

WORD EXPRESSIONS OF AGREEMENT AND DISAGREEMENT USED BY THE STUDENTS IN SPEAKING CLASS

**(A Study at English Education Study Program of STKIP PGRI
Sumatera Barat)**

Muhammad Khairi Ikhsan¹

*English Education Study Program, STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat,
Padang- Indonesia*

ABSTRACT

This research is aimed at investigating word expressions of agreement and disagreement during group discussion activities in speaking class at English Education Department of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat. The word expressions were classified based on classification proposed by Rizvi (2005, p. 185). The classifications were *strong* and *neutral* (agreements and disagreements). The researcher used purposive sampling to answer the research questions. The researcher chose the students who expressed word expressions of agreement and disagreement in stating the opinion. In collecting the data the researcher did observation for each class by using observation checklist, field note and video recorder as instruments. The data were collected by the researcher and classified into the classifications. There were thirty five (35) students of English Education Department of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat who used word expressions of agreements and disagreements in stating their opinion in group discussion activities in speaking class. Thus, the two classifications of agreements and disagreements were variously found in the students' expressions.

Keywords: *agreement, disagreement, speaking.*

INTRODUCTION

Speaking is an important skill that should be considered by people when they do communication orally. Having a good skill and

¹ Corresponding author: khairi84ikhsan@gmail.com

comprehension in speaking will determine the success of a communication process. According to Richards and Renandya (2002, p. 214), speaking is an effective oral communication that requires the ability to use the language appropriately in social interactions. In line with this, Louma (2004, p. 9) defines speaking as an interaction, and speaking as a social and situation based-activity that is becoming part of daily life that is used by someone to develop a social interaction to other people. By speaking, someone can interact to other people to make good relationship in social life.

In teaching learning process, there are some activities that can be applied by the teacher to support teaching learning process in the classroom interaction. One of them is class group discussion. It is a group of individuals with similar interest who gather either formally or informally to bring up ideas, solve problems or give comments. In class group discussion, students can give arguments for another opinion. Students can also give opinions about something which students agree or disagree.

Class group discussion is an activity in teaching learning process that engages the students to be active in giving and rejecting the issue which is being discussed by some groups and try to resolve the problem. Class group discussion also makes students have a big opportunity to order the opinions, and courage to speak up in front of all. It is hoped that it can help the students when they are talking to their friends. Indeed, the goal is to get as many students involved in talking to one another as possible and for the teacher to fade into the background. Students will practice in how to talk to and listen to audiences, in how to address and look to authority figures for answering. However, students are not well versed in how to talk to and listen to each other, in how to navigate and negotiate and discuss issues of serious consequence and work toward answer among equals.

Furthermore, in giving opinion about the issues being discussed in the class group discussion, the students should be consistent to give opinion about the material that have been delivered by the another students. If some students want to give the opinion about the material, students should know the content of discussion. Besides, the students think what should be told to the audiences. The opinion should relate to the issues, so the opinion will get relationship with the issues. When the students give opinions to audiences about the issues, it will consist of parts. Thus, opinions can be agreement and disagreement. In class group

discussion, students need to talk about their opinion. The students can express opinion in using expression agreement and disagreement.

In expressing agreement and disagreement, the students should remember comprehension as an important underlying principle of wording of their thought. Agreement and disagreement are types of affirmation and denial in which the expression of judgment or opinion rather than the assertion of fact is involved. It is necessary not to offend standards of politeness when the other person's judgment is in question. Agreement expression is used to explain an agreement for an opinion and a fact. In expressing agreement, students can express something when agreeing with another opinion. Moreover, when a speaker talks about the issues to the audience, and one of the audiences agrees about that, she/he can express agreement. Meanwhile, when students do not agree about something, opinion, and fact, the students can express disagreement. It is called expression of disagreement.

Furthermore, in expressing agreement and disagreement in speaking class especially in class group discussion activity, there is a phenomenon that researcher found when the students are discussing in class group discussion. Based on the researcher's pre-observation in teaching speaking at the first year students of English Department in STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat, the students seldom use the word expressions like agreement and disagreement. In giving opinion, we need to talk the word expression for another opinion about the issue. Students do not only focus to make a new opinion, but also they have to give and reject another opinion. In expressing agreement and disagreement, the students express it by using two languages, which are English and Indonesian. The students do not express the word expressions by using English well, but they still need to express it by using Indonesian language.

