JURNAL STUDI PEMERINTAHAN

Gender Risk and Femininity: Personal Political Branding of Female Politicians in the Strong Political Dynasty Feature of South Sulawesi

Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi

Research Center for Politics-the Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI)

Email: kurniawati.dewi@yahoo.com

533

Received: September 9, 2018 Revised: October 16, 2018 Accepted:October 27,

2018

How to cite this article is:

Dewi, K. H. (2018). Gender Risk and Femininity:Personal PoliticalBrandingof Female Politicians in the Strong Political Dynasty Feature of South Sulawesi.

Jurnal Studi Pemerintahan, 9(4), 533-588.

Abstract

Personal political branding becomes an important element in political contestation under the new direct democracy in Indonesia. In the male-dominated political atmosphere, it is interesting to analyze creation and development of personal political branding by female politicians. This paper explores stories of the two female politicians, each a candidate for the district head of Gowa (Tenri) and North Luwu (Indah) in the 2015 direct local election in South Sulawesi Province, where a strong political dynasty is the primary feature. This is qualitative research employing feminist research methodology by interviewing the two female politicians. This paper reveals that the use of femininity element in the tagline SAYANG IBU (love your mother) as Tenri's personal political branding contains of what I call 'gender risk' which disadvantaged her. Within a strong political dynasty feature of South Sulawesi which is patriarchal, her opponent created a counter narrative to weaken her and pointed out centrality of a male politician. On the other hand, a successful female politician candidate for the district head of North Luwu, Indah, used PINTAR (smart) as her personal political branding which did not resemble her femininity and did not exclusively target women. By doing so, this paper offers different findings from those of the previous research which suggest that femininity can help all candidates to stand out.

In a strong political dynasty feature, it is important to pay attention to the subconscious element such as patriarchal ideology which often plays or is used to weaken or against female politicians.

534

Keywords: political dynasty, personal political branding, femininity, gender risk, subconscious, female politicians.

Abstrak

Pencitraan politik pribadi menjadi elemen penting dalam kontestasi politik di Indonesia dengan berlakunya demokrasi langsung. Dalam atmosfer politik yang didominasi laki-laki, menarik untuk menganalisis penciptaan dan pengembangan branding politik pribadi oleh politisi perempuan. Makalah ini mengeksplorasi kisah dua politisi perempuan, masing-masing kandidat untuk bupati Gowa (Tenri) dan Luwu Utara (Indah) dalam pemilihan kepala daerah langsung tahun 2015 di Provinsi Sulawesi Selatan, di mana politik dinasti yang kuat adalah fitur utamanya. Ini adalah penelitian kualitatif yang menggunakan metodologi penelitian feminis dengan mewawancarai dua politisi perempuan. Makalah ini mengungkapkan bahwa penggunaan unsur kewanitaan dalam slogan SAYANG IBU (cinta ibu) yang dipergunakan sebagai pencitraan politik pribadi Tenri mengandung apa yang saya sebut 'risiko gender' yang merugikan dirinya. Dalam sebuah dinasti politik yang kuat dari Sulawesi Selatan yang bersifat patriarkal, lawannya (laki-laki) menciptakan narasi kontra untuk melemahkannya dan menunjukkan sentralitas seorang politisi laki-laki. Di sisi lain, seorang kandidat politisi perempuan yang sukses untuk bupati Luwu Utara, Indah, menggunakan PINTAR sebagai pencitraan politik pribadinya yang tidak menekankan sisi kewanitaannya dan tidak secara eksklusif menargetkan perempuan. Dengan demikian, makalah ini menawarkan temuan yang berbeda dari penelitian sebelumnya yang menunjukkan bahwa elemen kewanitaan dapat membantu semua kandidat untuk menonjol. Dalam fitur dinasti politik yang kuat, penting untuk memperhatikan elemen bawah sadar seperti ideologi patriarki yang sering dimainkan atau digunakan untuk melemahkan atau melawan politisi perempuan.

Kata Kunci : dinasti politik, branding politik pribadi, feminitas, risiko gender, bawah sadar, politisi perempuan.

INTRODUCTION

Changes from representative democracy to direct democracy have substantially affected the political behavior of Indonesian politicians. Direct democracy (in which people votes directly candidate of political leaders in national or local level) has taken placed not only at national level such as direct presidential election since 2004, but also at local level.

At local level, direct election to elect local government heads has been taken placed since 2005 by Law No.32/2004; in this paper referred to as 'direct local election'. In representative democracy, the popularity of a local government head candidate is less influential in his/her victory, compared to his/her ability in lobbying politicians inside the Regional House of Representatives (DPRD, Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah). Conversely, in direct democracy, the figure, popularity, and physical appearance, which are usually referred to as "personal branding", as well as the ability of a local government head candidate to gather political sympathy from the public become influential factors determining his/her victory. Based on the foregoing, it is important to further observe and analyze strategies used by local government head candidates in developing and playing political branding in direct local elections.

There are at least three rationales which signify the importance of studying political branding in Indonesian politics nowadays, especially in direct local elections. *First*, there are a declining trend in voters' identification with political parties while the factor figure increases. The declining trend in voters' identification with political parties (i.e. feeling close to a certain party) has been the case in general elections in 1999 to 2009. As an illustration, research by Mujani, Liddle, and Ambardi (2012: 380) shows a decline in voters' identification with a party (party ID), i.e. from 86% in the 1999 legislative election to 55% in the 2014 legislative election and 20% in the 2009 legislative election.

536

A similar case in the presidential election, i.e. from approximately 50% in the 2004 presidential election, to only 12% in the presidential election held in July 2009 (Mujani, Liddle, Ambardi, 2012: 380). Second, a decline in party identification is proportional to a decline in public trust on political parties. To illustrate, public trust on political parties was 79% (2001), 65% (2002), 57% (2005), 47% (2006), and lastly 39% (Mujani, Liddle, Ambardi, 2012: 380-381), meaning that there are more people who do not trust political parties and indicating the significance of figure or political branding of politicians. Third, there is a tendency among new democratic countries where institutionalization of political parties is weak, which to believe that individual figures play a prominent role in attracting mass voters and forming party identity (Mujani, Liddle, Ambardi, 2012: 425).

Haroen (2014: 56-57) who observed the victories of politicians in local elections, general elections and presidential elections notes that more than 50% of the victories were determined by political figures, whereas the restwere determined by the quality of the programs offered and the quality of the political machine. An empirical example of the importance of political branding in direct local elections is Jokowi's victory in the Special Capital Region of Jakarta gubernatorial election in 2012. His victory in the 2012 election was partly determined by his branding as a humble and honest politician in contrast to Foke's political branding as an arrogant figure (Haroen, 2014: 56-57). Although Jokowi just came five months prior the election, his political branding combined with Ahok's (Jokowi-Ahok) was very strong. As a result, they were able to defeat Foke who had served for five years. In the direct local election, Pradhanawati (2011: 10) notes that voters tend to consider individual candidates rather than their supporting political parties, or the so-called 'figure personalization'. Having said all of the factual developments, this paper's effort to analyze political branding of politicians in direct local elections has found its empirical urgency.

JURNAL STUDI PEMERINTAHAN

537

Although the topic of political branding is strategic and actual, there are not enough studies on political branding in Indonesia, especially related to female politicians. There have been copious studies on direct local elections since 2005 such as the practice of money politics (Masaaki & Hamid, 2008), (Hamid, 2014); illegal campaign financing (Mietzner, 2011); strengthening of local identity (Nordholt & van Klinken, 2007); collusion (Hidayat, 2009); and economic growth, public services, and natural resources (Hill, 2014). Nevertheless, only a few have been dedicated to understanding the rising of female leaders in elections such as those conducted by LSI (2007), Ratnawati (2009), Satriyo (2010), University of Airlangga (2011), Perludem (2015), and Satunama (2015). Dewi (2015a) comprehensively observed the agencies of three female Javanese Muslim leaders and highlights the roles of Islam, gender, and networks. A series of research on various factors behind the rise of female politicians in local politics has been conducted by the gender team of the Research Center for Politics, the Indonesian Institute of Sciences, which focuses on religion and culture (Dewi 2016); familial ties (Dewi 2017a); and capital, strategies, and networks (Dewi 2018). There are only a few works reviewing political branding such as the ones undertaken by Firmanzah (2012) who focuses on political marketing, Prasetyawan (2012) who reviews the ways presidential candidates in the 2009 general election created and capitalized an image in political advertising, and Haroen (2014) who analyzes politicians' personal branding in direct local elections, legislative elections, and presidential elections. Even, so far, there is no study on personal political branding of female politicians in Indonesian local politics.

Studying personal political branding of female politicians is important. This is because the emergence and appearance of female politicians in politics always attract public and academic attention. Sanghvi and Hodges (2015: 1676) note that compared with male politicians, female politicians usually get more attention from the media in terms of their clothes, hairstyle, or shoes, which are all more determining than more substantial matters.

538

Shames (2003: 116) who analyzes campaigns run by female politicians in the United States notes that voters and the media tend to perceive women candidates as women first, while as candidates come second.

Thus, this paper observes and analyzes the ways two female Muslim politicians created and developed personal political branding in the 2015 direct local election in Gowa (Tenri Olle Yasin Limpo) and North Luwu (Indah Putri Indriani). The criterion to choose the two female politicians is because they live and elected in the two regions in South Sulawesi, which is characterized by a strong political dynasty and make them interesting to observe. Moreover, both cases present the story of failure and success of personal political branding which is useful to gain comprehensive understanding. There are three research questions to be addressed in this paper: first, what were the bases for personal political branding created by the two female politicians?; second, how were the elements of femininity used in their personal political branding?; and lastly, what kind of 'gender risk' emerges in their personal political branding?.

