

Audio-Visual Translation: Subtitling and Dubbing Technique - Movie Soundtrack in *Frozen: Let it Go*

Moh.Supardi¹, Dea Amanda Putri²

Abstract

*This article aims to find out the technique of subtitle and dubbing translation in OST *Frozen: Let it Go*. The data are analyzed qualitatively by using the subtitle translation techniques. The data collection is conducted through reading source language and target language, selecting and comparing the translation techniques done by the translator/dubber, marking, classifying and analyzing them based on the theories of translation technique proposed by Molina and Albir. Accordingly, the subtitle technique is frequently encountered on the movie, awards show, and foreign language speech broadcast live. While dubbing technique or known as voice-over technique is done by filling out the actors' and actresses' voice. Through this technique, the audience can enjoy the storyboard of an audio-visual display without looking at the text that is underneath. However, the audience could not know the real voice of the actors and actresses. The result shows the subtitle techniques done by the translator consist of eleven techniques. Based on the analysis of the translation process translated from the lyrics into the subtitled version, the translator seems to use most of the technique. While the translator only uses nine techniques in translating the lyrics into the dubbed version. In general, the translator's technique applied in the subtitled version is the most literal translation; While the dubbed version's most common techniques are modulation and reduction.*

Keyword: Translation, Translation Technique, Subtitle, Dubbing

Abstrak

*Artikel ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui teknik penerjemahan subtitle dan dubbing dalam OST *Frozen: Let It Go*. Data dianalisis secara kualitatif dengan menggunakan teknik penerjemahan subtitle dan dubbing. Pengumpulan data dilakukan dengan membaca bahasa sumber dan bahasa target, memilih dan membandingkan teknik penerjemahan yang dilakukan oleh penerjemah, menandai, mengklasifikasi dan menganalisisnya berdasarkan teknik penerjemahan yang diajukan oleh Molina dan Albir. Teknik penerjemahan subtitle banyak dijumpai dalam film, acara penghargaan, dan pidato bahasa asing. Sedangkan teknik dubbing atau dikenal dengan teknik voice-over dilakukan dengan mengganti suara aktor dan aktris. Melalui teknik ini, penonton dapat menikmati jalannya cerita tanpa banyak melihat teks yang ada di bawah layar. Namun demikian, penonton tidak dapat mengetahui suara siapa yang sebenarnya. Hasil dari penelitian menunjukkan bahwa teknik subtitle yang dilakukan oleh penerjemah terdiri dari sebelas teknik. Berdasarkan analisis penerjemahan subtitle, penerjemah tampaknya sering menggunakan teknik penerjemahan subtitle. Sedangkan penerjemahan suara (voice over) hanya menggunakan sembilan teknik. Secara umum, teknik penerjemah yang diterapkan pada penerjemahan subtitle adalah penerjemahan literal; Sedangkan teknik penerjemahan suara yang paling sering digunakan adalah teknik modulasi dan reduksi.*

Kata Kunci: Penerjemahan, Teknik Penerjemahan, Subtitle, Dubbing

¹English Letters and Humanities UIN Jakarta, Email : Moh.supardi@uinjkt.ac.id

²English Letters and Humanities UIN Jakarta, Email : deaamanda.puti13@mhs.uinjkt.ac.id

A. Introduction

The researchers discuss the translation technique used in translating the lyrics of movie soundtrack in *Frozen-Let It Go*. The purpose of research is to analyze the translation technique of the song featured by Idina Menzel, the singer of United States that serves as the Queen of Elsa. It is considered important to be analyzed in order to find out how the the translator translate the subtitle and dubbing movie from English into Indonesia. A translation product may be very different from the source language culture, image, beauty, that can distract readers to understand the translation. Therefore, it is important to find out the result of the translation of the dubbing and subtitle film soundtrack in *Let It Go*.

Generally, the term audiovisual translation around 20 years ago brought to the forefront the multisemiotic dimension of all broadcast programs (TV, cinema, radio, DVD). The purpose of translation is to reproduce the various types of text, including literary text, scientific, and philosophical texts. Hatim and Munday³ says that translation is an incredibly broad nation which can be understood in many different ways. For example, one may talk of translation as a process or a product, and identify such sub-types the U.S. literary translation, technical translation, subtitle, and machine translation. Moreover, while more typically speaking, it just refers to the transfer of written texts, the term sometimes also includes interpreting.⁴

There are two techniques used in audiovisual translation,

³Basil Hatim and Jeremy Munday, *Translation: An Advanced Resource Book* (New York: Routledge, 2004).

⁴Jeremy Munday, *Introducing Translation Studies: Theories and Applications*. (New York: Routledge, 2016), 3–4.

dubbing technique (voiceover) and subtitle technique (text translation). According to Czech Scholar P. Reich the translation for dubbing is not the final product which will be offered to the audience, it is “a half-finished product” which requires further work.⁵ In Indonesia, the dubbing technique is often used in drama, *telenovela*, movie cartoons (anime), and soap operas. Subtitle technique is frequently encountered on the movie, awards show, and foreign language speech broadcast live. Dubbing technique or known as voice-over technique is done by filling out the actors’ and actresses’ voice. Narration is an extended voice-over which is characterized by formal grammar structures or even use of several voices.⁶ Through this technique, the audience can enjoy the storyboard of an audio-visual display without looking at the text that is underneath. However, the audience could not know the real voice of the actors and actresses. The dubbing technique costs a considerable cost because it should pay the amount in accordance with the number of character in the display. Machining time of this technique are also relatively long because it has to go through some process that is the translation of the text of the source language into the target language, refinement of the translation result then the next step is looking for a voice that has a character similar to the original sound.⁷

⁵P. Reich, “Reich, P., 2006. The Film And the Book in Translation. [Online] Available at [Http://Is.Muni.Cz/Th/64544/Ff_m/Diplomova_prace.Pdf](http://Is.Muni.Cz/Th/64544/Ff_m/Diplomova_prace.Pdf) [Accessed 5 October 2014].,” 2006,

⁶G. Mack, Mack, G., 2001. *Conference Interpreting on the Air: Live Simultaneous Interpreting on Italian Television*, Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Co., Pp.125–132. (Amsterdam: John Benjamins publishing co., 2001), 156.