Referring to the phenomenon above, it can be concluded that when we talk about class group discussion, opinion is important elements for class group discussion. Thus, in giving opinion, we need two parts. There are agreement expressions and disagreement expressions. Hence, in using those expressions, students know how to give opinion if they agree with another opinion and if they do not agree about another opinion. In addition, in using both of expression, the students can give and reject something, judgment, and opinion. Furthermore, it makes students think how to give good opinion related to previous ones, using agreement or disagreement. Students do not only talk about something, but they should think critically for agreeing or disagreeing the opinion delivered by other speakers.

Concerning with identification of the problem above, there are several problems that appear in speaking mainly in class group discussion activity. The problem of this research is limited into students' word expression of agreement and disagreement in class group discussion. The researcher only focuses on students' word expression of agreement and disagreement. The researcher did an observation on the first year students of academic year 2016/2017 at English Department of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat.

This research is aimed to know word expressions of agreement and disagreement commonly used in the class group discussion at the first year students at STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat in academic year 2016/2017 and to know classification of word expressions of agreement and disagreement in the class group discussion at the first year students of English department of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat in academic year 2016/2017.

The concept of discussion is obviously stated in this paper. Discussion is a process of finding thoughts, comments, ideas or opinion that are different from several people in doing communication. Discussion involves two parties audience and presenter. Audience and presenter should be considered in class group discussion as important participants to realize an effective conversation. . In class group discussion, the students should have an ability to present the material that will be delivered to audience and the presenter can manage audience and the discussion in the classroom. It means that the presenter and the audience are important thing in class group discussion. Moreover, Chapin and Chatering (2009, p. 21) state that group discussion is an activity where three to six students discuss some problems to give opinion about case. It means that group discussion is an activity in which some students discuss some problems or issue and share the ideas. They give an idea and opinion about the case; other students also give an opinion. In discussing, they state agreement or disagreement as their opinion. After they make opinion and state their agreement and disagreement about the issue, they will solve the problem about the issue.

Next, Rizvi (2010, p. 130) states that agreeing is an aspect of interaction in a team discussion. When you agree to someone or accept the suggestion and proposals given by other members, you should clearly express your agreement. It means that agreeing is needed to express expression that you accept opinion or suggestion in discussion. Agreeing is also important in class group discussion because it is an aspect of

interaction in giving opinion. The students need to express an agreement if they agree about opinion and suggestion in class group discussion.

Furthermore, Rizvi (2005, p. 185) argues there are many expressions that can be used by the students in class group discussion.

Strong Agreement	Neutral Agreement
I strongly agree	I agree
I quite agree	Yes
I completely agree	Of course
I am in complete agreement	Right
Of course, yes	That's true
Yes, certainly	You are right
Yes, definitely	OK
Exactly	That's fine
Precisely	I think you are right

From the explanation above, it can be said that expression agreement does not only use the word 'I agree with you', but many words and phrases can be used by the students in class group discussion like the phrases and words above. Expression agreement is also define for two parts which are strong agreement and neutral agreement.

Furthermore, Kistono et al. (2006, p. 22) propose that expression of agreement consists of five expressions. These are below:

I agree with you
I go along with you
You are right
I think so, too
It is true

It can be concluded that there are five expressions that can be used by the students in group discussion activities of speaking class. It is not also words but also phrases. The students can use variety of expression of agreement for accepting something, judgments, and opinions. Briefly, the students can use various expressions of agreement and disagreements in speaking English.

Tukan (2006, p. 69) states that there are some expressions of agreement that can be used by the students if they want to give or accept

opinion and facts. There are “*saya setuju dengan pendapat saudara, saya sependapat dengan saudara, pendapat saudara pantas kita terima, benar sekali pendapat saudara, and saya sangat setuju sekali dengan pendapat saudara.*” There are some sentences to express expressions of agreement in class group discussion on Indonesian language. It means that, some varieties sentences can be used by the students for agreeing something opinion or facts. The students use the sentences of agreement to state it. The word expressions above, it is like statement to giving opinion. It seems like word expressions even though statements.