LITERATURE REVIEW AND RESEARCH FOCUS National Trend: Strengthening Political Dynasties in Indonesian Local Politics

Following direct local elections to elect a local government head (district head, mayor, and governor) which began taking effect in 2005, there is a new threat to local democracy as politicians from political dynasties rise and spread in various regions across the country. Robison and Hadiz (2004) have warned a tendency that various local oligarchs, most of whom are linked to the New Oder power, will be able to metamorphose, hijacking the new decentralization policy and seizing the institution of decentralization. Thus, local oligarchs gain many benefits from direct democracy as they have wider opportunities to use their economic capital to strengthen power accumulation in each region. As a result, the number of political dynasties in direct local elections have mushroomed.

The emergence of political dynasties in Indonesia is not as prevalent as those in the Philippines, which have been deeprooted and thriving since the U.S. colonization to date. *Journal* of Southeast Asia Research (2016) published a special edition on political families in Southeast Asia such as Indonesia, the Philippines, Thailand (Kongkirati 2016), and Singapore (Barr 2016). Purdey (2016) editor of Journal of South East Asia Research's special edition on political dynasties states that a political dynasty, which "refers to the ability of a family to inherit and to accumulate power and wealth from one generation to the next and frequently functions across a variety of political systems and across time", has an entrenched place within the modern political systems of South East Asia (2016: 319-320). Purdey (2016:320) used the terms 'established' and 'emerging' to position the families within a temporal and historical context because the terms provide an opportunity to examine the point at which tradition (family dynasty) and modernity (democracy) intersect.

The situation in Indonesia is alarming. For example, Florentin (2017) citing the Indonesian Corruption Watch notes that at least 58 political dynasties develop in Indonesia where direct local elections contribute to proliferation of such dynasties, which are perceived to potentially give rise to corruption. Aspinall and As'ad (2016) examined sub-national dynasty formation in Central Kalimantan, especially at district level. Aspinall and As'ad (2016) find that in most of the 14 districts in the province, the signs of dynastic politics abound with many district heads (bupati) installing family members in legislative or other posts and conclude that the emergence of political families is clearly part of wider entrenchment of oligarchic politics. Aspinall (2016:3) states that "a political family becomes a political dynasty only when it is able to extend its power temporally, so that once the dynasty's founder loses office, he or she is succeeded by a family member".

540

In Banten, Masaaki and Hamid (2008) examine the strategy used by the late Chasan Sochib prominent actor of private security providers (jawara) who was also a local oligarch in Banten to maintain and reinforce his power after the introduction of the 2006 direct local election. Their research findings show that Chasan's evolution, who used to be a mere staunch supporter of Suharto's New Order, gradually expanded his power into politics using a direct election to install her daughter Ratu Atut as the governor of Banten (2006-2011). Chasan's political dynasty gets even stronger as they managed to spread their power all over Banten and the surrounding areas where regeneration among the family was well-prepared. For example: her two daughters, namely Ratu Atut Governor of Banten and Tatu Chasanah District Head of Serang; her daughter-in-law Airin Rachmi Diany Mayor of South Tangerang (Dewi 2017a); and his grandson (the son of Ratu Atut) Andika Hazrumy Vice Governor of Banten (2017-2022), who is preparing himself to succeed his mother Ratu Atut who was jailed in 2017 due to corruption. Hamid's further research (2014) shows that Chasan utilized strong kinship networks, exploited state resources, and captured the local bureaucracy to strengthen his political machinery and consolidate his political power in Banten and the surrounding areas.

In relation to female politicians, Richter (1990-1991: 525-526) analyzing the political experience of female political leaders in national politics both from South and Southeast Asian countries concludes that 'familial ties' with prominent male politicians (husbands, fathers, brothers) are a very important factor behind their emergence. Here, I cite Richter's term "familial ties" to express the influence of male relatives, who are also prominent politicians, on developing and achieving political leadership roles for women. In local politics, my observations (Dewi 2015b) reveal that there were 57 female political candidates competing in the 2015 direct local election, 33 of them came from "familial ties" (their father or husband to a greater extend has facilitated their political rise) and only 17 did not.

These indicate that the majority of female politicians, who emerged in the direct local elections today, came from and were part of a political dynasty which then strengthened the existence of a political dynasty at local level.

JURNAL STUDI PEMERINTAHAN

541

Context of the Study: Political Dynasty in South Sulawesi Province

South Sulawesi is also a region with a prominent feature of political dynasty. Buehler (2012) notes how Syahrul Yasin Limpo had taken advantage of elections to entrench himself in local politics. Syahrul Yasin Limpo has strong political traits from his father Muhammad Yasin Limpo and his mother Nurhayati Yasin Limpo. Muhammad Yasin Limpo who was formerly a military officer occupied various government posts after retirement (i.e. serving as the district head of Gowa, Luwu, Majene, and Maros for short periods and acting as an interim governor of South Sulawesi Province), became very influential in the provincial Golkar party, and used his various connections to establish businesses (Buehler, 2013). Syahrul Yasin Limpo's mother, Nurhayati Yasin Limpo, was a Golkar legislator at the parliament of South Sulawesi from 1987 to 1999, won her seat in the national parliament in 1999, and was re-elected in 2004 (Buehler, 2013).

After the death of her father Muhammad Yasin Limpo in 2009, Syahrul Yasin Limpo continued his legacy. Syahrul Yasin Limpo, in conjunction with the New Order's backbone, i.e. the political party Golkar (the Party of the Functional Groups), developed a political career as the district head of Gowa for two periods (1994-2002) long before the introduction of direct local elections. The provincial parliament elected him as the vice governor of South Sulawesi (2003-2008). Syahrul Yasin Limpo strengthened his political career as he was elected the governor of South Sulawesi in 2008 as the first governor elected through the mechanism of direct local election, and was re-elected in 2013.

542

Syahrul's political dynasty run well in South Sulawesi and the surrounding areas via Golkar. Rusnaedy and Purwaningsih (2018: 313) provide a detailed account of Syahrul Yasin Limpo's political dynasty in South Sulawesi. Syahrul's younger brother, Ichsan Yasin Limpo, was elected a member of the South Sulawesi parliament from Golkar in 1999, was reelected in 2004, and became the district head of Gowa for two periods, namely in (2005) and in (2010). Syahrul's older sister, Tenri Olle Yasin Limpo, was elected the head of the parliament in Gowa in 1999 and 2004 from Golkar, and later won her seat in the South Sulwesi provincial parliament (2009-2014). According to Edward Aspinall (2016: 4), Syahrul Yasin Limpo is one of the best examples, along with Ratu Atut Chosiyah in Banten, of Indonesian political families with broad "horizontal spread" referring to their ability to spread through different government agencies and through adjacent geographic units, extending their political control over several districts in a single province.

Within this context of Syahrul Yasin Limpo's strong political dynasty in South Sulawesi, the context of this research lays on. Interestingly, Syahrul Yasin Limpo's clan is not always solid. There is internal competition among Syahrul's clan to gain power at the executive level as what happened in the 2015 direct local election in Gowa. In that election, there were two members of Syahrul Yasin Limpo's family competing as a district head candidate. They were Tenri Olle Yasin Limpo and Adnan Purichta Ichsan Yasin Limpo. Adnan is the son of Ichsan Yasin Limpo, Syahrul Yasin Limpo's younger brother, who was the district head of Gowa (2005-2015). Here, I put the context of this study namely strong political dynasty feature of South Sulawesi to analyzes personal political branding of Tenri in her candidacy in the 2015 direct local election in Gowa, as will be explored later.

Personal Political Branding

Political branding is essentially political marketing. Kumar, Dhamija, and Dhamija (2016: 81) state "that political marketing is the bedrock on which political branding finds its origin".

While in the 1980s and 1990s, political marketing was dominated by the classical model of campaign through agenda setting and political advertising on TV. Since the 2000s, there has been a shift in political marketing towards an emphasis on direct communication in political marketing where branding is the key strategy. In other words, branding is the new form of political marketing and its manifestation is characterized by the popularity gained by political branding in the current scheme of this in political outfits (Scammell 2007: 176); (Kumar, Dhamija, and Dhamija (2016: 81). In short, there has been a shift from the classical model of political marketing, which emphasizes advertising and agenda setting on TV, to an emphasis on the image of a figure which signifies personal political branding.

What is political branding? While Smith and French (2011) consider that only political parties are considered a brand. Other scholars have expanded political branding to candidates and their campaign. In India, Kumar, Dhamija, and Dhamija (2016: 79) analyze political branding and note that "when one talks about political branding, it is the manifestation of the perception of a political candidate, party, campaign strategy or other related terms as policy made to a population with the help of both material and immaterial hints as well as language". Scammell (2007: 189-190) states that there are at least three things which must be present in political branding: (i) understanding voters' wishes and behavior as implementation of consumer-oriented political communication, (ii) relations with voters or consumers by relying on interactive and personal communication, and (iii) covering hard politics (e.g. policies, issues, records of performance) and soft politics (e.g. emotional connection, values, likeability).