⁷DJ Bogucki, Redekopp L.G, and Barth J,

Subtitle technique (text translation) shows the translation text of the spoken dialogue. Díaz Cintas in Bartolome and Cabrera⁸ says that in general, the subtitle translation is a technique that displaying the written text on the screen to convey dialogues alerts, as well as other materials such as recessional lyrics. Subtitles are described by the same author as “mostly condensed translations of original dialogue (or on-screen text) which appear as lines of text usually positioned towards the foot of the screen. Subtitling involves displaying written text, giving an account of the actors’ dialogue and other linguistic information which form part of the visual image or the soundtrack.⁹ The subtitles appear and disappear in time with the corresponding portion of original dialogue or text. Some subtitles are ‘reduced’ or they can be bilingual. Subtitles are displayed should not cover the entire screen and should appear when a word is spoken. Therefore, this technique provides enough challenge for the translator. For some people, watching the audio-visual impressions that use text translation felt quite disturbing because their concentration was split between seeing the show on screen or read subtitles underneath. For the learners of foreign languages text

“Internal Solitary Waves in the Coastal Mixing and Optics 1996 Experiment: Multimodal Structure and Resuspension J. Geophys,” 2005, 70.

⁸A.I.H. Bartolomé, and G.M. Cabrera, “New Trends in Audiovisual Translation: The Latest Challenging Modes,” *A Journal of English and American Studies*, no. 31 (2005): 94.

⁹Jorge Díaz Cintas, *Díaz Cintas, Jorge. (2006). Audiovisual Translation in the Third Millennium. In: Anderman, G. & Rogers, M. (Eds) Translation Today: Trends and Perspectives. Beijing: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press. 192-204* (Beijing: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press., 2006), 192–204.

translation useful techniques to improve your ability to understand the language being studied because of the dialogue may be found in the words which do not have studied in class. In addition, the translation text also gives room for the learner to be able to learn the force (expression) the pronunciation of the spoken dialogue so that when foreign language, their speech is not rigid even tend to be similar to the native speakers of that language.

The assumption that one text language in a language is not possibly fully translated into the target language text translation is caused by the process began of finding meaning to meaning (parallel) then look for the relevant linguistic form in the source language and target language. When there is no relevant linguistic form between the source language and the target language, then one source language or target language are being added and some of the vocabularies must be reduced. Generally, they have the same idea to make a clear definition of translation. According to Newmark¹⁰: “Translation is rendering the meaning of a text into another language in the way that the author intended the text.” Translation sometimes involves some kinds of loss of meaning due to a number of factors. So, a good translation is not only seen from the changes in language, but also the transfer of meaning.

Translation is an activity shifted in writing text messages from one language to another language text¹¹. According to Catford¹², minimal

¹⁰Peter Newmark, *A Textbook of Translation. London: Prentice Hall.* (London: Prentice Hall Print, 1988), 5.

¹¹Benny H. Hood, *Linguistik, Semiotik, Dan Kebudayaan Kita*, 1992, 54.

¹²J.C. Catford, *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*

translation includes two languages. It is further stated that the translation of Catford is the transfer of textual material in one language (the source language) with the textual material that is worth in another language (target language). The same with Larson that the forms of redirection include translation, i.e. the form in the source language is replaced with a form of the language target or the target language.

According to Nida and Taber (1982: 12): "Translation consists in reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of the SL message, first in terms of meaning and secondly in terms of style."¹³ So, the translation is not only the transfer of the closest meaning from the source language into the target language text, but it is also should concern about the style of the language itself.

In analyzing the translation of subtitle and dubbing, the method used in this research were conducted in several steps, such as analyzing the translation procedures, strategies, and method. The data are analyzed by using the translation strategies of subtitle and dubbing, translation procedure, and method proposed by translation scholars, such as Molina and Albir. The purpose is to find out better analysis and to enhance the quality of the subtitle and dubbing translation. The method used in this article consists of analyzing the results of subtitle and dubbing translation. Next, by comparing the translation techniques used in dubbing and subtitle of *Let It Go* song lyrics produced by Disney 2013 as the Original Soundtrack written by Kristen Anderson-Lopez and

(London: Oxford University Press., 1965), 20.

¹³Eugene A Nida; Charles Russell Taber, *The Theory and Practice of Translation* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1982), 12.

Robert Lopez and sung by Idina Menzel. Therefore, this article is to identify the translation techniques applied by the translator in translating the source language into the target language in the form of subtitle and dubbing in OST *Frozen: Let it Go*. This article is expected to help the viewers as well as readers who are interested in subtitle and dubbing translation. Besides, it is also expected to provide an academic analysis of audio-visual translation for common viewers.

B. Discussion

Based on the data analysis, there are several techniques done by the translator in translating the song lyric/ soundtrack film *Let It Go*. Among of the translation techniques found in the subtitle and dubbing translation of *Let It Go* are, adaptation, calque, description, discursive creation, established equivalent, generalization, Linguistics Amplification, Linguistics Compression, Literal Translation, Modulation, Particularization, Reduction, Substitution, Transposition, Variation, Deletion

Audio-visual translation, such as film and other screen translation can be a complicated process.¹⁴ Subtitling and dubbing are the most common forms. A third option, voice-over translation, involves one or more actor voices that are recorded over the original soundtrack, which can still be heard in the background. Perhaps stemming from the use of Benshi performers in Japan, who narrated and acted out

¹⁴N. Remiere, "Are You 'Lost in Translation' (When Watching a Foreign Film)? Towards an Alternative Approach to Judging Audiovisual Translation. *Australian Journal of French Studies*" 1, no. 47 (2010): 100–115, <https://doi.org/10.3828/AJFS.47.1.100>.

