Available online at Loquen: English Studies Journal

# THE EFFECTIVENESS OF COOPERATIVE INTEGRATED READING AND COMPOSITION (CIRC) TECHNIQUE IN TEACHING READING ON NARRATIVE TEXT <br> (An Experimental Research at the Second Grade of MTs AlKhairiyah Pipitan) 

Farah Yunita; Abdul Muin; Fitri Hilmiyati farahyunitadiba24@gmail.com; abdulmuin@uinbanten.ac.id; fhilmiyati@yahoo.co.id

State Islamic University of Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten


#### Abstract

This research investigates the effectiveness of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique in teaching reading on narrative text. This research conducted based on the problems: 1) How is the students' reading comprehension on narrative text before using CIRC technique at the second grade of MTs Al-Khairiyah Pipitan? 2) How apply is CIRC technique to students' reading comprehension on narrative text at the second grade of MTs Al-Khairiyah Pipitan? 3) How effective is CIRC technique in teaching reading on narrative text at the second grade of MTs Al-Khairiyah Pipitan? To answer the questions, the writer collects data from 60 students spread into two classes, one class as experimental class and another one is as control class. the writer takes the sample from VIII E as experimental class and VIII F as control class. the experimental class was taught using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique and control class taught using Grammar Translation Method (GTM). Since the research used experimental research, the data is gathered through pre-test and post-test. The result of the reseach shows that the value tobservasition is 3,77 the writer compared it with table both in degree significance $5 \%$ and $1 \%$. Therefore, $t_{0}: t_{t}=3,77>2,00$ in degree significance $5 \%$ and $t_{0}: t_{t}=3,77>2,66$ in degree of significance $1 \%$. The statistic hypothesis states that if $t_{0}$ is hugher than $t_{t}$, it shows that $H_{a}$ (alternative hypothesis) of the result is accepted and $H_{o}$ (null hypothesis) is rejected. It means that significance is the effectiveness of CIRC technique in teaching reading on narrative text.


Keywords: Reading, Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique, Narrative Text.

The Effectiveness Of Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) Technique In Teaching Reading On Narrative Text

## INTRODUCTION

English is one of international languages, widely used and studied all over the world. Nowadays, English has been important in international interaction. There are many aspects, such as: education, economy, and politics. In learning English, the students are required to master four basic skills of English, such as: speaking, listening, reading and writing. One of language skills that should be learnt by students is reading. Reading is considered is a necessary skill because its role in facilitating students to master English.

Reading is a process to get the information and increase our knowledge. Therefore, reading is important for the students because the success of their study depends on their ability to read. If their reading skill is poor, they likely fail in their study or at least they will be difficulty to understand their entire lesson.

Based on the observation made by the writer, which was conducted at MTs Al-Khairiyah Pipitan. The students have difficulty in learning reading text, especially on narrative text. They cannot find main idea and the generic structure of narrative text. In the other hand, the students get bored when learning reading. Usually, the way of teaching from many teachers makes the students bored and lazy. The teacher should has innovation to find interesting and fun technique for teaching reading. The students will be fun with a new technique and make the spirit to learning reading.

Thus, one of the appropriate technique to increase interest and understanding of learning to reading student is Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC). Donal states that, "Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition is technique which is based on cooperation. It is designed to develop reading, writing, vocabulary and spelling". With this technique, the students will be relaxed, entertained, and motivated to learning reading and will be helped their ability in understanding learning to read. Some of the technique which used in Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition, such as: reading groups, teams, and story-related activities. This technique helped by
students learnt in a group and cooperatively in completing tasks given by the teacher.

Based on the definition above, the writer hopes that Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique in teaching reading on narrative text can be effective technique that can improve students' reading comprehension. In the other hand, can make students have more relaxed, entertained, motivated and active in the classroom. Therefore, in this study the writer wanted to take the research on "The Effectiveness of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Technique in Teaching Reading on Narrative Text: An Experimental Research At the Second Grade of MTs Al-Khairiyah Pipitan."

