2007). *An Efl Textbook Evaluation Study In Anatolian High Schools: 'New Bridge To Success For 9th Grade New Beginners'* (Thesis). Bilkent University: The Department of Teaching English.
- Brown, H. D. (2000). *Teaching by Principles: An Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy*. New York: Pearson Longman.
- Brown, J. D. (2000). *The Elements of Language Curriculum: A Systematic Approach to Program Development*. Massachusetts: Heinle & Heinle Publishers.
- Brown, H. D. (2004). *Language Assessment: Principle and Classroom Practices*. New York: Longman.
- Cambridge Advanced Learner's Dictionary. (2008). (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Chaisongkram, C. (2011). *An Analysis of an English Textbook: Megagoal 1* (Thesis). Thammasat University: English for Career, Chaisongkram Language Institute.
- Djaffar, Z. (2016). *An Evaluation of a Teaching Material Entitled "English Learning Material For Creative Students" Used at Junior High Schools in Padang* (Thesis). UNP: English Department.
- Gay, L.R., and Airisian, P. W. (2000). *Educational Research: Competencies for Analysis and Application* (5<sup>th</sup> ed). New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Gay, L.R., and Airisian, P. W. (2009). *Educational Research: Competencies for Analysis and Application* (9th Ed.). New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Harmer, J. (2001). *The Practice of English Language Teaching*. Harlow: Longman.
- Harwood, N. (2010). *English Language Teaching Materials: Theory and Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lathif, M. (2015). *An Evaluation of English Textbooks for the Eighth Grades of Junior High School* (Thesis). UNY: English Department.
- Longman English Dictionary Online. Retrieved on November 17th, (2017). from [www.ldoceonline.com](http://www.ldoceonline.com).
- McGrath, I. (2002). *Materials Evaluation and Design for Language Teaching*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press
- Mishan, F. (2005). *Designing Authenticity into Language Learning Materials*. Bristol: Intellect Books.
- Reigeluth, C. M. (1999). *Instructional-Design Theories and Models: A New Paradigm of Instructional Theory*. (1<sup>st</sup> ed., Vol.2). New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.
- Reigeluth, C. M., & Alison A. C. C. (2009). *Instructional-Design Theories and Models: Building a Common Knowledge Base*. (3<sup>rd</sup> ed., Vol. 3). New York: Routledge.
- Richards, J. C. (1994). *Educating Second Language Children*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Richards, J. C. (2001). *Curriculum Development in Language Teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Rubdy, R. (2003). Selection of Materials. In Tomlinson, B. (Ed). *Developing Materials for Language Teaching*. London, . New York: Continuum
- Samanta. (2011). *Using White Space (or Negative Space) in Your Design*. Retrived on November 17, 2017. From <https://webdesign.tutsplus.com/articles/using-white-space-or-negative-space-in-your-designs--webdesign-3401>
- Saraceni, C. 2003. Adapting Course: A Critical View. In Tomlinson, B. (Ed). *Developing Materials for Language Teaching*. London, . New York: Continuum.
- Tomlinson, B. 1999. *Developing Criteria for Materials Evaluation*. IATEFL Issues, 147, 11. London, New York: Continuum.
- Tomlinson, B. 2003. *Developing Materials for Language Teaching*. London, (Ed). New York: Continuum.
- Tomlinson, B., & Masuhara., H. 2010. *Research for Materials Development in Language Learning*.(2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). London, New York: Continuum.
- Tomlinson, B. 2011. *Materials Development in Language Teaching*. (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). London, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Werner, P. K., & John P. N. 2007. *Mosaic 2 Grammar*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Young, D. J., 1999. *Affect in Foreign Language & Second Language Learning: A Practical Guide to Creating a Low-Anxiety Classroom Atmosphere*. USA: McGraw-Hill.
- Wala, D. A. S. 2003. A Coursebook is What It is because of What It has to Do: An Editor's Perspective. In Tomlinson, B. (Ed). *Developing Materials for Language Teaching*. London, . New York: Continuum.
- Widiati, U., Rohmah, Z., and Furaidah. (2016). *Bahasa Inggris (English Textbook)*. Jakarta: The Ministry of Education and Culture.
- Widyasari, Y. 2012. *The Evaluation of Making Sense of Functional Grammar as the Material in the Functional Grammar Course at the English Language Teaching Study Program of State University of Padang* (Thesis). UNP: English Department.