dialogue during the silent film era, voice-over translation is used worldwide for documentary and news content. For example, the traditional method of AVT in Poland is the use of a single *lektor*, a (usually male) voice-over performer who provides the translation of all characters' dialogue, spoken over the film's soundtrack.¹⁵

Subtitling is not only a translation between languages but also between modes of communication--from the spoken word to the written word. Subtitling also presents difficulties in time and space constraints that limit how much can be said. Subtitling often excludes phrases or entire sentences and the most exact translation is frequently ignored for a more concise translation. There are parallel problems in dubbing. The main issue with dubbing is synchronization, where the translation is matched to the movements, both lip and gestures, of the original visual work. Phrases are reworded to match the movements better, but perhaps not to better match the meaning of the original.¹⁶

There are numerous critical translation issues relevant to both subtitling and dubbing. Word choice can be tricky, especially if there is no equivalent in the target language, resulting in the original word being left intact and causing audience confusion.¹⁷ Often, with comedies, especially humor

that relies on puns or plays on words, the punchline is difficult to understand by the foreign audience, and the film may lose its original appeal without careful analysis during translation.¹⁸ Other genres present similar difficulties, such as science fiction and musicals or music biographies. Translators of the original television show *Star Trek* faced many difficulties translating novel words created for the show. They even had difficulties portraying various aspects of the characters, causing them on occasion to seem racist, chauvinistic, or just plain rude.¹⁹ Translating the film *8 Mile* presented problems that were handled in a unique fashion. For the rap sequences presented in the film, Warner Bros. had famous rappers in the target language rewrite the lyrics to the original message was understood.²⁰

Other less obvious issues have also been studied. Most of the time, an off-screen dialogue is not translated. Dastjerdi and Jazini²¹ argue that by not translating this material, the target audience does not enjoy the film as much as they would if this dialogue were translated. The "realness" of the translated dialogue is called into

¹⁸R. Antonini, "The Perception of Subtitled Humor in Italy" 2, no. 18 (February 18, 2005): 209-225., <https://doi.org/10.1515>.

¹⁹C. Caron, "Translating *Trek*: Rewriting an American Icon in a Francophone Context," *Journal of American Culture* 26, no. 3 (2003): 329-55, <https://doi.org/10.1111/1542-734X.00095>.

²⁰K. Taivalkoski-Shilov, "Subtitling *8 Mile* in Three Languages: Translation Problems and Translator Licence.," *International Journal on Translation* 2, no. 20 (2008): 249-74.

²¹H.V. Dastjerdi and Jaini A., "Killing Two Birds with One Stone: Translation of the Unseen and off-Camera Speech and Sounds in English Movies Subtitled into Persian.," *Journal of International Social Research* 4, no. 19 (2011): 60-77.

¹⁵K. Sepielak and A. Matlama, "Sepielak, K., & Matamala, A. (2014). Synchrony in the Voice-over of Polish Fiction Genres. *Babel*, 60, 145-163." 60 (2014): 145-63.

¹⁶Y. Chuang, "Studying Subtitle Translation from a Multi-Modal Approach." 4, no. 52 (2006): 372-83.

¹⁷T. Schroter, "Schroter, T. (2003). Quantity and Quality in Screen Translation. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 11(2), 105-124." 2, no. 11 (2003): 105-24.

question, in both dubbing and subtitling. Howell²² investigates the differences between several subtitled versions of various Japanese anime films. The differences between the English subtitles available to the Japanese market and to the American market vary drastically in dialogue. The versions available to the Japanese market use subtitles that are written in proper English that fail to convey anything other than dialogue. The English versions, done by well-known translators, use more colloquial phrasings, which help convey character relationships and backgrounds. González-Iglesias and Toda²³ argue that dubbing better illustrates background information about characters that can only be derived from their accents. Both Matamala²⁴ and Pavesi²⁵ have compared broadcast translations of various films to the original script or the translated script. Pavesi goes a step further and compares them to natural, spoken language. Pavesi concludes that neither the original nor the translation perfectly imitate spoken language, but both come close. Matamala examines the various changes and losses incurred during the dubbing process. Zilberdik²⁶ argues that some bad translations should

²²P. Howell, "Character Voice in Anime Subtitles. Perspectives: Studies in Translatology" 4, no. 14 (2006): 292–305.

²³J.D Iglesias González and Toda F., "Dubbing or Subtitling Interculturalism: Choices and Constraints. Journal of Intercultural Communication" 2, no. 27 (2011).

²⁴A. Matlama, "Translations for Dubbing as Dynamic Texts: Strategies in Film Synchronization." 2, no. 56 (2010): 101–18, <https://doi.org/10.1075/babel.56.2.01mat>.

²⁵M. Pavesi, "Pronouns in Film Dubbing and the Dynamics of Audiovisual Communication.," *Vigo International Journal of Applied Linguistic* 6 (2009): 89–107.

²⁶N.J. Zilberdik, "Relay Translation in Subtitling. Perspectives: Studies in Translatology" 1, no. 12 (2004): 31–55.

not be attributed to the translation itself, but to the act of relay translation, the translating of a translation instead of the original.

The translation technique that replaces the cultural elements of a type in the SL with cultural elements that exist within the TL is called adaptation. This technique can be used if the element or elements of those cultures have equivalents in the TL. SL: *His leg felt like a stone* - TL: *Tungkai kakinya seperti terpaku*. The common techniques applied in the activity of translation is called application or addition. The addition of that question is the addition of information that basically does not exist in the source sentence. The presence of additional information in the target sentence is intended to further clarify the concept conveyed the original authors to readers. In addition, this technique is only the information that is used to assist in delivering the message or the understanding of the reader. These additions may not modify messages in the source language. SL: *He came late* - TL: *Pria muda itu datang terlambat*.

Translation technique uses borrowing words or phrases to translate the source language into the target language. Borrowing can be a pure borrowing, borrowing without making any changes, for example, is the word "zig-zag", or in the form of a natural borrowing (naturalized borrowing), where the words of the SL was matched with the spelling of the TL, as the word "musik" which comes from the word "music".