## 1. Definition of Reading

Reading is one of important academic skills needed by students as source of knowledge and enjoyment. Fatel and Praveen states that "Reading is most useful and important skill for people. Reading is a source of joys. Good reading is that which keeps students regular in reading which provide him both pleasure and profit". Here, the students will be get pleasure and profit if many read books because they get more many knowledge.

According to Judi Moreillon "reading is making meaning from print and from visual information. Reading is an active process that requires a great deal of practice and skill". And than, Kristin Lems states that "Reading is an interactive process that takes place between the text and the reader's processing strategies and background knowledge."

## 2. Definition of Reading Comprehension

According to Snow "Reading comprehension is the process of simultaneously extracting and constructing meaning through interaction and involvements with written language". Lewin also revealed that "Reading comprehension is a very complex activity, so much occurs inside the mind of a reader as the eyes glides over the printed words".

The Effectiveness Of Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) Technique In Teaching Reading On Narrative Text

## 3. The Types of Reading

There are four types of reading, such as: intensive reading, extensive reading, aloud reading, and silent reading. According to M. Jean Preveen:
a. Intensive Reading

Intensive reading is related to further progress in language learning under the teacher's guidance. In material of intensive reading,such as: short stories, novels, plays, and poems, articles on scientific discoveries, artistic achievement, political development, and aspects of contempory community life in a country where the language is spoken. The reading is done to carry out to get specific information and students read a book to acquire knowledge.
b. Extensive reading

Extensive reading is reading for pleasure. The students wants to know about something. The students does not care about specific or important information after reading. Extensive reading assignments may direct students to articles of current interest in foreign language magazines or newspapers.
c. Aloud Reading

Aloud reading also play important role in teaching of English. According to Venktes, only those text should be read aloud, which have been written to read aloud like poetry, dialogue, and other type of text.
d. Silent Reading

Silent reading is a very important skill in teaching of English. This reading should be emplayed to increase reading ability among students. teacher has to make them read silently as and when they are able to read withoud any difficulties. And students are enabled to read without any audible whisper.

## 4. Assessing of Reading

According to Brown said that: "Assessment is the gathering of information for the purpose of guiding instruction to offer peak performance, knowing that their responses are being measured and
evaluated. A good assessment uses specific and appropriate language to describe the data gathered"

According to Andriyani, there are five aspects in reading which help students to comprehend English text i.e, main idea, specific information, inference, reference, and vocabulary.
a. Main Idea

Main idea is the most important part of the text because it tells about what is the test tells about. the sentence that states the main idea is called topic sentence or topic statement and it can be located in the beginning, in the middle or at the end of the text.
b. Specific Information

Supporting detail or specific information develops the topic sentence by giving definition, examples, facts, an incidents, comparison analogy, cause and effect statistics and quotation. Supporting detail help the reader to understand the text and its position sometimes after the main idea or topic sentence.
c. Inference

Inference is an educational guess or prediction about something unkown based on available facts and information. Inference is an important skill because it helps the reader fills information that writer only suggests.

## d. Reference

Reference is word or phrases use either before or after the reference in reading material. In other words, such words are used, they are signals to the readers to find the meaning elsewhere in the text.
e. Vocabulary

A child's vocabulary is strongly realated to his comprehension and ease of learning to read. Knowing the meaning of the words on the page is essential for reading comprehension. Concerning with those statements indeed vocabulary is primary for everyone who wants to speak or to produce utterances of reading.

The Effectiveness Of Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) Technique In Teaching Reading On Narrative Text

## 5. Narrative Text

According to McQuillan "a narrative text is a story that is told in language and converted into language signs". It means that the readers use language to tell the story to the listener. However, some reader cannot be identified with the writer. The reader use signs to deliver a message to the listeners. Therefore, the readers not only use a language to deliver a message of the story to the listener, but also usage a language sign to information to the listener. Kheryadi (2017) added that writing needs students' creativity, imagination, and knowledge to arrange what their ideas in their minds will bear in written response.

Anderson states that Narrative text types tell a story using spoken or written language. It can be communicated using radio, television, books, newspaper, or computer files, pictures, facial expressions and camera angles can also be used to help communicate meaning. Narratives are usually told by a story teller. This person give his/her point of views to the audience and determines the order in which the events of the story will be told.