In line with the previous statement, Iragiliati et al. (2009, p. 39) there are some expressions of agreement which should the students know. There are *I agree with you, it is fine with me, and you are right.* It means that the students should know three of the expression agreement that always be used by them in class group discussion. Three of the expression agreements are generally.

Next, Rizvi (2010, p. 130) states that disagreeing is aspects of interaction in a team discussion. When you do not agree to someone or rejecting the suggestion and proposals given by other members, you should clearly express your disagreement. It means that the students need to talk expression of disagreement for rejecting someone’s opinion or rejecting suggestion in class group discussion. Expression of disagreement included aspect of interaction.

Next, Rizvi (2005, p. 186) states there are many expressions that students can use in class group discussion.

Strong Disagreement	Neutral Disagreement
I strongly disagree	I disagree
I disagree completely	I don’t agree
This is totally unacceptable	No
That is out of question	That’s not true
Definitely not	That’s not right
Of course not	I think you are mistaken

It can be stated that expression of disagreement can be expressed with many words and phrases, not only by using word ‘disagree’ but also by using words and phrases above. Students also develop their idea by using the words and phrases to express disagreement about the others’ opinion in class group discussion. Moreover, Kistono (2006, p. 22)

argues that there are several expression of disagreement used by students in class group discussion.

I do not agree with you
I disagree
You are wrong
I do not go along with you
I do not think so

It means that, five expressions of disagreement above can be used by the students for rejecting something, judgment, and opinion in class group discussion as learning activity. If the students do not agree with other opinion in class group discussion, they can express it by those expressions. By knowing those expression, the students know how to reject something or opinion. The students do not only accept other opinion, but also reject opinion.

Tukan (2006, p. 69) said that people can use the expressions to reject an opinion politely directly. Some word expressions are “*saya menolak pendapat saudara, saya tidak setuju dengan pendapat saudara, saya sangat tidak setuju sekali dengan pendapat saudara, pendapat saudara pantas ditolak, pendapat saudara kita pertimbangkan, saya kurang sependapat dengan saudara, and saya kurang setuju dengan saudara.*” There are some sentences such as those above to express disagreement in class group discussion in Indonesian language. It can be said if you want to reject opinion or facts, but you are confused to state that, you can use the sentences shown above. It can be polite you reject something by using the disagreement sentences. It is used to reject something politely directly

Meanwhile, Iragiliati et al. (2009, p. 39) argue that there are some expressions of disagreement that students know. Those are I do not think so, I cannot agree with you on that, and I refuse your idea. It can be said three expression disagreements above are generally what students know. The students should know general disagreement statement. It also creates an effective communication in class group discussion, so that it makes a relation with others’ viewpoints.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study employed descriptive qualitative approach, because the researcher tried to analyze word expressions of agreement and

disagreement during class group discussion at the first year students of English Department of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat in academic year 2016/2017. According to Gay and Airisian (2000, p. 275), descriptive research is used to investigate the variety of educational problems and issues. In this research, to answer the research question, the researcher analyzed word expressions of agreement and disagreement at the first year students of English Department of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat in academic year 2016/2017.

Thus, participants of this research were the first year English students of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat in academic year 2016/2017 taking speaking class adopting group discussion activity over the teaching and learning process. In this research, the researcher did not analyze all of the participants at English Department of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat. The researcher only chose the participants by using “Purposive Sampling”. According to Lufri (2002, p. 86) purposive sampling is sample purposefully chosen based on certain characteristics needed in research. Furthermore, the researcher chose the participants as needed.

In this case, researcher observed the students who only gave word expressions of agreement and disagreement in class group discussion in four classes (Class A, B, C, and D) comprising the third year students of English Department in academic year 2015/2016. The researcher chose the students who expressed word expressions in speaking class especially in group discussion activity.

Instrument can be said as a tool that the researcher needs for collecting data in a research. Gay and Airasian (2000, p. 145) said that “instrument is a tool or something that is used to collect the data. In this research, the researcher used observation checklist and field note to collect the data. According to Creswell (2012, p. 213), observation is the process of gathering open-ended, firsthand information by observing people and places at a research site.