Calque is a literal translation of a word or phrase in translating the source language into the target language. SL: *He is the new assistant manager* - TL: *Dia adalah asisten manajer yang*

baru. While compensation translation technique replaces the item information or position effects in the SL in other parts in the TL because it cannot be realized in the same section in the SL. For example, SL: *A burning desire to share The Secret with the world consumed me.* - TL: *Hasrat yang menyala-nyala untuk membagikan Rahasia kepada dunia membakar diri saya.*

The description is a translation technique that replaces the term in the source language with the description in the target language. This technique is used when a term in the source language does not have a term in the target language. SL: I like panetton. - TL: *Saya suka panetton, kue tradisional Italia yang dimakan pada saat tahun baru.*

Discursive Creation is the use of equivalent translation techniques while away from their original context. These techniques often appear in the translation of titles of movies, books, and novels. SL: The Minangkabau Response to the Dutch Colonial rule in the Nineteenth Century. - TL: *Asal-usul Elite Minangkabau Modem: Respons terhadap Kolonial Belanda XIX/XX.*

Established Equivalence is translation terms in the source language term that is already prevalent in the target language. The term in the source language is generally based on a dictionary or phrase daily. SL: Sincerely yours - TL: *Hormat kami.*

Generalization is a translation term with the term that is already known well in public and known to the wider community. This technique is used when a term in the source language refers to a specific section, which parallels in the target language that does not exist and refers to the same section. For example, *becak* translated to *the vehicle*.

Linguistics Amplification is technique that adds elements of Linguistics from SL into the TL. This technique is often used in interpreting or dubbing. SL: *everything is up to you!* - TL: *semuanya terserah anda sendiri!*

Linguistics Compression is a technique that unites or collects the linguistic elements that exist in the SL. This technique is often used in interpreting or dubbing. SL: Are you sleepy? - TL: *ngantuk?*

Literal Translation is the translation technique to divert an expression in SL in the word of the word into the TL. SL: The President gave the present to Michael last week. - TL: *Presiden memberi hadiah itu pada Michael minggu lalu.*

Modulation is a translation technique that replaces focus, the point of view or the cognitive aspect that exists in the SL, either lexical or structural. SL: *Nobody doesn't like it.* - TL: *Semua orang menyukainya.*

Particularization is translation technique that uses the term that is more concrete and specific. The technique contrasts with the technique of generalization. SL: *She likes to collect jewelry.* - TL: *Dia senang mengoleksi kalung emas.*

Reduction is condensing the information contained in the source language into the target language. Compacting of information should not alter the text of the message in the source language. SL: *She got a car accident* - TL: *Dia mengalami kecelakaan.*

Substitution is replacing the linguistic elements into paralinguistic (such as intonation and gesture) or vice versa. For example, nodding head in Indonesia translated "Yes!"

Transposition is a translation technique that replaces the grammatical categories of the source language into the target language, for example replacing the words to become phrases. This technique is usually used because of a different grammar between SL and TL. SL: *I have no control over this condition* - TL: *Saya tidak dapat mengendalikan kondisi ini.*

Variation is the translation technique that replaces linguistic elements or paralinguistic which influence the linguistic variation. For example, a textual change of tone, style, geographical dialect, dialect and social. SL: *Give it to me now!* - TL: *Berikan barang itu ke gue sekarang!*

Deletion technique is similar to the reduction technique. The reduction technique, as well as deletion technique, requires the translator to do the removal. Deletion technique is characterized by partially removing while engineering the disappearance was marked by the presence of omission of information thoroughly.

Audio-visual Translation

Audiovisual translation (and subtitle in particular) is a branch of translation studies. This kind of translation is characterized by certain particularities. In the case of the subtitle, it is especially the lack of space and time. The translation is influenced by confined space available for the subtitle text, the time available for and between subtitle exposures, the timing of subtitle insertion and removal and last but not least the display and format of the subtitles. Besides, the subtitle has to take into account the average reading speed of the viewers.

Translating cultural references

is often problematic. Translators may replace the original reference with one that is similar in the target language, but the similar reference does not always convey the original reference correctly. Pedersen²⁷ argues that in some cases and genres (such as comedy), eliciting a similar reaction or feeling is what is most important, so replacing the reference is acceptable. But, as he points out, sometimes the target audience understands the original reference, making its replacement unnecessary. Zojer²⁸ continues this point and states that this universal understanding is a result of globalization and illustrates the growing interculturality of the world.

On the other hand, in some cultures, it is deemed necessary to delete or alter foreign cultural references that will be found unacceptable in the “target” culture. For example, as noted by Amirian and Sharia’i, dubbing is the main mode of AVT used by Iranian television (IRIB), and priority is given to the target Iranian culture. IRIB’s policy is to “filter and transfer foreign assumptions and value” (7), resulting in a predominance of what 19th-century philosopher Friedrich Schleiermacher called the “domestication” of the translated content.²⁹ Multilingualism and code-switching between languages in a film is also an issue. In American films, a growing amount of dialogue is

²⁷J. Pederson, *Scandinavian Subtitles: A Comparative Study of Subtitling Norms in Sweden and Denmark with a Focus on Extralinguistic Cultural References*, Unpublished doctoral thesis, (Department of English, Stockholm University, Stockholm., 2007).

²⁸Heidi Zojer, *Cultural References in Subtitles A Measuring Device for Interculturality?* Heidi Zojer University College, Dublin (Dublin: University College of Dublin, 2004).