544

Political branding is often closely discussed with personal branding. According to Omojola (2008:129), "personal branding is not about creating a larger than life image for the outside world, it is about understanding your unique combination of rational and emotional attributes such as skill, values and passions and using these attributes to differentiate yourself and guide your career decisions in your service to the citizenry. It is about knowing how to powerfully leverage what is unique about you that differentiates you from others. Personal branding strategy is absolutely critical to long- lasting success in politics". Brooks and Anumudu (2016: 24) define personal branding as "the deployment of individuals' identity narratives for career and employment purposes". Mitsikopoulou (2008: 359) states that the personal branding of a politician is basically "not only elements of a candidate's personality, but also elements of a candidate's appearance such as hairstyle and clothing, provide vivid illustrations of a candidate's image". Haroen (2014: 19) states that personal branding should tell someone about "Who you are", "What you have done, and "What you will do" or 3Ks, which are Karakter, Kompetensi, and Kekuatan (Character, Competence, Strength). Aaker (1997) develops five dimensions of brand personality, namely sincerity, excitement, competence, sophistication, and ruggedness. By using Aaker's five-dimensional model of brand personality, Nwanganga, Peter, and Mirian I (2017) analyzed brand personality of the two most prominent candidates in the 2015 Presidential election in Nigeria. They conclude that the dimensions of brand personality such as competence, credibility, sophistication, and audacity are attributes that influence voters in voting for a political candidate prior to/during an election.

In this paper, I use Aaker's five brand personality dimensions in analyzing personal political branding of the two female politicians. In relation to female politicians, Shames (2003) analyzes the role of gender in political advertising by systematically studying campaign commercials of the U.S. House, Senate, and Governor races from 1964 to 1998 and finds the importance of considering contextual factors in determining whether a female candidate will undertake an "un-candidate" strategy or not.

545

Shames (2003: 116) suggests that femininity can help all candidates, including men, through symbolizing and outside perspectives because femininity also works as a differentiation tool as it can make a candidate (either men or women) stand out, while masculinity often makes a candidate look just like any other candidates in a political setting characterized by male domination and masculinity. Thus, this paper will also examine how the elements of femininity is used and played in their personal political branding. In addition, this paper also considers the ways the local context and culture are inserted and influenced in personal political branding. As Cayla and Arnould (2008: 87) say that in "a cultural approach to branding", a brand is a cultural manifestation which should be shaped to reflect social, historical, and geographic aspects of various places of cultures.

Gender Risk

Alice Schlegel defines gender as the way society "perceives, evaluates, and expects" the two sexes (male and female) to behave, and as a cultural construct which varies across cultures (Schlegel, 1990: 23). Michael S. Kimmel also defines gender as "the meanings that are attached to those differences within a culture" (Kimmel, 2004: 3). Connel criticizes these common definitions of gender and asserts terms "gender relations": the direct or indirect interactions between women and men, or among men, or among women in everyday life, surrounding the gender arrangement in social structures (religious, political, kinship and cultural) (Connel, 2008: 54-55). Here, I agree with Connel's definition which defines gender as gender relations because it corresponds with the purpose of this paper that puts political dynasties as important contexts or social structures in gender analysis of this study in South Sulawesi.

On gender risk, this paper draws on literature about gender and organizations where there is a persisting stereotype of women's risk aversion compared to men. Interestingly, analysis of the Simmons 2008 "Gender and Risk" database survey by Maxfield, Shapiro, Gupta, and Hass (2010) reveals that women take risks, challenging the common stereotype by exploring evidence of women's risk taking and suggests reality is more complex than the common stereotype.

546

In this paper, I analyze whether female politicians brave to take certain risk in creating personal political branding. More importantly, I seek to understand what kind of 'gender risk' that possibly arises from it. What I mean by 'gender risk' in this paper is the danger to use femininity in personal political branding of female politician within strong political dynasty feature, in which patriarchal political structure is the core of which male politician gain pretty much benefit.

Femininity

Traditionally, masculinity and femininity are defines as stereotypical male and female roles namely lists of traits and interests that were based on sex (male and female) (Hoffman, Borders, Hattie, 2000: 478). Similarly, Kachel, Steffens, Niedlich (2016: 957) which adapting the definitions provided by Constantinople (1973) defines traditional masculinity and traditional femininity as "relatively enduring characteristics encompassing traits, appearances, interests, and behaviors that have traditionally been considered relatively more typical of women and men, respectively".

Currently, there is new development which believed that masculinity and femininity can be re-conceptualized in terms of the gender identity construction, thus as part of one's self concept. For example Spence (1985) as cited from Hoffman, Borders, Hattie (2000: 479) proposed that masculinity or femininity as refer to an individual's self-concept and conceptualized as gender identity. Lewin (1984) as cited from Hoffman, Borders, Hattie (2000: 479) suggested that masculinity and femininity be conceptualized as "the gender-relevant aspects of a person's self-concept" thus allowing for "individual variation in the specific content of the self-image as related to gender".

In doing so, this paper analyses how femininity in terms of 'individual's self-concept' or "the gender-relevant aspects of a person's self-concept" used in personal political branding of the two female politicians.

RESEARCH METHOD

JURNALSTUDI PEMERINTAHAN

focusing on women's personal experience in a specific context to gain knowledge based on their real-life experience (Harding 1987: 30). I met and interviewed the two female politicians namely Tenri Olle Yasin Limpo (Gowa) and Indah Putri Indriani (North Luwu) from 19 to 25 April 2016 in Province of South Sulawesi. I also interviewed other relevant resource persons in South Sulawesi at a predetermined date. I used the one-on-one interview method, followed by informal discussion where I probed interesting responses or opinions to capture the nature of the issue at hand and its context more comprehensively.

This paper uses feminist research methodology by

547

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Tenri's Personal Political Branding: Gender Risk in a Patriarchal Political Dynasty

Gowa is one of the 24 districts/ municipalities in the Province of South Sulawesi. It consists of 18 sub-districts and 167 villages in 2015 (BPS Kabupaten Gowa 2015: 1). In 2015, there were two family members of Yasin Limpo competing in the direct local election in Gowa, namely Tenri Olle Yasin Limpo and his nephew Adnan Purichta Ichsan Yasin Limpo. There were a total of five pairs of candidates competing in the 2015 direct local election in Gowa, they were: Andi Maddusila Andi Idjo & Wahyu Permana Kaharuddin (Democratic Party, People's Conscience Party (Hanura), National Awakening Party (PKB), and Justice and Prosperity Party (PKS), Sjachrir Sjafruddin Dg. Jarung & Anwar Usman (Golkar), Djamaluddin Maknun & Masjkur (independent candidates), Tenri Olle Yasin Limpo & Hairil Muin (United *Development Party* (PPP) and National Democratic Party (NasDem), and Adnan Purichta Ichsan Yasin Limpo & Abdul Rauf Mallaganni (independent candidates). Eventually, Adnan Purichta Ichsan Yasin Limpo & H. Abdul Rauf Mallagani won the election by winning 41.65% of the total votes and became the district heads of Gowa (2016-2011), while Tenri Olle Yasin Limpo & Hairil Muin only got 26.06% of the votes.

This research focuses on Tenri Olle Yasin Limpo (hereinafter referred to as Tenri) as the only female district head candidate in the 2015 direct local election in Gowa. As I have explained earlier, Tenri comes from a powerful political dynasty in South Sulawesi. Tenri was born in Ujung Pandang on 30 August 1954. She is the oldest among Muhammad Yasin Limpo's seven children. Of the seven children, three are female and four are male. Tenri is the first child. She is the older sister of Syahrul Yasin Limpo, a prominent figure of the political dynasty in South Sulawesi. Her younger sister Dewi Yasin Limpo is also a politician from Golkar. Tenri obtained a Master's degree from Makassar in 2010. Tenri has been actively participating in organizational activities since she was at school. She joined the Indonesian Islamic students (Pelajar Islam Indonesia) and the Islamic Student Association (Himpunan Mahasiswa Islam, HMI), became a successful businesswoman on real estate, and joined politics. She was elected a member of the Regional House of Representatives of Gowa from Golkar for two periods (i.e. 2004-2009 and 2009-2014), the chairperson of the Regional House of Representatives of Gowa for the period of 2009-2014, and a member of the Regional House of Representatives of South Sulawesi from Golkar for the period of 2014-2019. Interestingly, although she is a prominent Golkar politician, she was not nominated by the party in the 2015 direct local election.

Tenri's husband is a businessman and a member of the Regional House of Representatives of Gowa. When I asked her about her motivation to compete as a district head candidate in the 2015 direct local election in Gowa, she said,

"I brave the competition in the election because first, I believe that I am capable and have enough experience in politics with approximately 30 years of experience...second, I am serving as the chief of a big political party [Golkar] which won the majority of seats at the Regional House of Representatives of Gowa which forms a solid basis...I also saw and felt from my interaction with many politicians that politics does not touch matters related to women's interests. Therefore, I was called to enter the political world by carrying a mission in order that politics provides many benefits for women's interests..." (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Tenri in Makassar, 23 April 2016).

In addition, Tenri feels that Gowa is her home, "Gowa is my area, my home town. My father comes from Gowa. I have sat in the National House of Representatives from the electoral district of Gowa for five periods. So, I am a native of Gowa and have enough networks in Gowa" (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Tenri in Makassar, 23 April 2016). From her statement and profile, we can see that Tenri is a female politician with experience not only in Gowa but also in South Sulawesi and beyond. As the only female candidate in the 2015 direct local election in Gowa, Tenri competing head-to-head with her nephew Adnan Purichta Ichsan Yasin Limpo (hereinafter referred to as Adnan). She developed personal political branding called *SAYANG IBU* (love your mother). She said in an interview,

"I chose the branding *SAYANG IBU* because, first of all, I am a woman and I see that everyone will love his/her mother, and that can also be a very strategic issue. Religion forbids people not to love their mother. There is no happiness that we get in the afterlife if we don't respect and love our mother. That is an important point of the personal branding that I took...I think this branding is not something that is rather difficult if it is against my character, because I am a mother so the character is attached. The people of Gowa have always regarded as the mother of the people of Gowa from the past. So, it fits perfectly. People know that the female politician who can protect the people of Gowa is me" (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Tenri in Makassar, 23 April 2016).