Creswell (2012, p. 217) states that observation checklist consists of some questions. The questions on this checklist roughly represent the order in which you might consider them before, during, and after the observation. Word expressions of agreement and disagreement are shown in Figure 1 below:

SUB INDICATORS	
Strong	Neutral
1. I strongly agree	1. I agree

<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. I quite agree 3. I completely agree 4. I am in complete agreement 5. Of course, yes 6. Yes, certainly 7. Yes, definitely 8. Exactly 9. Precisely 10. Indeed 11. Obviously 12. Sure 13. <i>Saya sangat setuju sekali dengan pendapat saudara</i> 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Yes 3. Of course 4. Right 5. That's true 6. You are right 7. Ok 8. That's fine 9. I think you are right 10. I agree with you 11. I go along with you 12. I think so, too 13. That's right 14. <i>Saya setuju dengan pendapat saudara</i> 15. <i>Saya sependapat dengan saudara</i> 16. <i>Pendapat saudara pantas kita terima</i> 17. <i>Benar sekali pendapat saudara</i>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. I strongly disagree 2. I disagree completely 3. This is totally unacceptable 4. That is out of question 5. Definitely not 6. Of course not 7. Certainly not 8. What do you mean? 9. Nonsense 10. <i>Saya sangat tidak setuju dengan pendapat saudara</i> 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. I disagree 2. I don't agree 3. No 4. That's not true 5. That's not right 6. I think you are mistaken 7. I don't agree with you 8. You are wrong 9. I don't go along with you 10. I don't think so 11. I don't know 12. <i>Saya menolak pendapat saudara</i> 13. <i>Saya tidak setuju dengan pendapat saudara</i> 14. <i>Pendapat saudara pantas ditolak</i> 15. <i>Pendapat saudara kita pertimbangkan</i> 16. <i>Saya kurang sependapat dengan saudara</i> 17. <i>Saya kurang setuju dengan saudara</i>

Figure 1. Indicators of Word Expression

According to Ary (2010, p. 435) field note is the most common method of recording the data collected during observation. The researcher made a brief notes during the observation.

Field Note Form

Day of Observation :
Date of Observation :
Class which is being observed :
Subject which is being observed :

N O	NOTES
	<hr/> <hr/> <hr/> <hr/> <hr/> <hr/> <hr/>

Figure 2. Field Note Form

In addition, the researcher used field note to make a note related to the students' use of the word expression of agreement and disagreement in class group discussion, meanwhile, the researcher also used video recording to record all activities in class group discussion. During taking a field note about the activities, the researcher also recorded it, so that the researcher got the information about the students who had expressed word expressions of agreement and disagreement.

In gathering the data, the researcher did some steps for this research. First, the researcher prepared some tools for observation, such as observation checklist, field note and video recording. Second, the researcher came to the classroom which had different subjects, namely Cross Cultural Understanding and Research II, and observed students who had expressed the expressions of agreement and disagreement by video recording. Third, during the observation process the researcher did observation checklist, note taking for all of group discussion activities, and also for students who gave word expressions. The researcher made sure that he got all of information related to the expressions of agreement

and disagreement in the class group discussion. Finally, the researcher analyzed it by applying techniques of data analysis proposed by Gay and Airasian. The result helped the researcher describe how the first year English students of STKIP PGRI in West Sumatra in the academic year of 2016/2017 used word expressions of agreement and disagreement in speaking class especially during group discussion activity.

After collecting the data, the researcher analyzed it. The data analysis was conducted based on the techniques of analyzing qualitative data research by Gay and Airasian (2000, p. 239). They state that there are four steps in analyzing the data of the research, namely reading/memoing, describing, classifying, and interpreting. The descriptions about those steps are:

- a. Reading: find a quiet place and plan on reading for a few hours at the time during the initial reading of the data. In this step, researcher read the field note and observation checklist, and then heard video recording.
- b. Describing: to provide a true picture of the settings and events that take place in it so the researcher and the reader will have an understanding of the context in which the study takes place. It is also important for participants' actions and understanding. In this time, the researcher described the third year students' word expressions of agreement and disagreement in the class group discussion after the researcher read the result of observation. The researcher described each participant who used word expressions.
- c. Classifying: to categorize the ideas or concepts. The researcher classified the data by looking at the result of field note and video recording and the researcher categorized them based on the word expressions of agreement and disagreement in the class group discussion explained by experts. It means that the researcher categorized based on the expressions of agreement and disagreement.
- d. Interpreting: to interpret and synthesize the organized data into general understanding. After the researcher got the data, the researcher interpreted it based on the students' word expressions of agreement and disagreement employed during class group discussion.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