## 6. Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC)

According to Mubarok and Sofiana "Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition is a comprehensive program for teaching reading and writing in the upper elementary and middle grades." In CIRC, the students work in a group to work cooperatively on various activity and the students are expected to have better achievement in reading. It is also to be hoped that group activities in CIRC allow the students to learn the materials and help each other succeeed.

According to Mayer, "Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition, teachers use reading texts and reading groups, much as in traditional reading program. However, all students are assigned to teams composed of two pairs from two different reading group. While, the teacher is working with one reading group, the paired students in the other groups are working on a series of cognitively engaging activities, including reading to one another, making predictions about how narrative stories will come out, summarizing stories to one another,
writing responses to stories, and practicing spelling, docoding, and vocabulary."

## 7. The Technique of CIRC

Some of the technique which used in CIRC, there are:

1) Reading Groups

In classes using reading groups, students are assigned to two or three reading groups (eight to fifteen students per group) according to their reading novel, as determined by their teachers. In other classes, students are grouped heterogeneously.

## 2) Teams

Students are assigned to pairs (or triads) within theory reading groups (if any). The pairs are then assigned to teams composed of partnerships from two different reading groups. For example, a team might be composed of mainstreamed accademilly handicapped and remedial reading students are distributed among the teams.
3) Story-related Activities

Students use their regular basal readers or novels. Stories are introduced and discussed in teacher-led reading groups that meet for approximately twenty minutes each day. During these sessions, teachers set a purpose for reading, introduce new vocabulary, review old vocabulary, discuss the story after students have read it, and so on.

## 8. The Steps of CIRC technique

Agus Suprijono describes the steps of this technique that students are formed as group to give opinion toward expression. The steps are:
a) The teacher makes a group which consist of four people who is heterogeneous.
b) The teacher gives discourse or clipping with the topic of learning.
c) The students are cooperative in reading text each other and find the main idea and gives responses of the discourse and written on sheets of paper.
d) The students presented or read the result of their work

The teacher makes a conclusion.

The Effectiveness Of Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) Technique In Teaching Reading On Narrative Text

## METHOD

The study is a quasi-experimental research conducted of MTs AlKhairiyah Pipitan because in the research there will be pre-test and posttest get the data. Two classes where involved in this research, it is experimental class (VIII E) and control class (VIII F). The experimental class consists of the students who received treatment. However, the control class was not. Both classes received a pre-test on whatever instrument is used to assess the effect of the experiment before the treatment has been given.

## TECHNIQUE OF DATA COLLECTING AND DATA ANALYZING

The research used two kinds of research instruments namely interview and test. This technique is used in order to get specific data related to problems of research.

1. Interview

The writer did the interview to an English teacher at the second grade of MTs Al-Khairiyah Pipitan to know the objective condition of the students.
2. Test

In this research, the writer gives the students two tests. Text consists of pre test and post test. The test is purposed to find out whether students reading score is better than before or not.
a. Pre-test

Pre-test is given to student before the writer doing a treatment of teaching in the classroom. In pre-test, both of the experimental class and control class are asked to comprehend reading text without applying Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique. The function of pre-test is to know the main scores of the experimental and the control class before getting treatment. From the pre-test the writer
given passage to the student. The student read of the text then given question such as: multiple choice and fill in the blank.

## b. Post-test

Post-test is given to the student after the writer doing treatment of teaching in the classroom. Form of the post-test the writer given passage to the student. Then student read of text it then given question such as multiple choice and fill in the blank. The function of the post-test is to know the mean scores of the experimental class and the control class after treatment.