In addition, Tenri said that the word *SAYANG* is an acronym for the political tagline of Syahrul Yasin Limpo, who is Tenri's younger brother who managed to win the majority of the votes in Gowa. Through an association with Syahrul Yasin Limpo, Tenri hoped to gain a multiplier effect and take advantage of it, especially when Syahrul's followers from Golkar voted her.

560

In sum, Tenri's tagline *SAYANG IBU* intends to emphasize her femininity especially gender identity as a mother *(ibu)*. Here, we can see the presence of femininity as defined by Lewin (1984) as cited from Hoffman, Borders, Hattie (2000: 479) which suggested femininity be conceptualized as "the gender-relevant aspects of a person's self-concept". Through *SAYANG IBU*, Tenri conceptualized her gender identity as mother (of Gowa). By doing so, it does not only suit her gender identity as a mature woman with extensive political experience, but also reflects her proven track record in women activism in Gowa. She believed that by capitalizing her strong social capital, no other candidates could defeat her. I discover one of the pamphlets with the tagline *SAYANG IBU* below.



Source: picture of 2016 calendar for campaign taken by Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi.

Figure 1. Tagline SAYANG IBU of Tenri's Personal Political Branding

My further observation in the research site reveals that the tagline SAYANG IBU was used in various campaign media such as small pamphlets, banners, and the 2016 calendars which Tenri printed with a total of around 200,000 exemplars. She also promoted the tagline through radio stations and the local television station Celebes TV.

Observing the SAYANG IBU pamphlet, I can see the presence of a non-verbal communication component in it. Tenri and her team used the elements of Islamic piety, especially by wearing veil (kerudung) and choosing a specific color for their official uniform and the picture for the above pamphlet. Tenri paid a lot of attention to the selection of color in her personal political branding. The background of the tagline SAYANG IBU is yellow as she expected to win the sympathy and support from Golkar voters. Although she was not nominated by Golkar, she was the chairperson of the Regional House of Representatives of Gowa for the period of 2009-2014. Thus, she wanted to create a physiological connection with Golkar's base voters by choosing yellow as the color in her tagline background as this color is strongly associated with Golkar. In addition, Tenri expected to gain sympathy from the loyalists of her younger brother Syahrul Yasin Limpo, who was the chief of Golkar of South Sulawesi (2009-2018) and the governor of South Sulawesi (2008-2018).

Tenri also wore a green veil (kerudung hijau) to gain the support of Muslim voters, especially from Nahdlatul Ulama, since she was nominated by the parties PPP and NasDem. Thus, here we can see that Tenri used strategically certain colors to go inside the subconscious element of voters' mind to attract their sympathy. This is in line with Mitsikopoulou' notes (2008: 359) on the presence of a nonverbal communication component in personal political branding as it is essentially "not only elements of a candidate's personality, but also elements of a candidate's appearance such as hairstyle and clothing, provide vivid illustrations of a candidate's image". Tenri really used the "green veil" picture to attract voters as she said that all programs she had promised would be put into practice if they supported her by choosing candidates Number 4 of the "green veil" (kerudung hijau) picture in the election on 9 December 2015 (ronalyw 2015).

562

This finding is again confirming my previous finding of the importance of a veil used and played by a female Muslim politician candidate in direct local elections to signify her public piety to gain political sympathy and acceptability in the third wave of social Islamization (Dewi 2015a, 2017b).

In analyzing Tenri's tagline SAYANG IBU as her personal political branding, I suggests that this tagline does have a focus, but it is not a very compelling brand position and contains of what I call 'gender risk' within a strong political dynasty feature of South Sulawesi which disadvantaged Tenri as explains below.

First, the tagline SAYANG IBU focuses on Tenri's gender identity as mother or mature and experienced women politician in Gowa, but it is not a very compelling brand position. The importance of a tagline in personal political branding is also the case in the United States (US) presidential election in 2016. Whitler and Hodgkins (2016) who analyzed the 2016 United States presidential election said that Trump from the Republican Party used a powerful tagline "Make America Great Again!" because it taps into a belief that 70% of likely voters share; Trump then consistently leveraged every opportunity to connect this tagline to his campaign. In contrast to Trump's tagline according to Whitler and Hodgkins (2016), Hillary Clinton's tagline "Hillary for America" is not a very compelling brand position since it is not anchored on a common problem shared by Americans, nor is it clear how voting for her will benefit the average voters. As a result, Trumps pulled off a victory in the 2016 US presidential election.

In Tenri's case, I think that the tagline SAYANG IBU is not a compelling brand position. Tenri wants to emphasize her uniqueness as a prominent women politician in Gowa, the mother of the people of Gowa, whom people should respect and obey.

To strengthen her figure as the mother of the people of Gowa, Tenri was inspired by the local belief as she said:

"It is said that [previously according to history] when Gowa was split into two by a civil war, the first female king of Gowa will come, a woman who unites Gowa into a great kingdom. So, we want to go back to that [legend] by using a woman. It's said that [the king's name] is Tumanurung Bainia. We believe it because it was written on Lontara. In the campaign, we had inserted it in the pamphlet and socialized it with the other prominent figures" (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Tenri in Makassar, 23 April 2016).

According to Paeni, Poelinggomang, and Mirawati (2002: 50), the creation of social and noble elite stratification in Makassar and South Sulawesi is always returned to extraordinary stories to determine and validate historical experiences that are objectified as their social world; in the case of Gowa, the Kingdom of Gowa appears to unite its confederation with the idea of tumanurung. Here, Tenri even used cultural and historical components to strengthen her personal political branding as a mother. This is in line with "a cultural approach to branding" in Cayla and Arnould (2008: 87), i.e. a brand is a cultural manifestation which should be shaped to reflect social, historical, and geographic aspects of various places of cultures. It is true that Tenri emphasized her strong record as a mature and experienced women politician in Gowa. This is in line with the personal political branding as noted by Mitsikopoulou (2008, p. 359) as well as Haroen (2014, p. 19) suggesting that it should reflects truly someone's characters, namely "who you are", "what you have done", and -"what you will do" (Character, Competence, and Strength).

In her campaign, Tenri strategically focused on women's groups, especially housewives, as she believed that prosperity begins from women (Admin, 2014).

564

She also intentionally used women's networks through a group called SRIKANDI Tenri Olle Yasin Limpo, which is comprised of women, either Muslim or non-Muslim, who supported her (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Tenri in Makassar, 23 April 2016). Tenri said that she gained support from 'Aisyiyah women because she is 'Aisyiyah's prominent member of South Sulawesi.

In sum, the tagline SAYANG IBU focuses on Tenri as a mature and experienced women politician, but it is not a very compelling brand position. It does not reflect strong political messages and leaves too much room for voters to define its meaning. Further observation in the research site discovers that the tagline SAYANG IBU is not followed by a workable tagline. The workable tagline as the derivative of SAYANG IBU that describes or reflects that women are also capable of performing well at work, strong, and multi-tasking (capable of doing household chores and other duties as necessary). However, such a derivative tagline is absent in Tenri's campaign as said by NR, Tenri's former loyalist who joined Adnan's campaign team (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with NR in Gowa, 24 April 2016).

Second, when I use the concept proposed by Aaker (1997), which is five dimensions of brand personality, the tagline SAYANG IBU contains only two elements, namely competence and sincerity. The tagline does not reflect the other three elements of personal political branding proposed by Aaker, namely excitement, sophistication, and ruggedness. Using the tagline, Tenri, on the one hand, shows that she is a mature and experienced women politician and this reflects the elements competency and sincerity. And yet, it does not reflect any points of excitement, sophistication, and ruggedness. This is because, as I have mentioned previously, the tagline SAYANG IBU does not reflect a powerful political tagline that steers people's mind, or is believed to promise some political reforms that will benefit all voters, for example in comparison with Trump's tagline "Make America Great Again!" in the US presidential election in 2016.

Third, I identify of what I call 'gender risk' in the tagline SAYANG IBU which put Tenri at a disadvantage. Analyzes Tenri's with gender and risk theory, as well as femininity, I reveal similar findings with Maxfield, Shapiro, Gupta, and Hass (2010) which shows that women brave to take risk. In this case, Tenri braved to play her femininity. Femininity in this context refers to Lewin (1984) as cited from Hoffman, Borders, Hattie (2000: 479) which suggested that femininity be conceptualized as "the gender-relevant aspects of a person's self-concept" thus allowing for "individual variation in the specific content of the self-image as related to gender". In this case, Tenri played her femininity of her individual's selfconcept or conceptualization of gender identity as mother through personal political branding of SAYANG IBU. While I echoed Maxfield, Shapiro, Gupta, and Hass (2010), I added another point that have not yet revealed in the discussion of gender, risk and femininity. Through Tenri's case, I discover the 'gender risk' or the danger to use femininity in personal political branding of female politician within strong political dynasty feature. Why did it happen?.