In this section, the researcher described the finding of this study. There were 23 participants who used word expressions of agreement and

13 participants who employed word expressions of disagreement after the researcher observed their classes when they gave opinion and give affirmation and denial over the class group discussion. The students' code who stated word expressions of agreement and disagreement can be seen below:

Word Expressions	Agreement	Disagreement
The Students' Code	1,3,5,26,31,10,27,11,19,24,4,7,8,12,20,21,23,25,28,14,16,18,2	15,31,6,9,10,17,22,30,13,24,19,29

From the data above the researcher analyzed that from the first observation, the second observation, and the third observation in those classes there were two classifications and two languages which were English and Indonesian languages in every word expression. It can be seen from the figure below:

No	Word Expressions of Agreement	
	Strong Agreement	Neutral Agreement
1	Saya sangat setuju dengan pendapat saudara	I agree
2		Of course
3		I agree with you
4		Saya setuju dengan pendapat saudara
5		Saya sependapat dengan saudara

No	Word Expressions of Disagreement	
	Strong Disagreement	Neutral Disagreement
1	Saya sangat tidak setuju dengan pendapat saudara	I disagree
2		I do not agree
3		I do not agree with you

4		Saya tidak setuju dengan pendapat saudara
5		Saya kurang setuju dengan pendapat saudara

Based on the figures above the researcher analyzed that data found two classifications for every word expressions. The first word expressions of agreement consisted of two classifications which were strong agreement and neutral disagreement. The second word expressions of disagreement consisted of two classifications, namely strong disagreement and neutral disagreement. On the other hand, some students expressed agreement and disagreement by using Indonesian language.

However, by looking at observation checklist and field note in three observations in three weeks, the researcher concluded that the students' word expressions of agreement commonly used in the class group discussion were *saya sangat tidak setuju dengan pendapat saudara, I agree, of course, I agree with you, saya setuju dengan pendapat saudara, saya sependapat dengan saudara*. Then, the students' word expressions of disagreement commonly used in the class group discussion were *saya sangat tidak setuju dengan pendapat saudara, I disagree, I do not agree, I do not agree with you, saya tidak setuju dengan pendapat saudara, saya kurang sependapat dengan saudara*.

After the researcher analyzed and found all the opinion which had agreement and disagreement expressions delivered by the participants, he concluded that the students used word expressions of agreement and disagreement in stating their own opinion in the class group discussion. They delivered an opinion and also made an affirmation or denial toward judgment or opinion in the class group discussion, even though they still used both English and Indonesian languages to express the agreement and disagreement expressions. Such expressions delivered by the participants had two classifications based on the observation data. The researcher divided the word expressions of agreement and disagreement into strong and neutral.

There were some students who cannot speak English yet to express agreement and disagreement in stating an opinion in the class group discussion. They started the opinion by using such expressions, but at the same time they still used Indonesian language to express that. Thus, the first year students of English Department of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat in the academic year of 2016/2017 were still confused to use

English language in class group discussion. It can be seen only from simple an activity, which is to state opinion in class group discussion. Based on the theory in Chapter two, many word expressions of agreement and disagreement can be used by students to express giving and rejecting an opinion, but the students did not apply it in stating an opinion in class group discussion.

Furthermore, the students also did not know varieties of word expressions of agreement and disagreement. Most of them mentioned the same word expressions in class group discussion. It is because the students seldom expressed word expressions of agreement and disagreement in English language. The students just memorized the word expressions of agreement and disagreement in English without applying it in class group discussion. On the other side, the first year students of English Department of STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat 2016/2017 academic year were not used to speaking English fully in classroom. For them, speaking English is not a habit, and thus it has a negative impact on their command of English.