## FINDINGS

The Result Calculation of Post-test at the Experimental Class ( $\mathbf{X}_{1}{ }^{1}$ ) and the Control Class ( $\mathrm{X}_{2}{ }^{2}$ )

| $\mathbf{N o}$ | Score |  | $\mathbf{x}_{\mathbf{1}}$ | $\mathbf{x}_{\mathbf{2}}$ | $\mathbf{x}_{\mathbf{1}}{ }^{2}$ | $\mathbf{x}_{\mathbf{2}}{ }^{\mathbf{2}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\mathbf{X}_{\mathbf{1}}$ | $\mathbf{X}_{\mathbf{2}}$ |  |  |  | 62,41 |
| 1 | 63 | 43 | 1,2 | $-7,9$ | 1,44 | $62,41,81$ |
| 2 | 63 | 40 | 1,2 | $-10,9$ | 1,44 | 118,81 |
| 3 | 53 | 60 | $-8,8$ | 9,1 | 77,44 | 82,81 |
| 4 | 40 | 63 | $-21,8$ | 12,1 | 475,24 | 146,41 |
| 5 | 87 | 37 | 25,2 | $-13,9$ | 635,04 | 193,21 |
| 6 | 50 | 60 | $-11,8$ | 9,1 | 139,24 | 82,81 |
| 7 | 63 | 47 | 1,2 | $-3,9$ | 1,44 | 15,21 |
| 8 | 47 | 37 | $-14,8$ | $-13,9$ | 219,04 | 193,21 |
| 9 | 80 | 43 | 18,2 | $-7,9$ | 331,24 | 62,41 |
| 10 | 80 | 40 | 18,2 | $-10,9$ | 331,24 | 118,81 |
| 11 | 67 | 37 | 5,2 | $-13,9$ | 27,04 | 193,21 |
| 12 | 47 | 67 | $-14,8$ | 16,1 | 219,04 | 259,21 |
| 13 | 83 | 70 | 21,2 | 19,1 | 449,44 | 364,81 |
| 14 | 53 | 43 | $-8,8$ | $-7,9$ | 77,44 | 62,41 |
| 15 | 43 | 70 | $-18,8$ | 19,1 | 353,44 | 394,81 |
| 16 | 53 | 37 | $-8,8$ | $-13,9$ | 77,44 | 193,21 |

Farah Yunita; Abdul Muin; Fitri Hilmiyati
The Effectiveness Of Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) Technique In Teaching Reading On Narrative Text

| 17 | 50 | 57 | $-11,8$ | 6,1 | 139,24 | 37,21 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 18 | 80 | 40 | 18,2 | $-10,9$ | 331,24 | 118,81 |
| 19 | 87 | 40 | 25,5 | $-10,9$ | 635,04 | 118,81 |
| 20 | 50 | 73 | $-11,8$ | 22,1 | 139,24 | 488,41 |
| 21 | 47 | 53 | $-14,8$ | 2,1 | 219,04 | 4,41 |
| 22 | 50 | 37 | $-11,8$ | $-13,9$ | 139,24 | 193,21 |
| 23 | 40 | 57 | $-21,8$ | 6,1 | 475,24 | 37,21 |
| 24 | 57 | 43 | $-4,8$ | $-7,9$ | 23,04 | 62,41 |
| 25 | 73 | 43 | 11,2 | $-7,9$ | 125,44 | 62,41 |
| 26 | 63 | 47 | 1,2 | $-3,9$ | 1,44 | 15,21 |
| 27 | 67 | 40 | $-21,8$ | $-10,9$ | 475,24 | 118,81 |
| 28 | 73 | 77 | 11,2 | 26,1 | 125,44 | 681,21 |
| 29 | 83 | 57 | 21,2 | 6,1 | 449,44 | 37,21 |
| 30 | 63 | 70 | 1,2 | 19,1 | 1,44 | 364,81 |
| $\sum$ | 1855 | 1528 | $-25,7$ | 1 | 6696,4 | 4883,9 |

After that the writer calculated them based the $t$-test formula:

1. The average score of experimental class
$\mathrm{M}_{1}=\frac{\sum X_{1}}{N_{1}}=\frac{1855}{30}=61,8$
2. The average score of control class
$\mathrm{M}_{1}=\frac{\sum X_{1}}{N_{1}}=\frac{1528}{30}=50,9$
3. Sum of the squared deviation score of experimental class
$\sum X_{1}{ }^{2}=6696,4$
4. Sum of the squared deviation score of control class
$\sum X_{2}{ }^{2}=4883,9$
5. Determining $t$-table $\left(\mathrm{t}_{\mathrm{t}}\right)$ by using formula:
$\mathrm{df}=\mathrm{N}_{1}+\mathrm{N}_{2}-2=30+30-2=58$

The writer uses df from 58. In degree of significance $5 \%$ from $t_{t}=2,00$ and in degree of significance $1 \%$ from $58_{\mathrm{t}}=2,66$.