My further observation from Tenri's opponent side, especially Adnan, shows an interesting fact. Tenri's tagline SAYANG IBU was used by Adnan's campaign team to weaken Tenri's candidacy. According to NR, one of the key persons in Adnan' campaign team said, "Pak Adnan said [in each campaign] "because I [Adnan] love mothers, thus I suggest that she [mother, Tenri] stay at home, let the children work. Because it is considered a sin when children ask their mother to work" (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with NR in Gowa, 24 April 2016). Here, we can see how Adnan's campaign team with a tagline ADNAN KIO created a powerful narrative to counter Tenri's tagline SAYANG IBU. Adnan's campaign team used and spread this counter-narrative from ear to ear, forming public opinion against Tenri. Thus, the tagline SAYANG IBU which was expected to draw voters' sympathy for a figure of a female politician in fact disadvantaged Tenri and benefited her opponent.

566

I suggest that female politician should be not only smart but also careful in making a tagline for personal political branding involving the gender issue. Female politician has to consider the context and potential strength of the personal political branding tactics used by her opponent. In Tenri's case, it is important to take into account the analysis of the presence of a patriarchal structure in the local context, especially in Gowa and South Sulawesi where a strong political dynasty lies. The thing that has to be noted is that the core element of a political dynasty lies in the strong oligarchs. An oligarch in a political dynasty is always male. Both Tenri and Adnan are part of Yasin Limpo's political dynasty in South Sulawesi. Theoretically, Tenri is a female politician that belongs to the 'familial ties' type.

As defined by Richter (1990-1991: 525-526), 'familial ties' express the influence of male relatives, who are also prominent politicians, on developing and achieving political leadership roles for women. This is also the case of Tenri. Tenri's political career has been facilitated by her father Muhammas Yasin Limpo as a prominent politician in Gowa and then her young brother Syahrul Yasin Limpo as a prominent male politician in South Sulawesi. Rising from the 'familial ties' type, within a strong political dynasty feature, one should be aware of the centrality of male politicians. In Tenri's case, her father or brother is the core of the political dynasty. Back to the 2015 direct local election, Adnan, Tenri's nephew, took advantage of this social construction of a political dynasty cantered on the figure of a male politician. Women, including in Tenri are considered inferior to men in the structure of a political dynasty. Whereas Adnan, a male politician from Yasin Limpo's political dynasty who competed in the 2015 direct local election in Gowa, therefore derived much benefit from the patriarchal political ideology. At this case, personal political branding which emphasized the aspect of femininity namely Tenri's SAYANG IBU proved to create of what I call 'gender risk' which disadvantaged Tenri.

Indah's Personal Political Branding: Smart as the Subconscious Element

To gain comprehensive understanding of the way personal political branding works for female politicians in the other part of South Sulawesi, the second part presents the successful story of Indah Putri Indriani's candidacy. Indah is the first female district head of North Luwu elected in the 2015 direct local election and the first female leader in South Sulawesi's history. North Luwu is one of the 24 districts/municipalities in the Province of South Sulawesi. It consists of 12 sub-districts in 2015 (BPS Kabupaten Luwu Utara 2015, p.1).

There were two pairs of candidates who competed in the 2015 direct local election in North Luwu, namely Indah Putri Indriani (Indah, in short) & Muh. Thahar Rum (Great Indonesia Movement Party (Gerindra), NasDem, Indonesian Democratic Party of Struggle (PDIP), and Democratic Party) and Arifin Junaidi & Andi Abdullah Rahim (PKS, PKB, National Mandate Party (PAN), Hanura, and PPP). Indah was formerly a vice-district of North Luwu (2010-2015) while Arifin Juanaidi was the district head of North Luwu (2010-2015). So, in the 2015 direct local election, Indah competed head-to-head against Arifin Junaidi. Eventually, Indah & Thahar won the election by getting more than 54.86% of the votes while Arifin got approximately 45.14% of the votes (Said, 2015).

Indah was born on 7 February 1977. She comes from Bone bone, North Luwu. Her parents live in Bone bone, North Luwu. Her mother is basically a Muhammadiyah follower while her father is a Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) follower. Indah is the only daughter. Her father is an entrepreneur while her mother is a housewife. Indah's husband is a businessman and a member of the National House of Representatives for the period of 2004-2009 from the Crescent Star Party (Partai *Bulan Bintang* (PBB), the electoral district of Aceh.

568

According to Indah, her husband helped her lobby political parties when she joined the 2015 direct local election in North Luwu. Since she was in college, Indah has actively participated in organizational activities and undertaken numerous social activities. Indah got a Master's degree from the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences at University of Indonesia (UI). Indah then was appointed a guest lecturer at UI and an expert staff of Commission II of the National House of Representatives on the desk of national government and regional autonomy for 5 years. During her service in this commission, she began to develop understanding of the problems facing a local government head. Indah was a legislative candidate for the National House of Representatives from the Crescent Star Party in the 2009 legislative election from the electoral district of Bone bone and Sukamaju. However, she did not succeed despite gaining the second highest number of votes. Her political exposure in North Luwu made Indah quite popular among the people of North Luwu. This was important social capital for her to be selected as the vice-district head in the 2010 direct local election with Arifin Junaidi as her partner.

One of the keys to Indah's success in the 2015 direct local election was her personal political branding. Indah created personal political branding as a female politician who was close to people's heart and mind. During her service as the vice-district head of North Luwu (2010-2015), Indah often went to visit ordinary people to express condolence. Indah wants herself to be a figure who is approachable in the eyes of civilians, children, and women (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016). Some respondents confirmed Indah's statement such as EM a housewife, and R a political activist, stating that Indah is down to earth, approachable, showing respect to older people, humble, responding quickly to any problem arising, and close to people (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with EM and R in North Luwu, 21 April 2016).

Those are some positive records that have been developed during her service as the vice-district head of North Luwu (2010-2015). Afterwards, I asked Indah about her motivation to compete in the 2015 direct local election and she answered,

"My passion is to experience something different like if we meet the public or people ... Based on survey results, I know that my popularity was high in the 2014 survey. People's recognition of the regent [the incumbent Arifin] was higher, but my popularity was even higher. I was informed of the reasons why people like me. According to them, I am responsive, caring, and able to solve problems. Then, I develop it into my branding". (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016).

Based on my interview with Indah, it is clear that she has both an intention and motivation to serve the people of North Luwu by standing as a district head candidate. She also prepared it well by conducting a professional survey to determine her popularity in 2014. In preparation for the 2015 direct local election, Indah conducted a professional survey of her popularity and approval levels. The survey showed that Arifin's popularity as the district head of North Luwu (2010-2015) was higher than Indah's. But, people's approval of Indah who was the vice-district head was higher than results of the survey in 2014. This implied that it did not need much effort for her to win since she already won people's hearts. A combination of Indah's positive track records during her time serving as the vice-district head, her close relationship with the people, and her image as a figure who is pious, smart, responsive, caring, able to solve problems, humble, and hardworking, contributed to her high popularity ahead of the election, which reached 78%.

By the survey, Indah confirmed her strong point and developed further into her personal political branding for the 2015 direct local election.

I asked her about her personal political branding in the 2015 direct local election and she said.

570

"[In the 2015 direct local election] my slogan was *PINTAR*. The most important thing is to attract people, so I want to do something different from other candidates. They usually have anonymous abbreviation... PINTAR unconsciously drew them to vote for Indah & Thahar [Thahar is Indah's partner as the vice-district candidate]. So, I want to go inside their subconscious using a fitting familiar phrase. I did not have to explain this word [PINTAR or clever/smart because people know exactly this word] and the brand clung into people's mind that I am smart...in the beginning I promoted myself using pamphlets, then free calendars. Not many, just 10,000 exemplars" (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016).

Indah also explained further that she also emphasized her young age in her personal political branding. When Indah run as a candidate for the district head in the 2015 direct local election, she was only 38 years old. She added the points of being young, responsive, caring, and able to solve problems. The word young is associated with being energetic. Indah said "actually, when I assumed office as the vice-district head [2010-2015], it was me who was always in the front line every time a problem arose, not the district head" (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016). Here, it is obvious that the tagline PINTAR of Indah's personal political branding was intended to emphasize Indah's strong points, namely young, pious, smart, responsive, caring, able to solve problems, hardworking, and approachable. Indah used the elements of sexuality, i.e. a young and smart woman of North Luwu. I managed to find some of them as presented in Figure 2.

571



Source: picture of campaign pamphlet obtained by Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi.

Figure 2. Tagline *PINTAR* of Indah's Personal Political Branding

Indah socialized this tagline through social media and in the press. Interestingly, in order to target female voters, Indah combined the term *PINTAR* with the word *KARTINI*, which became *KARTINI PINTAR*. *KARTINI PINTAR* was the other subtagline and name which focused especially on women networks of voters from various religious backgrounds (Muslim and Christian) that pledged their support for Indah's candidacy (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016). They staged door-to-door campaigns and, sometimes, religious gatherings. Similar to Indah's case is the 2008 US presidential campaign. Penhollow (no year) analyzes the 2008 US presidential election, especially by pointing out Barack Obama's strong winning campaign slogan 'Yes *We Can*' in combination with his campaign logo which created a strong appeal.

In Indah's case, in my opinion the tagline *PINTAR* had a strong appeal. As there are five dimensions of Aaker's brand personality in the tagline *PINTAR* of Indah's personal political branding. *First*, it contains the elements *sincerity*, *excitement*, and *ruggedness*. As I have explained earlier, Indah has developed her personal political branding as a figure who is responsive, caring, able to solve problems, hard-working, and approachable since she was serving as the vice-district head of North Luwu (2010-2015). She said that sincerity and excitement are in her characters,

572

"I found data in 2014. Indeed, we can measure it... Mrs. Indah was always present in every event. If I did not go to Quran recitation or funeral events, it means that I was away [travelled somewhere out of North Luwu]. That was what people thought. I did not make it up. Because I am an alumni of an Islamic boarding school, I will go to a funeral if I pass by. I never turn off my phone in case of any order. I engage actively in activities organized by PMI [Palang *Merah Indonesia*, Indonesian Red Cross]. I often provide aids. So, there are a lot of social investments. My only capital is social investments. The survey captured my strength and I maximize it [in the 2005 direct local election]" (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016).