CONCLUSION

In this part, the researcher will give the conclusion of this research. Based on the pre observation done and discussed by the researcher, he saw the phenomena related to the students who delivered their opinion during class group discussion. Based on the phenomena, the researcher wanted to know the word expressions of agreement and disagreement commonly used in the class group discussion and classifications of such expressions commonly used by the students over the class group discussion. . To know those word expressions and classifications, the researcher constructed a research question. In answering the research question, the researcher used observation.

To analyze the data, the researcher read the students' opinion containing agreement and disagreement expressions. Then, the researcher classified the expressions into the classification proposed in chapter two. After that, the researcher found the participants who used agreement and disagreement expressions. The researcher concluded that the word expressions of agreement and disagreement are divided into two classifications. First the students used the word expressions to convey strong agreement or disagreement in class group discussion. Second the students employed neutral agreement and disagreement in class group discussion.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A special thank and appreciation from the deepest of heart are delivered to the head of English Department- Armilia Riza, M. Pd and the secretary-Mayuasti, M. Pd for giving the researcher a clear-sighted help and constructive feedback for this research. Furthermore, a special thank is also delivered to the students who have kindly helped the researcher, for being participants of this research. Above all, thanks for all who have given the researcher much contributions so that this research can be obviously conducted.

REFERENCES

- Ary, Donald et al. (2010). *Introduction to Research in Education* (8thed). Belmont: Wadsworth, Cengage Learning.
- Buehl, Doug. (2009). *Classroom Strategies for Interactive Learning*. Newark: International Reading Association Inc.
- Chapin, H., & Chatering. (2009). *Classroom Discussions Using Math Talk to Help Students Learn*. California: Math Solutions.
- Cox, Nicholas. (2004). *Speaking Stata: Graphing Agreement and Disagreement*. Stata Press Production Manager.
- Creswell, Jhon W. (2009). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches*. New York: Cambridge University.
- Creswell, John W. (2012). *Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Qualitative and Quantitative Research* (4thed). Boston: Pearson Education.
- Cutting, Joan. (2000). *Analysing the Language of Discourse Communities*. London: ESLSEVEIR SCIENCE Ltd.
- Dawes, Lyn. (2012). *Talking Points Discussion Activities in the Primary Classroom*. New York: Routledge.
- Eiser, Richard. (2001). *Attitude, Cognition, and Social Behavior*. New York: Press Syndicate of University Cambridge.
- Gay, L. R., & Airasian, P. (2000). *Educational Research Competences for Analysis and Application*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall Inc.
- Iragiliati, Emalia et al. (2009). *Interactive English 2 Junior High School Grade VIII*. Jakarta: PT Ghalia Indonesia Printing.
- Johnson, J. (2006) *Agreement and Disagreement: A Cross-Cultural Comparison*. BISAL.
- Kattan, Juan and Christopher J. Pountain. (2003). *Modern Spanish Grammar A Practical Guide*. London: Routledge.

- Kistono et al. (2006). *The Bridge English Competence for SMP Grade VII*. Indonesia: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Louma, Sari. (2004). *Assessing Speaking*. New York: Cambridge University Press, Print
- Lufri. (2002). *Kiat Memahami Metodologi dan Melakukan Penelitian*. Padang. UNP Press.
- Mehu, Marc (2009). *Spotting agreement and Disagreement: A survey of Nonverbal Audio visual Cues and Tools*. IEEE.
- Mey, Jacob L. (2001). *An Intduction* (2nded). Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Pheat, Sean Mc. (2010). *Advance Communication Skill*. Mtd Training and Ventus Publishing Aps.
- Richard, Jack C., and Willy A Renandya (2002). *Methodology in Language Teaching: An Anthology of Current Practice*. New York: Cambridge University Press, Print.
- Rizvi, Ashraf. (2005). *Effective Technical Communication*. India: Tata McGraw-Hill Publishing Company Limited.
- Rizvi, Ashraf. (2010). *Communication for Retail Professional*. India: Tata McGraw-Hill Publishing Company Limited.
- Shafer, Russ. (2015). *Oxford Studies in Meta ethics*. United Kingdom: Oxford University Press.
- Sutisna, Yayang. (2014). *An analysis of Argumentation Level in Class Group Discussion*. Padang: Unpublished Thesis.