²⁹Lawrence Venuti, *Rethinking Translation: Discourse, Subjectivity, Ideology* (London: Routledge., 1992).

in both English and Spanish. This leads to questions of how to deal with the duality of the dialogue. Almost always, Spanish is subtitled, unless another character is acting as a translator. This phenomenon also arises in “Bollywood” (i.e., commercial Hindi) films from India. English is frequently mixed in with Hindi (or other Indian languages) when spoken (e.g., creating what has colloquially been called “Hinglish”). This illustrates the Westernization of the Indian culture, and most often the English words are subtitled along with everything else. When choosing whether to utilize subtitles or to dub, attention also is paid to the fact that not everyone can read, whether it is an illiterate adult or a child who has not yet learned, and to the attention level of the target audience. Often, TV shows such as soap operas are dubbed so that the audience can carry out other activities without being tied to the TV.

As for the dubbing, its main aim is to seem natural and authentic. The performed translation must match the lip movements of the speaker on the screen as closely as possible, especially when the actor is shown in a close-up. There are usually more people cooperating, one of them is making a raw translation and another one rewriting it in order to match it with the lip movements of the person seen on the screen. Because of the mix of different communication systems, such as images, sound (music, noise) and the verbal component (oral production, written text), the translation of audiovisual materials is characterized by particular limitations. These make audiovisual translation are very different from literary translation.

There are two types of audiovisual or screen translation namely *dubbing* and *subtitle*. Both types of this

translation have significant differences. Boordwell & Thompson (1990:409) said: “The two most common forms of screen translation are *dubbing* and *subtitle*”.

Dubbing is a form of post-synchronized re-voicing that involves recording voices that do not belong to the on-screen actors, speaking in a language different from that of the source text and ideally in synch with the film image. Dubbing or lip-sync dubbing as a specific technique attempts to cover entirely the spoken source text with a target text adjusted to fit the-visual-lip movements of the original utterances.³⁰ But dubbing can also refer more generally to adding or replacing sound effects or spoken lines by the source actors themselves in the language of the film’s production, often because of poor sound quality in the original recording or for the deletion of expletives from the theatrical version for release on television. While this latter form of post-synchronized re-voicing is present in virtually all modern films, it is often called “looping” to distinguish it from dubbing as language translation. Another form of re-voicing is the “voice-over,” in which a no synchronous voice that does not replace the source text and language is added to the soundtrack but does not replace the source text and language. Popular in Russia and Poland and used more in television than in film translation, the voice-over is a relatively minor mode compared to dubbing and subtitle.

Voiceover or also known as the looping is a process of record or source-cast an image that moves. A term often used is replacing the original actor’s voice into the voices of others by using

³⁰Fotios Karamitroglou, *Towards a Methodology for the Investigation of Norms in Audiovisual Translation*. (Amsterdam: Rossipi B.V, 2000).

different languages. Dubbing is popular in some countries, such as Brazil, Viet Nam, India, Thailand, China, and Canada. Although not all film cast-townhouse, usually only children's movies, cartoons, and films on the television screen, most of these countries prefer a movie with use the method instead of the voice of the text translation. They argue that by using dubbing, the viewers, especially children, will avoid the swear words that are frequently leveled in the SL.

Gottlieb, in a collection of writings published by Baker³¹ does not much commented on over the sound. Some experts suggested that only this translation dubbing, in dialogue with the SL was replaced with the dialogue within the TL. In addition, harmony with audiovisual also needs to be maintained, even the fourth consideration in the above semantic charge each and keep watch out for when doing translation and dubbing of films use the technique.³²

The subtitle is a little different with the dubbing. Gambier says "Subtitle is one of two possible methods for providing the translation of movie dialogue, where the original dialogue soundtrack is left in place and the translation is printed along the bottom of the movies."³³ In other words, the subtitle is the translation of the dialogue in the film write down at the bottom of the film. As does the voice-over, subtitle purposes are helping viewers to enjoy a movie, whether it's

³¹Mona Baker, *Linguistic Perspectives on Translation the Oxford Guide to Literature in English Translation*. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000).

³²Mona Baker, 245.

³³Yves Gambier, *Audio Visual Communication: Typological Detour*". *Teaching Translation and Interpreting 2*. (Philadelphia: John Benjamins., 1993), 276.

a documentary film or story, drama, action, and others. Another expert, Betty White, said "subtitle is the translation of the spoken language (source language) of a television program or movie into a target language. The translated text usually "appears in two lines at the bottom of the screen." This definition is a bit different with the definition that leveled by Garbier above i.e. a number of rows existing in subtitle translation should not be more than two lines.

According to Gottlieb in Baker³⁴ subtitle can be distinguished into two, namely: a) *Intralingual subtitle*, which includes: text translation with language similar to the language used by actors and text translation with a language different than that used by the actors. b) *The interlingual subtitle* does not translate exactly spoken by the actor, but in other forms with different language anyway.

The subtitle, like voice-over, presents the translated and source languages simultaneously, but it transforms speech into writing without altering the source soundtrack. The subtitle may be either *intralingual* or *interlingual*. In the former, the written text that appears over the image is that of the source language. This kind of subtitle, for viewers who are deaf and hard-of-hearing, is often called "captioning," and it is in prevalent use in television broadcasting. *Interlingual subtitle* translates the source language into the target language (or languages) in the form of one or more lines of synchronized written text. These verbal messages may include not only speech, such as dialogue, commentary, and song lyrics but also displays, such as written

³⁴Mona Baker, *Linguistic Perspectives on Translation The Oxford Guide to Literature in English Translation*.

signs and newspaper headlines. Subtitles usually appear at the bottom of the screen, though their placement may vary among language groups. In bilingual subtitle countries, such as Belgium, Finland, and Israel, film subtitles are often present in both languages.

Both of these main techniques of audiovisual translation have their pros and cons and it is important to stress that neither of them is better than the other in a general way. Advocates of subtitle point out that it is much cheaper than dubbing, it keeps the original dialogue and that the viewer can hear the original actor's voice (unlike dubbing where it is lost). Another important reason is the fact that films with subtitles promote the learning of foreign languages as the audience can hear the foreign language and at the same time reads the translation. According to many, this might contribute to the fact that the majority of inhabitants of the dubbing countries are much worse at learning foreign languages (English in particular) than inhabitants of the subtitle countries.