From the result of the calculation above, it is obtained that the value of $t_{0}$ ( $t_{\text {observation }}$ ) is 3,77. After that the data, the writer compared it with $\mathrm{t}_{\mathrm{t}}\left(\mathrm{t}_{\text {table }}\right)$ both in degree significance $5 \%$ and $1 \%$.

To prove it, the data obtained from experimental class and control class are calculated with the assumption as follow:
$H_{a}: t_{\text {observation }}>t_{\text {table }}$ : The alternative hypothesis is accepted. It means that there is significant effectiveness of teaching reading comprehension between using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique and without using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique.
$H_{o}$ : $t_{\text {observation }}<t_{\text {table }}$ : The null hypothesis is rejected. It means that there is not significant effectiveness of teaching reading comprehension between using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique and without using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique.

From the result of the calculation above, it is obtained that the value of $t_{0}$ ( $t_{\text {observation }}$ ) is 3,77, degree freedom (df) is 58 . In degree of significance $5 \%$ from $58\left(\mathrm{t}_{\text {table }}\right)=2,00$, in degree of significance $1 \%$ from 58 $\left(\mathrm{t}_{\text {table }}\right)=2,66$.

After getting the data, the writer compared it with $t_{t}\left(t_{\text {table }}\right)$ both in degree significance $5 \%$ and $1 \%$. Therefore, $t_{0}: t_{t}=3,77>2,00$ in degree of significance $5 \%$ and $t_{0}: t_{t}=3,77>2,66$ in degree of significance $1 \%$.
The statistic hypothesis stated that if $t_{o}$ is higher than $t_{t}$, it showed that $H_{a}$ (alternative hypothesis) of the result is accepted and $\mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{o}}$ (null hypothesis) is rejected. It means that there is effectiveness of teaching reading on narrative text between using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique and without using CIRC technique.

The Effectiveness Of Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) Technique In Teaching Reading On Narrative Text

## DISCUSSION

The Advantages and Disadvantages of CIRC

1. The Advantages of CIRC
a) The student can give their response freely, trained to can work together, and appreciate the opinions of others
b) Improving learning outcomes especially, in complete the task given by the teacher
c) The student can understand the meaning of questions and check each job
d) To help student who weak in understanding the task given by the teacher
e) The dominance of the teacher in learning is reduced
2. The Disadvantages of CIRC
a) Requires substantial time

The technique of CIRC only used to language subject

## CONCLUSION

After the writer conducted this research about "The Effectiveness of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique in Teaching Reading on Narrative Text at the Second Grade of MTs AlKhairiyah Pipitan" the writer describes the conclusion as follow:

1. The students' reading comprehension on narrative text at the second grade of MTs Al-Khairiyah Pipitan before using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique between VIII E as experimental class and VIII F as control class are low. It can be seen from the result of pre-test. In which, the lowest score of the experimental class is 30 and the highest score is 77 with the mean score is 61,8 . While, the lowest score of the control class is 23 and the highest score is 70 with the mean score is 50,9 .
2. The applying of CIRC technique in teaching learning process was given positive benefit for students' reading achievement,
such as: the students more relaxed, entertained, motivated, and active to learn reading. From the research it is concluded that, the students who were taught using CIRC technique have higher score than without using CIRC technique.
There was effective of CIRC technique in teaching reading on narrative text, can be seen from the result of the post-test score is higher than pre-test score. The lowest score of post-test in experimental class is 40 , the highest score is 87 and the mean score is 61,8 . Then, the result of post-test in control class, the lowest score is 37 and the highest score is 77 and the mean score is 50,9 . The result of analysis the data conclusion is shows the value of $t_{\text {observation }}=3,77>t_{\text {table }}=2,66$ in degree of significance $1 \%$. The score of $t_{\text {observation }}=3,77>t_{\text {table }}=2,00$ in degree of significance $5 \%$. $\mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{a}}$ (alternative hypothesis) of the result is accepted and $\mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{o}}$ (null hypothesis) is rejected. It means that significance is the effectiveness of CIRC technique in teaching reading on narrative text at the second grade of MTs Al-Khairiyah Pipitan.