Thus, for years, people have got in touch with Indah as a person who was always there whenever they needed her and become close to her, which reflects sincerity and excitement. As for ruggedness, this point is evident from fact that despite her failure in the 2009 legislative election at the same electoral district, she refused to give up and continued to fight for the 2010 direct local election as a candidate for the vice-district head for which she won. In addition, to prove her tagline *PINTAR* to show that she was tough, hard-working, and rugged, Indah strategically portrayed herself as a hard-working female politician in her political branding as she said,

"I looked for a picture showing my face at work. I took a picture at night [she showed me a picture of her wearing a light brown veil (kerudung) in government uniform and putting on light make-up]. Because they know that I am a hard worker. I know that in the morning I am going outside office [to do works such as doing inspection, checking projects to the project site, and so on] and will be back in the afternoon. I am in the office. If there are no other social activities, I change my clothes. At that time, we just finished an event at 8 in the evening...So my face looked tired, did not seem like someone who just finished putting on make-up, but just finished working. I wore the dark purple uniform as the daily civil servant outfit. So, I thought it reinforced people's opinion". (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016).

Clearly she prepared the details of the picture by carefully choosing certain colors and wearing a uniform that she wanted the public to see in order to reinforce her strong characters of being tough, hard-working, and rugged. Selection of the right picture played a vital role in influencing people's mind and eventually conforming Indah's personal political branding.

Second, the tagline PINTAR also reflects the element competence. Indah is a competent politician as she has political experience as the former vice-district head of North Luwu (2010-2015) and has strong women's networks which she turned into a group called KARTINI PINTAR. The choice of the word KARTINI reflects Indah's awareness of the prominent female figure in Indonesian history. Using the name KARTINI PINTAR, Indah were able to gather 'Aisyiyah and Muslimat NU followers.

Third, the element sophistication is reflected in the tagline PINTAR because this word means smart. According to Indah, people know her as a smart person. Moreover, this word is also universal and easy to remember without her having to give any further explanation (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016). Indah said that with the tagline PINTAR, she did not use the campaign slogan "women vote for women" and did not specially highlight special programs for women because she wanted people not to think exclusively that she only represents women. Instead, she wanted people to have wider thoughts. Thus, she created and used the slogan "women for North Luwu and North Luwu for the world" (perempuan untuk Luwu Utara dan Luwu Utara untuuk dunia) instead because, for her, North Luwu means the world (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016). Here, from this statement, it is revealed that Indah inserted the subconscious element through the word PINTAR which refers to Indah's characters and profile as a smart and promising female leader who is ready to serve all the people of North Luwu, regardless of gender. She did not want to emphasize her position in advocating women's needs and interests because she did not want to be perceived as merely representing and serving women's votes, interests, and needs.

Indah's position is interesting. Indah said that her opponent's tagline (for example *ARA* for Arifin Junaidi and Abdullah Rahim) also contributed to her victory because such a tagline was not universal (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016).

Here in case of Indah, she did not play element of femininity which emphasized her femaleness. This is confirmed with her position not to create specific tagline of "women *vote for women*" as mentioned earlier. Interestingly, Indah's case is in line with Paechter's research on masculinity and femininity in power (2006: 257) that "distancing oneself from stereotypical femininity, on the other hand, is a claiming of power". Instead of emphasizing femininity, Indah highlighted her 'power' by slogan *PINTAR* which refers to Indah's characters and profile as a smart and promising female leader who is ready to serve all the people of North Luwu, regardless of gender.

Indah also used the element of local history in order to more convince voters to choose her. She said that in the local history of Luwu Kingdom, the third Datuk of Luwu was female, namely Datuk SimweSimpurusiang. Interestingly, because Indah run as a candidate for the district head in 2015, the third district head of North Luwu would also be female if she won the election. Therefore, she tried to reassure her voters to choose her because according to the history of Luwu Kingdom, the third Datuk was female (Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi's interview with Indah in North Luwu, 20 April 2016). Further observation shows that according to the Bugis and Makassar people as well as the Mandarese, Kedatuan Luwu is believed to be the origin of the kings in South Sulawesi, which was also written in *I La Galigo* that the first king from the sky in Luwu was called "Batara Guru" (Abidin 1999: 103-104). So, by using the cultural and historical element, which people believe in, Indah intends to gain cultural legitimation of her political rise in North Luwu. In addition, through Indah's case, this paper shows that it is not always necessary for female politicians to highlight their femininity in personal political branding.

575

Instead, within a strong political dynasty, these female politicians may choose to use and play their strongest point such as being smart, young, responsive, caring, hard-working, and reliable.

DISCUSSION

I suggest that the tagline *PINTAR* of Indah's personal political branding in North Luwu, has created a strong appeal. As there are five dimensions of brand personality proposed by Aaker found in the tagline, namely sincerity, excitement, ruggedness, competence, and sophistication. This word PINTAR which means smart, has a universal meaning which can easily go into the subconscious element of people's mind, convincing them to trust Indah as a young, smart, and promising candidate. Whereas the tagline SAYANG IBU of Tenri's personal political branding does have a focus, but it is not a very compelling brand position, leaves too much room for voters to define, and contains only two elements of Aaker's brand personality, namely competence and sincerity. I would like to advise female politicians that the use of femininity in personal political branding in the setting of a strong political dynasty which is highly patriarchal contains of what I call 'gender risk' which potentially disadvantaged them. For example, Tenri's tagline SAYANG IBU. This tagline was focused on her femininity by especially emphasized gender identity as mother (of Gowa) and selling her strong track record as a mature and experienced women politician. However, it should be used carefully by considering the local political context, especially a highly patriarchal political dynasty. Please note that the core element of a political dynasty lies on strong oligarchs. Oligarchs in a political dynasty are always male. Tenri and Adnan (Tenri's main competitor) are both part of Yasin Limpo's political dynasty in South Sulawesi. Theoretically, Tenri is a female politician that belongs to the 'familial ties' type. Rising from the 'familial ties' type, within a strong political dynasty feature, one should be aware of the centrality of male politicians.

576

In Tenri's case, her father or brother is the core of the political dynasty. So, in the 2015 direct local election, Adnan, Tenri's nephew, took advantage of this social construction of a political dynasty cantered on the figure of a male politician. Whereas, women in this case is Tenri are considered inferior to men in the structure of a political dynasty.

My research reveals that there was a counter-narrative against the tagline *SAYANG IBU* suggesting that mothers (Tenri) had better stay at home and leave any work to their children (male, Adnan). From this case, it can be concluded that the tagline *SAYANG IBU* when used in an area with a strong political dynasty where patriarchal ideology is the core, provoked a backlash which in turn disadvantages female politicians. This may not be realized by voters. And yet, it shows the significance of the subconscious element of patriarchal ideology in personal political branding. Here, female politicians should be aware of this issue, especially in today's strengthening era of political dynasties.

What Tenri has done can also be explained from the tendency that voters view female candidates and male candidates differently where they regard women more capable of dealing with "feminine" issues such as child care and education but less able to handle "masculine" issues such as wars and economy as noted by Herrnson, Lay, and Stokes (2003, 245). Consequently, the ways women organize their campaign often differ from the ways men organize their campaign in terms of the strategy they each use. In reality, it depends on the socio-political context of the era. For example, women campaigning for the U.S Senate between 1982 and 1986 did not do so by putting much emphasis on the female stereotype; while in 1992, the "year of women" in the U.S., female candidate televised campaign ads emphasized their "feminine image traits" as noted by William 1994 in Herrnson, Lay, and Stokes (2003, 246).

Finally, Herrnson, Lay, and Stokes (2003) who examine the effect of the interplays of candidate gender and campaign strategy using a new data set by conducting a survey to the US House of Representative candidates who run for office in 1996 or 1998 discover that women gained a strategic advantage when they "run women" by stressing the issues that voters associate favorably with female candidates and targeting female voters. Here, it is clear that cases that took place in the United States suggest that the effect arising from candidates' sex varied from election to election.

Fox and Oxley (2003: 835) who review the presence of gender stereotyping in the political arena state that when women run for electoral office, gender stereotyping occurs sometimes to their advantage but more often to their detriment. Campbell and Heath (2017: 210) state that the link, if any, between candidates' sex and voting behavior is not straightforward and is also highly context-specific.

Based on the two cases of personal political branding of female politicians observed, as well as the literature discussed above, I think that following voters' stereotyping of different policy position and potential performance by male and female candidates is not always profitable in campaign since it depends on the socio-political context of time and region.

Rusnaedy and Purwaningsih (2018) analyze the competition between Tenri and Adnan in the 2015 direct local election and note that Adnan's victory resulted from the legacy of his father Ichsan Yasin Limpo who provided him with several important capital such as finances, strong achievement during the rule of his father, loyalist base voters, and bureaucratic apparatus standing behind Adnan. By doing so, the analysis performed by this paper goes beyond the previous findings by presenting and revealing the complexity of the narrative behind the tagine *SAYANG IBU* in Tenri's personal political branding.