On the other hand, subtitle also has substantial disadvantages. Not only is the reduction of original information much higher than in the case of dubbing, but subtitles also distract the viewers, which means that the audience has to perceive the written text together with the image and that can be very inconvenient. Furthermore, the viewer cannot follow the story whenever he is distracted from watching. These are only some pros and cons of subtitle and dubbing. As far as voice-over is concerned, there is only one advantage: low cost. This technique thus cannot be considered as equipollent to the ones of subtitle and dubbing.

As it is impossible to state which of these practices (subtitle and dubbing)

is better, it seems that there are two things that influence the decision whether a certain program will be subtitled or dubbed: 1) economic reasons and 2) audience expectations and wishes.

In analyzing the type of translation technique, the researcher uses the whole song lyrics of subtitle and dubbing of the OST Frozen: Let it Go which contains 34 data, there are 13 techniques which are used by the translator.

Amplification (Addition): Amplification (Addition) is a technique in process of translating to introduce details that did not formulate in the SL: information, explicative paraphrasing.³⁵ It can be either information or paraphrasing explicitly. It is the same with the addition or gain. It also can be called grammatical expansion for clarity of meaning. For example, Subtitled version. SL: *Can't hold it back anymore* - TL: *Aku tak bisa menahannya lagi*.

In here, the subtitle translator uses addition technique as he adds the subject *Aku* in the TL. This technique conveyed detail that is not formulated or stated in the SL to give clarity of the meaning.

Borrowing: Borrowing is a technique that takes a word or expression straight from another language. It can be copied, reproduced, translated or changed in TL exactly as in SL. When an expression or a word is taken over purely in TL (without change), it is called pure borrowing. In naturalized borrowing, it can be naturalized to fit the spelling rules in the TL (with changing). For example, Subtitled version. SL: *And one thought*

³⁵L. Molina and A.H. Albir, "Molina, L., & Albir, A. H. (2002). Translation Techniques Revisited: A Dynamic and Functionalist Approach. Meta: Translators' Journal, XLVII(4)." XLVII, no. 4 (2002): 509–11.

crystallizes like an icy blast - TL: *Dan pengkristalan bagaikan ledakan es*. In the subtitle, the translator translates *crystallizes* become *pengkristalan* using naturalized borrowing technique.

Calque also called as loan translation. It is a technique translation of the word or phrase or from the SL into TL which can be the lexical or structural system. It also can be translated word-for-word in a language into another language, for example, translates each word literally. For example:

Subtitled version. SL: *My soul is spiraling in frozen fractals all around* - TL: *Semangatku tersulur dalam fraktal beku di sekitarku*

In the subtitle, the translator uses calque technique of phrase *frozen fractals* in the SL which is translated into *fraktal beku* in the TL. Here, the *frozen fractal* is a phrase which translated literally into the phrase in the TL.

Compensation is a technique that introduces SL element of information or stylistic effect in another place in the TL because it cannot be reflected in the same place as in the SL. For example, the Subtitled version. SL: *Be the good girl you always have to be* - TL: *Jadilah gadis baik seperti selayaknya*.

In the subtitle, the translator uses compensation technique as the translator gives stylistic effect in the word *selayaknya* because the SL cannot be reflected in the same place in the SL. If it is translated literally, the translation will become *jadilah gadis baik seperti yang selalu kau lakukan*, but the translator doesn't translate it literally. Dubbed version. SL: *The snow glows white on the mountain tonight* - TL: *Salju berkilah merenda malam*.

The dubber uses compensation

technique as she changes the element information and gives stylistic effect in TL because the dubber needs to match the words with the song tone. The dubber translates *glows* become *berkilah* to give stylistic effect in the TL.

Established Equivalence is a technique that uses term or expression which is recognized (in dictionary or language in use and everyday use) as an equivalent in the TL. It is used to refer to cases where language describes the same situation by different stylistic or structural. For example: Subtitled and Dubbed versions. SL: *Let it go, let it go* - TL: *Lepaskan, lepaskan*. *Let it go* which is also the title of the song is translated into *Lepaskan* in both of subtitled and dubbed version. If the SL translated literally, it would become "*Biarkan itu pergi*", but the subtitle translator and the dubber use the expression which is recognized in daily conversation. Therefore, the translation technique used in this data is Established Equivalence.

Linguistics Amplification is a technique that adds elements of Linguistics from SL into the TL. This technique is often used in interpreting or dubbing. For example, Subtitled version. SL: *Conceal, don't feel, don't let them know* - TL: *Rahasiakanlah, jangan kau rasakan, jangan sampai mereka tahu*. In the subtitle, the translator uses the Linguistic Amplification technique because there is an additional subject *kau* in the TL.

Linguistics Compression is a translation technique that unites or collects the linguistic elements that exist in the SL. This technique is often used in interpreting or dubbing. For example, Dubbed version. SL: *No right, no wrong, no rules for me*. TL: *Tanpa ada yang mengatur*. The dubber uses

linguistic compression technique; some of the contexts in SL is compressed in the TL. The dubber translates *No right, no wrong, no rules for me* only become *tanpa ada yang mengatur*, because the meaning can represent the three expressions in the SL.

Literal Translation is a technique that translates a word or an expression in word for word. The SL is translated literally, and focuses on the form and structure, without any addition or reduction into TL. For example, Subtitled version: SL: *The snow glows white on the mountain tonight*. TL: *Salju bersinar putih di gunung malam ini*. In here, literal translation technique is applied by the translator because the SL has the same form and structure to the TL. The SL and TL structure is S (The snow) + V (glows) + Complement. If it is separated word-for-word, it will be (The snow=*salju*, glows=*bersinar*, white=*putih*, on=*di*, the mountain=*gunung*, tonight=*malam ini*). Therefore, this data is using the Literal Translation Technique.

Dubbed version: SL: *Here I stand*. TL: *Disini ku berdiri*.

In here, the dubber translates *Here I stand* become *Disini ku berdiri* which has the literal meaning. Therefore, the dubber uses Literal Translation Technique.