## REFERENCES

Anderson, Mark and Kathy Anderson. Text Type in English 1-2. South Yara: MacMillan Education Australia, 1998.

Andriyani, Rima Priska. "Comparative Study of Reading Comprehension Between Students With Introvert and Students with Extrovert Personality", (A Paper, Lampung University, 2016): 14

Ari, Donal, Lucy Cleser Jacobs, Cris Sorenses and Asghar Razavich. Introduction to Research in Education (8 ${ }^{\text {th }}$ Edition). Canada: Weadworth Cengage Learning, 2010.

Brown, Douglas. Language Assessment Principle and Classroom Practice. New York: San Fransisco State University, 2004.

Chair, Catherine Snow. Reading for Understanding toward and $R \mathcal{E}$ D Program in Reading Comprehension. Arlington: Registered Trademark, 2002.

The Effectiveness Of Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) Technique In Teaching Reading On Narrative Text

Donal, Andry and Batdal Niati. "The Implementation of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition in Reading Interst", Vol. 3, No. 1 (2017): 51.

Durukan, Erhan. "Effect of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique on Reading-Writing Skills", Vol. 6, No. 1 (2011): 103.

Halimah, Andi. "Metode Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) dalam Pembelajaran Membaca dan Menulis di SD/MI", Vol. 1, No. 1 (2014): 34.

Harmer, Jeremy. How to Teach English Language : An Introduction to the Practice of English Language Teaching. England: Longman, 2001.

Hidayanti, Isti Nurani. "The Implementation of CIRC Method in Improving Students' Writing Skill A Study Towards the Tenth Grade Students of SMA Pasundan 2 Bandung", (A Paper, Pasundan University, Bandung, 2017): 2-4.

Kheryadi, K. (2017). IMPROVING STUDENTS' WRITING NARRATIVE THROUGH WRITING GAMES FOR ACCELERATION CLASS. EduLite: Journal of English Education, Literature and Culture, 2(2), 377-388.

Kothari, C R. Research Methodology Methods and Technique. New Delhi: New Age International Publishers, 2004.

Lawin, Larry. Paving the Way in Reading and Writing. San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass, 2003.

Lems, Kristin, Leah D. Miller and Tenena M. Soro. Teaching Reading to English Language Learning. New York: The Guilford Press, 2010.

Mayer, Richard E and Patricia A. Alexander. Handbook of Research on Learning and Instruction. New York: Routledge, 2011.

MacQuillan, Martin, The Narrative Reader. New York : The Taylor and Francis e-Library, 2000.

Moreillon, Judi, Collaborative Strategie: for Teaching Reading Comprehension: Maximizing your Impact. Chicago: American Library Association, 2007.

Mubarok, Husni and Nina Sofiana. "Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) and reading Motivation: Examining the Effect on Student's Reading Ability", Vol. 11, No. 2 (2017): 122.

Nunan, David. Research Methods in Language Learning. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

Praven M. Jain. English Language Teaching: Methods, Tools, and Techniques. Sunrise: Publishers \& Distributors, 2008.

Richards, Jack C and Theodore S. Rodgers. Approaches and Methods in Language Teaching. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.

Sharan, Shlomo. Handbook of Cooperative Learning Methods. London:Praeger Publisher, 1999.

Stephan, Walter G and \& W. Paul Vogt, Education Programs for Improving Intergroup Relations: Theory, Research and Practice. New York: Teachers College, 2004.

Sudijono, Anas. Pengantar Statistik Pendidikan. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada, 2014.

Suprijono, Agus. Cooperative Learning Teori dan Aplikasi PAIKEM . Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2009.