CONCLUSION

By analyzing personal political branding of two female politicians who competed in the 2015 direct local election in South Sulawesi, this paper successfully reveals various elements. First, this paper strengthens the theoretical standpoint on personal political branding which believes that it should reflect one's individual uniqueness, strong track records, skills, values, and passions that differentiate him/her from others as noted by Omojola (2008) or Brooks and Anumudu (2016) or "who you are", "what you have done, and "what you will do" (Haroen 2014). This can be seen from the fact that the tagline SAYANG IBU of Tenri's personal political branding was derived from her interactions and services for many years to meet and safeguard women's needs and interests while sitting as a member of the Regional House of Representatives of Gowa since 2004 to 2014. This makes her a mature and experienced women politician whom people know as the mother of Gowa. Similarly, Indah's tagline *PINTAR* as her personal political branding has been developed over years. She has developed this branding since she was the vice-district head of North Luwu (2010-2015). PINTAR which means smart reflects Indah's strong points, namely young, pious, smart, responsive, caring, able to solve problems, hardworking, and approachable. Both examples of personal political branding above have been created based on the strongest points of each female politician. Interestingly, both taglines used to create personal political branding by both candidates contain the element of sexuality, namely mature women for SAYANG IBU which emphasized the figure of a mother, and young women for PINTAR since Indah was only 38 years old when she run as a candidate for the district head of North Luwu.

Second, this paper also reveals the non-verbal communication element in both taglines. For example in SAYANG IBU and PINTAR pamphlets, this paper founds the use of a symbol that indicates Islamic piety such as wearing a veil (kerudung) for both taglines. This is important as both female politicians run in the region with a predominantly Muslim community.

578

In addition, the non-verbal communication was also established through the use of color such as the background of the tagline SAYANG IBU was yellow because Tenri wanted to win sympathy and support from Golkar voters. Tenri also wore a green veil to gain the support of Muslims, especially from Nahdlatul Ulama, since she was nominated by the parties PPP and Nasdem. In the case of the tagline *PINTAR* used by Indah, she prepared the details of the picture by carefully choosing certain colors and wearing a uniform that she wanted the public to see in order to reinforce her strong characters of being tough, hard-working, and rugged. Both color selection and selection of the styles shown in the photograph are equally important to go inside people's mind to strengthen the personal political branding of Tenri and Indah. Here this paper agrees with Mitsikopoulou (2008: 359) on the presence of a non-verbal communication component in personal political branding that it is essentially "not only elements of a candidate's personality, but also elements of a candidate's appearance such as hairstyle and clothing, that provide vivid illustrations of a candidate's image".

Third, this paper reveals the use of cultural elements in the creation and development of the two personal political branding taglines. Tenri inserted the element of cultural belief, which is a female ruler of Gowa named Tumanurung Bainia. Tenri said that she had inserted it in the pamphlets and socialized it during the campaign. Similarly, Indah also used the local history of Kingdom Luwu, where the third Datuk of Luwu was female named Datuk Simwe Simpurusiang. Here, this paper reveals the use of cultural components, i.e. local history, in order to strengthen female politicians' personal political branding as said by Cayla and Arnould (2008: 87) that a brand is a also cultural manifestation which reflects social, historical, and geographic aspects of various places of cultures. Fourth, this paper also discovers an interesting finding in Indah's case in North Luwu.

580

In her tagline *PINTAR*, Indah did not use the campaign slogan "women vote for women" and did not specially highlight special programs for women because she did not want people to think exclusively that she only represents women. Instead, she wanted people to have wider thoughts. She created and used the slogan "women for North Luwu and North Luwu for the world". Research by Campbell and Heath (2017) entitled "Do Women Vote for Women Candidates? Attitudes toward Descriptive Representation and Voting Behavior in the 2010 British Election" shows that women do not react in a homogenous way to the sex of the candidate; and the assumption that women are more likely to vote for women candidates is therefore too simplistic and assumes a uniformity of motivations for doing so that are not present in practice. In Indah's case, it seems that she was aware of the fact that focusing on her gender or femininity would mean narrowing her target voters to women only that did not necessarily or automatically support her.

Within a strong patriarchal political culture, she would not gain any advantage from focusing on the specific issues of women's voters and women's interests. Despite the fact that her opponents may gain benefit from her narrow campaign, she wanted to represent herself as the future leader for all the people, not only for women. Here, again, this paper shows that the slogan or tagline "women *vote for women*" does not always work for any female politician as it depends on the political context, time and region.

Fifth, through personal political branding with taglines SAYANG IBU and PINTAR, this paper reveals different findings from those obtained by Shames (2003: 116) suggesting that femininity can help all candidates (both male and female ones) as a differentiation tool that makes them stand out, while masculinity often makes a candidate looks just like any other candidates in a political setting characterized by male domination and masculinity.

In the setting characterized by a strong political dynasty, the element of femininity should be exploited carefully as they may open up wider opportunity for male opponents to launch a counter-attack to weaken or against female politicians' candidate by emphasizing the patriarchal ideology of male centrality in politics.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The initial version of this paper originated from my two papers entitled "The Effect of Concurrent Direct Local Elections on the Political Opportunity of Female Leaders and Prospect of Political Dynasty" presented at the Biannual International Conference on Indonesian Politics and Government 2015, University of Indonesia, Depok, on 2 November 2015, and "Political Branding of Muslim Women Political Leaders in South Sulawesi" presented at the Women in Asia Conference (WIA), University of Western Australia, Perth, on 27 September 2017, which was sponsored by Travel Award for International Seminar by Deputy of Social Sciences and Humanities LIPI.

REFERENCES

- Admin. (2014, 22 September). Tenri Olle Dekati Perempuan Pemilih. *Koran Tempo*. Retrieved from https://koran.tempo.co/read/352505/tenri-olle-dekati-perempuan-pemilih (10 September 2018).
- Aaker, Jennifer L. (1997). Dimensions of Brand Personality. Journal of Marketing Research, 34 (3), 347-356.
- Abidin, Andi Zainal. (1999). *Capita Selecta Kebudayaan Sulawesi Selatan*. Ujungpandang: Hasanuddin University
 Press
- Barr, M. D. (2016). Ordinary Singapore: the decline of Singapore exceptionalism. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, 46(1), 1-17.
- Purdey, J., Aspinall, E., & As' ad, M. U. (2016). Understanding family politics: Successes and failures of political dynasties in regional Indonesia. *South East Asia Research*, *24*(*3*), 420-435.

- Aspinall, E., & Sukmajati, M. (Eds.). (2016). *Electoral dynamics in Indonesia: Money politics, patronage and clientelism at the grassroots*. NUS Press.
- Brooks, Ann K., and Anumudu, Chinedu. (2016). Identity Development in Personal Branding Instruction: Social Narratives and Online Brand Management in a Global Economy. *Adult Learning*, 27 (1), 23-29.
- Buehler, Michael. (2013). Married with Children. Retrieved formhttp://www.insideindonesia.org/married-with-children (22 February 2018)
- Buehler, Michael. (2012). Angels and Demons. Retrieved from http://www.insideindonesia.org/angels-and-demons-2 (22 February 2018)
- Brenner, S. (2011). Private Moralities in the Public Sphere:
 Democratization, Islam, and Gender in Indonesia.

 AmericanAnthropologist, 113(3),479–490.

 https://www.wcaanet.org/downloads/dejalu/may_2013/brenner.pdf
- BPS Kabupaten Gowa. (2015). *Kabupaten Gowa Dalam Angka* 2015. Sungguminasa: BPS Kabupaten Gowa.
- BPS Kabupaten Luwu Utara. (2015). *Luwu Utara Dalam Angka* 2015. Masamba: BPS Kabupaten Luwu Utara.
- Campbell, Rosie., and Heath, Oliver. (2017). Do Women Vote for Women Candidates? Attitudes toward Descriptive Representation and Voting Behavior in the 2010 British Election. *Politics & Gender*, 13, 209 –231.
- Cayla, Julien., and Arnould, Eric J. (2008). A Cultural Approach to Branding in the Global Market Place. *Journal of International Marketing*. 16 (4), 86.
- Connel, R.W. (2008). *Gender*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Constantinople, A. (1973). Masculinity-femininity: An exception to a famous dictum?. *Psychological bulletin*, 80(5), 389.
- Dewi, Kurniawati Hastuti (ed). (2018). Modal, Strategi dan Jaringan Perempuan Politisi dalam Kandidasi Pilkada Langsung. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.

(ed). (2017a). Perempuan Kepala

PEMERINTAHAN

Daerah dalam Jejaring Oligarki Lokal. Jakarta: LIPI Press.