Modulation is a technique that changes the point of view in the TL in order to focus or cognitive category in relation to SL. It is a variation of the form of the message, obtained by a change in the point of view. It allows in expressing the same phenomenon in a different way. For example, the Subtitled version: SL: *It's funny how some distance makes everything seem small*. TL: *Lucunya dengan jarak ini, membuat semuanya seolah kecil*.

In here, the subtitle translator changes the point of view in SL to TL, but still has the same message or meaning of the lyrics in SL. If it is translated literally, the meaning will become improper.

Dubbed version: SL: *Be the good girl you always have to be*. TL: *Jadilah seperti yang diharapkan*

In here, the dubber uses a modulation technique as she gives an implied meaning in the TL. She translates *the good girl you always have to be* into *seperti yang diharapkan*. It uses different expression but still has the same meaning.

Particularization is a translation technique that uses the term that is more concrete and specific. The technique contrasts with the technique of generalization. For example: Subtitled version: SL: *And the fears that once controlled me can't get to me at all*. TL: *Dan ketakutan yang dulu mengendalikanku tak bisa menguasainya lagi*

In here, the translator uses particularization technique because the translator uses the term that is more concrete and specific in the TL; he translates *get to me* into *menguasainya*. It is a specific word from *get to me*, if it is translated literally, the translation will become *mendapatkanku*.

Dubbed version. SL: *Can't hold it back anymore*. TL: *Tak mampu kutahan lagi*.

In here, the word *can't* be translated into *tak mampu*. The dubber uses a more precise or concrete term because the word "cannot" is usually translated into "tidak dapat". Therefore, the dubber uses particularization technique in this data.

Reduction is a technique that

reduces certain elements of the SL. It is also called elimination, omission or subtraction which suppressing a SL information in the TL. For example: Subtitled version: SL: *And one thought crystallizes like an icy blast.* TL: *Dan pengkristalan bagaikan ledakan es.*

In here, the translator uses reduction technique, the word *one thought* in the lyric (SL) is reduced in the TL.

Dubbed version, SL: *I don't care what they're going to say.* TL: *Tak peduli yang mereka bilang.*

In here, this data uses reduction technique. The dubber reduces the subject *I* and the word *going* in the TL.

Transposition: Transposition is a technique that changes a grammatical category in relation to the source language. This technique same with shift (in category, structure and unit shift, such as changing singular to plural, a position of adjective, changing the word class or part of speech). For example: Subtitled version: SL: *To test the limits and break through.* TL: *Menguji batasku dan mendobraknya.*

The subtitled version uses Transposition technique because the SL is a clause with the conjunction "to" but when it is translated to the TL, the translator translates it into *menguji batasku dan mendobraknya*. The translator also translates *the limits* become *batasku*. From this data, it can be found transposition or shift.

Dubbed version, SL: *A kingdom of isolation, and it looks like I'm the Queen.* TL: *Aku bagaikan ratu di k'rajaan terasing*

In the dubbed version, there is a shift from a passive sentence become active sentence. According to Molina and

Albir³⁶ Transposition is a technique that changes a grammatical category in relation to the SL. This technique same with shift (in category, structure and unit shift, such as changing singular to plural, active to passive, position of adjective, changing the word class or part of speech). Therefore, it could be said that both of this versions use transposition technique.

Deletion technique is similar to the reduction technique. The reduction technique, as well as deletion technique, requires the translator to do the removal. Deletion technique is characterized by partially removing while engineering the disappearance was marked by the presence of omission of information thoroughly. For Example, Dubbed version: SL: *and here I'll stay.* TL: *-(no translation)*

In here, the rubber is not translating it because the context in datum 26 is related to datum 25 and it has a similar meaning. So, the dubber uses Deletion technique in the dubbed version.

Based on the Data Analysis above, the researcher classifies the results of the Translation Technique that appears in Original Soundtrack *Frozen: Let it Go* as follows: There are 11 translation technique are applied in subtitled version such as Addition (1 data), Borrowing (2 data), Calque (1 data), Compensation (2 data), Established Equivalence (1 data), Linguistic Amplification (2 data), Literal Translation (15 data), Modulation (2 data), Particularization (2 data), Reduction (5 data), and Transposition (5 data).

The eleven translation techniques that appear in the subtitle translation, the most dominant type of translation technique is Literal Translation. It

³⁶L. Molina and A.H. Albir, 509–11.

has the highest frequency of the data, 15 data. Through this technique, the translator translates a word or an expression in a word for word. Most of the SL is translated literally, and focuses on the form and structure, without any addition or reduction into the TL.

There are 9 translation technique are applied in dubbed version such as Compensation (1 data), Established Equivalence (1 data), Linguistic Compression (5 data), Literal Translation (4 data), Modulation (11 data), Particularization (1 data), Reduction (10 data), Transposition (7 data), and Deletion (2 data).

Based on the nine translation techniques that appear in the dubbing translation above, the most dominant type of translation technique is Modulation. It has the highest frequency of the data, 11 data. Through this technique, the dubber changes the point of view in the TL in order to focus or cognitive category in relation to SL. This technique is a variation of the form of the message, obtained by a change in the point of view. It allows in expressing the same meaning in a different way. The Reduction is also having a higher amount of data, 10 data. Through the reduction technique, the translator reduces certain elements of the SL. This technique is also called elimination, omission or subtraction which suppressing an SL information in the TL.