- Dewi, Kurniawati Hastuti Dewi. (2017b). Piety and Sexuality 583 in a Public Sphere: Experiences of Javanese Muslim-Women's Political Leadership. *Asian Journal of Women's Studies*, 23 (3), 340-362.
- Dewi, Kurniawati Hastuti (ed). (2016). *Kebangkitan Perempuan Tabanan dalam Politik Lokal*. Tangerang:
 Mahara Publishing.
- Dewi, Kurniawati Hastuti. (2015a). *Indonesian Women and Local Politics: Islam, Gender and Netwoks in Post-Suharto Indonesia*. Singapore: National University of Singapore Press and Kyoto University Press.
- Dewi, Kurniawati Hastuti. (2015b). "The Effect of Concurrent Direct Local Elections on the Political Opportunity of Female Leaders and Prospect of Political Dynasty," working paper presented in The Biannual International Conference on Indonesian Politics and Government 2015, University of Indonesia, Depok, 2-3 November.
- Firmanzah. (2012). *Marketing Politik: Antara Pemahaman dan Realitas*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Florentin, Vindri. (2017, 7 January). 58 Political Dynasties Developing in Indonesia: ICW. Retrieved from https://en.tempo.co/read/news/2017/01/07/055833645/58-Political-Dynasties-Developing-in-Indonesia-ICW (22 February 2018)
- Fox, Richard L., and Zoe M. Oxley. (2003). Gender Stereotyping in State Executive Elections: Candidate Selection and Success. *The Journal of Politics*, 65 (3), 833-850.
- Haroen, Dewi. (2014). Personal Branding: *Kunci Kesuksesan Berkiprah di Dunia Politik*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

- Herrnson, Paul S., J Celeste Lay, Atiya Kai Stokes. (2003). Women Running "as Women": Candidate Gender, campaign Issues and Voter-Targeting Strategies. *The Journal of Politics*, 65 (1), 244-255.
- Hamid, A. (2014). A Family Matter: Political Corruption in Banten, Indonesia. *Asian Politics and Policy*, 6 (4), pp. 577–593.
- Hasan, Noorhaidi. (2009). The Making of Public Islam: Piety, Agency, and Commodification on the Landscape of the Indonesian Public Sphere. *Contemporary Islam* 3, 229–50.
- Harding, S. (1987). The Method <u>Question</u>. *Hypatia*, 2 (3), pp. 30. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/3810120.
- Hidayat, Syarif. (2009). Pilkada, Money Politics and the Dangers of "Informal Governance" Practices. In Maribeth Erb, & Priyambudi Sulistiyanto (Eds.), *Deepening Democracy in Indonesia? Direct Elections for Local Leaders (Pilkada)*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Hill, H. (Ed.). (2014). *Regional Dynamics in a Decentralized Indonesia*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Hoffman, Rose Marie., Borders, L. DiAnne. Hattie., John A. (2000). *Journal of Social Behavior and Personality* 15 (4), 475-503.
- Kachel S., Steffens MC., and Niedlich C. (2016). Traditional Masculinity and Femininity: Validation of a New Scale Assessing Gender Roles. *Frontiers in Psychology* 7, 1-19.
- Kimmel, Michael S. (2004). *The Gendered Society*. 2nd ed. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Kumar, Amit., Dhamija, Somesh., Dhamija, Aruna. (2016). The Changing Paradigm of Modern-day Politics: A Case of Political Branding and its Indian Connect. *NMIMS Management Review*, vol. xxx , 77-86.
- Lewin, M. (Ed.). (1984). Handbook of Fiber Science and Technology Volume 2: Chemical Processing of Fibers and Fabrics--Functional Finishes (Vol. 2). CRC Press.

LSI. (2007). Perempuan dan Pilkada. *Kajian Bulanan*, 1, 1–9. Masaaki, O., & Hamid, A. (2008). Jawara in Power 1999-2007. *Indonesia*, 86, pp. 109–138. Retrieved from <a href="https://cip.cornell.edu/DPubS?service=Repository&version=1.0&verb=Disseminate&view=body&content-type=pdf_1&handle=seap.indo/1227644180#"

Jurnal Studi Pemerintahan

Maxfield, Sylvia., Shapiro, Mary., Gupta, Vipin., Hass, Susan. (2010). Gender and Risk: Women, Risk Taking and Risk Aversion. *Gender in Management: An International Journal* 25 (7), 586 – 604

585

- Mitsikopoulou, Bessie. (2008). Introduction: The Branding of Political Entities as Discursive Practice. *Journal of Language and Politics*, 7(3), 359.
- Mietzner, M. (2011). Funding Pilkada: Illegal Campaign Financing in Indonesia's Local Election. In E. Aspinall, & G. van Klinken (Eds.), *The State and Illegality in Indonesia* (pp. 123–138). Leiden: KITLV Press.
- Masaaki, Okamoto., Atsushi, Ota, and Suaedy, Ahmad. (2010). Introduction. In Ota Atsushi, Masaaki Okamoto and Ahmad Suaedy (Eds.), *Islam in Contention: Rethinking Islam and State in Indonesia*. Jakarta: The Wahid Institute, CSEAS, CAPAS.
- Mujani, Saiful., Liddle, R. William., Ambardi, Kuskridho. (2012). Kuasa Rakyat: Analisis tentang Perilaku Memilih dalam Pemilihan Legislatif dan Presiden Indonesia Pasca-Orde Baru. Bandung: Mizan.
- Nordholt, H. S., & van Klinken, G. (2007). *Politik Lokal di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia & KITLV.
- Nwanganga, Achor Princewell., Nwachukwu Chima Peter, Udensi Mirian I. (2017). Political Branding/Brand Personality and Voter's Choice of Candidate: An Empirical Inquiry into 2015 Presidential Election in Nigeria. *Journal of Marekting and Consumer Research*, 37: 1-15.

- Omojola, Oladokun. (2008). Audience Mindset and Influence on Personal Political Branding. *Journal Social Science* 16 (2): 127-134.
- Paeni, Mukhlis., Poelinggomang, Edward L., and Mirawati, Ina. (2002). *Batara Gowa Messianisme dalam Gerakan Sosial di Makassar*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press dan Arsip Nasional Republik Indonesia.
- Paechter, Carrie. (2006). Masculine Femininities/Feminine Masculinities: Power, Identities and Gender. *Gender and Education* 18 (3), 253-263.
- Pradhanawati, Ari. (2011). Perilaku Pemilih di Era Politik Pencitraan dan Pemasaran Politik. *FORUM*, vol. 39 (1), 10. Penhollow, Steve. No year. The Importance of Branding in ModernPoliticalCampaigns. Retrieved from
 - http://www.brittonmdg.com/the-britton-blog/politics-in-branding-importance (5 September 2018)
- Perludem. (2015). Jalan Terjal Perempuan Kepala Daerah Terpilih: Potret Keterpilihan Perempuan dan Tantangan Lahirkan Kebijakan Pro Perempuan. Jakarta: Perkumpulan untuk Pemilu dan Demokrasi.
- Prasetyawan, W. (2012). Image construction in politics: political advertisement in the 2009 Indonesian election. *Sojourn: Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia, 27(2), 310-327.*
- Ratnawati, Tri. (2009). Gender and Reform in Indonesian politics: the case of a Javanese Women Bupati. In Maribeth Erb and Priyamudi Sulistiyanto (Eds.), Deepening Democracy in Indonesia? Direct Elections for Local Leaders (Pilkada). Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Rusnaedy, Zaldi., and Titin Puwaningsih. (2018). Keluarga Politik Yasin Limpo Pada Pemilihan Kepala Daerah di Kabupaten Gowa Tahun 2015. *JURNAL POLITIK*, 3 (2).

- Ronalyw. (2015). Tenri Olle Silaturahmi dan Pemantapan Tim.

 Retrievedfrom

 http://beritakotamakassar.fajar.co.id/berita/2015/12/02/tenri-olle-silaturahmi-dan-pemantapan-tim/ (10 September 2018)
- Rinaldo, Rachel. (2008). Envisioning the Nation: Women Activists, Religion and the Public Sphere in Indonesia. *Social Forces*, 86 (4), 1781-1804.
- Richter, Linda K. (1990–1991). Exploring Theories of Female Leadership in South and Southeast Asia. *Pacific Affairs* 63 (4), 524–40.
- Robison, R., & Hadiz, V. (2004). Reorganising power in *Indonesia: The politics of oligarchy in an age of markets*. Routledge.
- Satriyo, Hana A. (2010). Pushing The Boundaries: Women in Direct Local Elections And Local Government. In Edward Aspinall and Marcus Mietzner (Eds.), *Problems of Democratisation in Indonesia: Elections, Institutions and Society.* Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Scammell, Margaret. (2007). Political Brands and Consumer Citizens: The Rebranding of Tony Blair. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 611, 176.
- Schlegel, Alice. (1990). "Gender Meanings: General and Specific". In Peggy Reeves Sandy and Ruth Gallagher Goodenough (Eds.), *Beyond the Second Sex: New Directions in the Anthropology of Gender*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Sanghvi, Minita., & Hodges, Nancy. (2015). Marketing the Female Politician: An Exploration of Gender and Appearance. *Journal of Marketing Managament*, 31 (15-16), 1676-1694.
- Shames, Shauna. (2003). "The "Un-Candidates": Gender and Outsider Signals in Women's Political Advertisements. *Women & Politics*, 25 (1/2), 115-147.

- Smith, Gareth. & Alan French. (2009). The Political Brand: A Consumer Perspective. *Marketing Theory*, 9 (2), 209–226
- Said, M. Kiblat. (2015, 9 December). Putri Indriani Unggul Sementara di Luwu Utara. *Beritasatu*. Retrieved from http://www.beritasatu.com/pilkada/329388-putri-indriani-unggul-sementara-di-luwu-utara.html (11 September 2018).
- Spence, J. T. (1985). Achievement American style: The rewards and costs of individualism. *American Psychologist*, 40(12), 1285.
- University of Airlangga. (2011). *Perempuan dalam Pemilukada:* Kajian tentang Kandidasi Perempuan di Jawa Timur dan Sulawesi Utara. Jakarta: Kemitraan bagi Pembaruan Tata Pemerintahan di Indonesia, 2011.
- Whitler, Kimberly A., and Jay Hodgkins. (2016). Branders-In-Chief: The Role Of Branding In *The Clinton Vs. Trump*Presidential Election.
- Yayasan Satunama. (2015). Perempuan di Pilkada Serentak 2015: Perspektif dan Lingkar Kekuasaan di Sekitaran Calon Perempuan Peserta Pilkada. Yogyakarta: Yayasan Satunama.