C. Conclusion

The researchers conclude that translating movies (subtitle and dubbing) is not the same as intertextual translation. This is because it has technical matters such as space and timing. The translator has to follow the rules of subtitle and dubbing with a precise translation. This includes removing, adding, or

altering the structures of the text in the TL, in order to gain a good translation quality in film translation. In the subtitle translation of Original Soundtrack *Frozen: Let it Go*, there are eleven techniques that are used. The eleven techniques are Addition, Borrowing, Calque, Compensation, Established Equivalence, Linguistic Amplification, Literal Translation, Modulation, Particularization, Reduction, and Transposition. The commonly found technique in subtitled version is a literal translation as there are many expressions that translated literally by the subtitle translator. However, the dubbing translation only uses nine techniques such as Compensation, Established Equivalence, Linguistic Compression, Literal Translation, Modulation, Particularization, Reduction, Transposition, and Deletion. The commonly found techniques in dubbed version are modulation and reduction. The dubber often changes the point of view in the TL in order to focus or cognitive category in relation to SL and matches the words with the tone using modulation and reduction technique.

References:

- Matlama, A. "Translations for Dubbing as Dynamic Texts: Strategies in Film Synchronization." 2, no. 56, 2010/<https://doi.org/10.1075/babel.56.2.01mat>.
- A.I.H. Bartolomé, and G.M. Cabrera. "New Trends in Audiovisual Translation: The Latest Challenging Modes." *A Journal of English and American Studies*, no. 31, 2005
- Hatim, Basil, and Jeremy Munday. *Translation: An Advanced Resource Book*. New York: Routledge, 2004.

- Hood, Benny H. *Linguistik, Semiotik, Dan Kebudayaan Kita*, 1992.
- Caron, C. "Translating Trek: Rewriting an American Icon in a Francophone Context." *Journal of American Culture* 26, no. 3, 2003/https://doi.org/10.1111/1542-734X.00095.
- Bogucki, DJ, Redekopp L.G, and Barth J. "Internal Solitary Waves in the Coastal Mixing and Optics 1996 Experiment: Multimodal Structure and Resuspension J. Geophys," 2005.
- Taber, Eugene A Nida; Charles Russell. *The Theory and Practice of Translation*. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1982.
- Mack, G. *Conference Interpreting on the Air: Live Simultaneous Interpreting on Italian Television*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins publishing co., 2001.
- Zojer, Heidi. *Cultural References in Subtitles A Measuring Device for Interculturality?* Heidi Zojer University College, Dublin. Dublin: University College of Dublin, 2004.
- Dastjerdi, H.V., and Jaini A. "Killing Two Birds with One Stone: Translation of the Unseen and off-Camera Speech and Sounds in English Movies Subtitled into Persian." *Journal of International Social Research* 4, no. 19, 2011
- Pederson, J. *Scandinavian Subtitles: A Comparative Study of Subtitling Norms in Sweden and Denmark with a Focus on Extralinguistic Cultural References*. Unpublished doctoral thesis., Department of English, Stockholm University, Stockholm., 2007.
- Catford, J.C. *A Linguistic Theory of Translati*. London: Oxford University Press., 1965.
- González, J.D Iglesias, and Toda F. "Dubbing or Subtitling Interculturalism: Choices and Constraints. *Journal of Intercultural Communication*" 2, no. 27, 2011.
- Munday, Jeremy. *Introducing Translation Studies: Theories and Applications*. New York: Routledge, 2016.
- Cintas, Jorge Diaz. *Audiovisual Translation in the Third Millennium*. In: Anderman , G. & Rogers, M. (Eds) *Translation Today: Trends and Perspectives*. Beijing: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press., 2006.
- Sepielak, K., and A. Matlama. "Sepielak, K., & Matamala, A. (2014). Synchrony in the Voice-over of Polish Fiction Genres. *Babel*, 2014
- Taivalkoski-Shilov, K. "Subtitling 8 Mile in Three Languages: Translation Problems and Translator Licence." *International Journal on Translation* 2, no. 20, 2008
- Karamitroglou, Fotios. *Towards a Methodology for the Investigation of Norms in Audiovisual Translation*. Amsterdam: Rossipi B.V, 2000.
- Molina, L., and A.H. Albir. "Molina, L., & Albir, A. H. (2002). Translation Techniques Revisited: A Dynamic and Functionalist Approach. *Meta: Translators' Journal*, XLVII(4)." XLVII, no. 4 (2002).
- Venuti, Lawrence. *Rethinking Translation: Discourse, Subjectivity, Ideology*. London: Routledge., 1992.
- Pavesi, M. "Pronouns in Film Dubbing

- and the Dynamics of Audiovisual Communication.” *Vigo International Journal of Applied Linguistic* 6 (2009): 89–107.
- Baker, Mona. *Linguistic Perspectives on Translation The Oxford Guide to Literature in English Translation*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Remiere, N. “Are You ‘Lost in Translation’ (When Watching a Foreign Film)? Towards an Alternative Approach to Judging Audiovisual Translation. *Australian Journal of French Studies*” 1, no. 47, 2010/<https://doi.org/10.3828/AJFS.47.1.100>.
- Zilberdik, N.J. “Relay Translation in Subtitling. Perspectives: Studies in Translatology” 1, no. 12, 2004
- Howell, P. “Character Voice in Anime Subtitles. Perspectives: Studies in Translatology” 4, no. 14, 2006
- Reich, P. “The Film And the Book in Translation.” 2006. [Http://is.muni.cz/th/64544/ff_m/Diplomova_prace.pdf](http://is.muni.cz/th/64544/ff_m/Diplomova_prace.pdf) [Accessed 5 October 2014]. http://is.muni.cz/th/64544/ff_m/Diplomova_prace.pdf [Accessed 5 October 2014].
- Newmark, Peter. *A Textbook of Translation*. London: Prentice Hall Print, 1988.
- Antonini, R. “The Perception of Subtitled Humor in Italy” 2, no. 18 (February 18, 2005/ <https://doi.org/10.1515>).
- Schroter, T. “Schröter, T. (2003). Quantity and Quality in Screen Translation. Perspectives: Studies in Translatology, 11(2), no. 11, 2003
- Chuang, Y. “Studying Subtitle Translation from a Multi-Modal Approach.” 4, no. 52, 2006
- Gambier, Yves. *Audio Visual Communication: Typological Detour*. *Teaching Translation and Interpreting 2*. Philadelphia: John Benjamins., 1993.

